The Second Anniversary of the Russian Intervention in Syria

5,233 Civilians Killed, Including 1,417 children and 886 women

SYRIAN NETWORK FOR HUMAN RIGHTS
الشبكة السورية لحقوق الإنسان

Sunday, October 1, 2017
The Syrian Network for Human Rights, founded in June 2011, is a non-governmental, non-profit independent organization that is a primary source for the United Nations on all death toll-related statistics in Syria.

I. Introduction

On September 30, 2015, Russia announced the start of its military intervention in Syria. Siding with the Syrian regime, Russia carried out multiple attacks on that day in northern suburbs of Homs, Idlib suburbs, and Latakia suburbs to kill 41 civilians, including nine children and seven women.

Contrary to the Russian command's statements that it is intending on targeting bases for extremist Islamic groups (ISIS, Fateh al Sham Front, and Jund al Aqsa), the reality on the ground, and what we have documented over the course of the past two years, prove that Russian forces have deliberately targeted civilians in a direct and concentrated manner in most cases, killing a large number of civilians. Civilian death toll of the Russian attacks exceeded those who were killed at the hands of the terrorist group ISIS. Additionally, Russian forces were known for adopting the double-strike method\(^1\) to kill as many as possible of the popular base that call for a regime change in Syria. Also, we recorded hundreds of attacks that targeted vital civilian facilities and service infrastructures, as we noticed a precise tracking of medical facilities and water and power stations for the purpose of destroying them.

Since September 2015, Russian forces have carried out hundreds of unjustified attacks that resulted in serious material and human losses that concentrated mostly on areas under the control of armed opposition factions at a percentage of approximately 85% of all attacks, while the remainder of attacks, at 15%, were in ISIS-held areas, and even in these areas, we recorded tens of incidents where civilian sites were bombed that resulted in massacres against the residents of these areas.

\(^1\) A policy adopted by the Syrian and Russian regimes, where the same targeted site is bombed a few minutes after the first strike in order to kills as many victims as possible from civil defense members, medical teams, and doctors.
The era of the Russian intervention saw a number of cessation of hostilities agreements that Russia either sponsored or has been a part of. The first of which was on February 27, 2016, followed by another one on September 12, 2016. However, Russia unequivocally had breached the provisions of these agreements, as we recorded in a number of reports.

On December 30, 2016, Russia sponsored Ankara Ceasefire Agreements that was also signed by the Syrian regime, on one side, and armed opposition factions, on the other side. Nonetheless, it only took Russia one week to breach those agreements, as rates of killing and destruction returned to their former levels with the end of February 2017.

Apparently, following their success in retaking eastern Aleppo, with the on-ground support of Syrian regime forces and Iranian militias, Russia moved to hold negotiations and establish agreements, as Russia was one of the sponsoring parties to Astana Talks in May 2017, which established four de-escalation zones. The agreement was further reinforced in mid-September 2017, as it was agreed that military forces (Russian, Turkish, and Iranian) would be deployed to monitor the agreement, with the passage of humanitarian aids.
On July 9, 2017, Russia was the primary sponsor for the South Syria agreement, as well as other local agreements that were struck in armed opposition factions-held areas, such as the de-escalation agreement in Eastern Ghouta on July 22, 2017, and another de-escalation agreement in northern suburbs of Homs and southern suburbs of Hama in August 2017.

We have noticed a significant drop in rates of bombings, destruction, and violence following the de-escalation agreement’s commencement on May 6, 2017, which reflected on the lives of the residents, as medical and educational facilities have been rebuilt and rehabilitated, and many children reenrolled in schools after their families refrained from letting them go, fearing that they might be killed. Also, markets have gotten more lively and vital. That is, until September 19, 2017, when the Syrian-Russian alliance started an offensive by carrying out heavy airstrikes on Idlib suburbs in retaliation of the factions’ advancement in areas in northern suburbs of Hama. We have monitored the violations by the Syrian-Russian alliance over the course of the first week of that offensive, as we believe these violations threaten Astana path and agreements in light of targeting military bases for opposition factions that were part of Astana Talks.
Fadel Abdul Ghany, chairman of SNHR, says:

“The Russian command’s goal in its excessive, destructive bombardment operations in several Syrian cities and towns and in this Grozny-esque bombardment is to acquire a declaration of submission from the Syrian people to accept that Bashar al Assad regime is to stay in power, after they raise the white flags in the face of the barbarian hordes of Russian forces. We don’t believe that the Russian command is serious in any negotiations, Geneva or Astana, which is only reflected in the size, magnitude, and scale, of the killings and destructions at the hands of its forces.”

Indiscriminate attacks and unlawful weapons

- Since September 30, 2015, we have recorded a significant escalation in terms of cluster munitions use on a larger scale. 99% of those attacks targeted civilian, populated areas. We documented a rise in the rates of the use of specific types of cluster munitions -that haven’t been used this heavily in the past years by the Syrian regime as we documented- where we were able to narrow down some of these munitions: “RBK-500 that carries AO-2.5RTM and AO-2.5RT submunitions, RBK-500 that carries ShOAB-0.5 submunitions, 9M79 Tochka missiles with a cluster head, RBK-500 that carries SPBE submunitions, and RBK-500 that carries PTAB-1M submunitions.” These attacks were carried out using missiles loaded with hundreds of mini-bombs that were dropped from warplanes, or launchers that are believed to be on the Mediterranean Sea or through rocket launchers. We also monitored a considerable growth in the use of 9M79 Tochka missiles, especially in Aleppo and Idlib suburbs, although we can’t verify that they all have cluster heads.

We documented no less than 212 attacks using cluster munitions by forces we believe are Russian from the start of the intervention on September 30, 2015 until September 30, 2017. These attacks are distributed by area as follows:
A. Areas under the control of armed opposition factions: 207 attacks, distributed across governorates as follows:

- Idlib: 97 attacks
- Aleppo: 95 attacks
- Homs: 9 attacks
- Hama: 3 attacks
- Daraa: 3 attacks

B. Areas under the control of ISIS: five attacks, distributed across governorates as follows:
- Deir Ez-Zour: 4
- Raqqa: 1

In mid-2016, Russian forces started using incendiary ammunition more increasingly in residential and agricultural areas, rather than on clash lines with armed opposition factions, but in populated areas. We recorded no less than 105 attacks between September 30, 2015, and September 30, 2017, distributed across governorates as follows:

- Aleppo: 54 attacks
- Idlib: 38 attacks
- Homs: 6 attacks
- Hama: 5 attacks
- Damascus suburbs: 2 attacks
Since the second half of 2016, we have documented that some of the vital civilian facilities that are built inside caves, and buildings built as refuges are being targeted with highly-destructing missiles that pierce and destroy fortified buildings. The Human Rights Council’s Commission of Inquiry noted in its most recent report, February 2017, that concrete-piercing were used multiple times in the east side of Aleppo. We also recorded attacks in Hama suburbs that consists with the use of this type of missiles.

On April 4, 2017, Syrian regime forces carried out a chemical attack in Khan Sheikhoun city, southern suburbs of Idlib governorate, followed by Russian airstrikes that targeted a medical facility and a civil defense center where the wounded were being treated. This doesn’t only imply that Russian forces were aware of the chemical attack the Syrian regime carried out, but also suggest that they were shamefully involved in the incident, as we pointed out in an extensive report.

Russia sponsored agreements that resulted in forced displacement in a number of areas Russian forces’ indiscriminate attacks backed Syrian regime forces and the pro-regime militias in a number of areas such as Aleppo’s eastern neighborhoods and towns in Damascus suburbs, which were in conjunction with Russian-sponsored truces and settlements, in which Russia played the role of a guarantor, such as the evacuation agreement of the neighborhoods of eastern Aleppo on December 13, 2016 that caused the displacement of no less than 45,000 civilians towards the areas of the western suburbs of Aleppo agreement, and al Wa’er neighborhood agreement in Homs city on March 13, 2017, that were under the supervision of Russian authorities. These areas saw a Russian presence on the ground following the residents’ displacement in the form of military police.
Methodology

In the course of the ongoing monitoring for incidents and developments by SNHR team through a wide network that include tens of various sources that have been built over an accumulation of extensive relations since the start of our work. When we receive information, or hear some news about a violation via the internet or media outlets, we work on following-up on this news and try to verify and collect evidences and data. In some cases, the researcher is able to visit the incident location at the soonest. However, this is a rarity in light of the incredibly high security risks, and given the frequency of daily incidents and the human and material resources. Therefore, the possibility to access evidences vary from one case to another, and, hence, the degree of its classification. Usually, what we do, at SNHR, in such cases is relying on accounts from survivors who experience the violation firsthand, where we try to access those directly, and, to a second degree, who saw or filmed the violation, in addition to analyzing available materials from open sources such as the internet and media outlets. Thirdly, we try to speak to medical personnel who treated the wounded, assessed the symptoms, and determined the cause of death.

We encountered extraordinary difficulties in assigning responsibility for specific attacks to Russian forces, considering that the Syrian regime does possess Russian-made weapons and ammunitions. However, we took into consideration the following:
1- cross-examining data and confessions revealed by official Russian media with what we documented on the ground.
2- We heavily relied on accounts obtained from observatories in armed opposition factions-held areas, which consists of observers who work on tracking radar signals between warplanes and picking calls between the pilot and the airbase from which he took off. Usually, these observatories work on tracking the movement of warplanes in order to notify and warn residents in the opposition-held areas that might be targeted by those warplanes, so they can go and hide in shelters. These observatories are capable of distinguishing between the warplanes that take off from Hmeimim Military Airbase, which is a Russian military center, and the ones who take off from airbases in Hama and Homs and suburbs which are used by the Syrian regime warplanes.
3- the difference in destructive power compared with previously-documented government attacks, in addition to ability to fly and bomb at night.
4- Analyzing pictures and videos that showed fixed-wing Russian warplanes (Su-34 and Su-35)
This report contains 14 accounts that were collected through speaking directly with eyewitnesses, and are not cited from any open sources. We have explained the purpose of these interviews to the eyewitnesses who gave us permission to use the information they provided in this report without offering or giving them any incentives. SNHR has tried to spare the eyewitnesses the agony of remembering the violation, and gave guarantees to conceal the identity of any witnesses who preferred to use an alias.

Furthermore, the investigations that are included in this report have proved that the targeted areas were civilian areas where no military centers or weapon warehouses for armed opposition factions or extremist Islamic groups were found before or during the attack. Also, Russian forces didn’t alert the civilians prior to the attack as the international humanitarian law requires.

SNHR has analyzed the videos and pictures that were posted on the internet, and the ones sent to us by local activists via e-mail, Skype, or social media. Some of the videos published by activists show the location of the attacks, the dead bodies, the injured, and the huge destruction in the aftermath of the bombardment, in addition to other pictures that show Russian cluster remnants and shells for incendiary weapons.

We have copies of all the videos and pictures included in this report in a secret online database, and backup copies on hard drives. However, we can’t claim that we have documented all cases, in light of the ban and pursuit by Syrian regime forces and other armed groups.

Unfortunately, Russian authorities deny all of these incidents and crimes, and have never launched even one investigation, following the steps of the Syrian regime who has never held any of their forces accountable since March 2011. However, this doesn’t absolve them of their responsibilities in the slightest.

This report only represents the bare minimum, which we were able to document, of the magnitude and severity of the violation that occurred. It also doesn’t cover the social, economic, and mental ramifications.
II. Executive Summary

This report includes the toll of human rights violations that were perpetrated in the course of two years – between September 30, 2015 and September 30, 2017. We have highlighted the most notable incidents that we were able to document in armed opposition factions-held areas or ISIS-held areas.

**A. Massacres and other acts of unlawful killing:** we have recorded the killing of 5,233 civilians, including 1,417 children and 886 women (adult female). Also, we recorded 251 massacres.

**B. Targeting vital civilian facilities:** we have recorded no less than 707 incidents of attack on vital civilian facilities, including 109 attacks on mosques, 143 on educational facilities, and 119 on medical facilities.

**C. Use of cluster munitions:** we have recorded no less than 212 attacks.

**D. Use of incendiary weapons:** We have recorded no less than 105 attacks.

**E. Targeting medical and civil defense personnel:** we have recorded the killing of 47 medical personnel, including eight women, and the killing of 24 civil defense personnel.

**F. Targeting media activists:** we have recorded the killing of 16 individuals.

**G. Forced displacement:** We have recorded that no less than 2.3 million people have been displaced due to Russian attacks.
Russian forces intervention in Syria from September 30, 2015 to September 30, 2017

Russian forces killed

5233 civilians including 1417 children and 886 women across the Syrian governorates.

44% of victims are women & children
At least 251 massacres
At least 707 attacks on vital civilian facilities including 119 medical facilities, 143 educational facilities, and 109 mosques
At least 212 attacks with cluster munitions
At least 105 attacks with incendiary weapons

According to SNHR documentation
III. Details of New Incidents

This report sheds light on the most notable human rights violations that were committed by forces we believe were Russian between September 30, 2016, and September 30, 2017.

A. Massacres and other acts of unlawful killing

- Damascus suburbs

Hazza town – Thursday, July 13, 2017

Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired one missile in the middle of Hazza town, Eastern Ghouta, Damascus suburbs, which resulted in the killing of four civilians. The town was under the control of armed opposition factions at the time of the incident.

Malek al Hark, member of the media office in Eastern Ghouta area, told SNHR, via Telegram, that he heard a fixed-wing warplane hovering around 10:00. He then got to his house roof to watch it: “The warplane was Russian, as a Syrian regime warplane would have had a picture of the Syrian flag on its tail, and those warplanes fly at a low altitude, unlike this one which was one flying high. I saw the plane as it dropped the missile that targeted the middle of the town, and another area in northeastern Ein Tarma town. All of these areas are civilian areas that far away from the rebels battelfronts.”

While Amer al Ghoutani, a paramedic at a makeshift hospital, said that two victims were transferred to the hospital, as well as three wounded people including a 13-year-old child: “The targeting took place after 09:00, we took in three injuries including one child and two women who only sustained minor bruises. According to the injured, the targeting was in the middle of the town near al Mahmoud Mosque. The missile caused huge destruction. According to them, the missile was directed which is usually used by Russian warplanes.”

Irbeen city – Monday, July 24, 2017

Around 23:30, fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired eight missiles at al Asqalani residential area in the middle of Irbeen city. The bombardment resulted in the killing of nine individuals, including five children and one woman. Additionally, about 50 others were wounded, while houses were heavily destroyed. The town was under the control of armed opposition factions at the time of the incident.
We talked to Alaa Abu Mahmoud\(^2\) who is a volunteer for the civil defense. Alaa’s shift was ongoing on the day of the attack, and he said that he heard eight explosions around 23:00. He then headed for al Asqalani area, where the missiles were dropped: “I got to the second floor inside one of the buildings, and started looking for survivors. I saw a women’s dead body that was completely disfigured in one of the destroyed houses, and next to it there were three children. At another place, I found a guy trapped under rubbles and he was still alive.” “The missiles targeted al Asqalani area, which is a heavily-populated civilian area. The closest military point for the rebels is around three kilometers away.”

Alaa adds: “The missiles fell over an area of more than 100 meters, resulting in huge destruction, as no less than six buildings were affected.”

Anas al Ta’an\(^3\), a civil defense volunteer, visited the attacked site on the next days and told us of what he saw: “The destruction wasn’t only in one or two buildings, but the whole neighborhood was affected. Al Asqalani neighborhood is a heavily populated neighborhood, and it is 100 meters away from where I live. On the day of the attack, I heard the sound of a warplane followed by eight consecutive explosions. The bombing was at night, which made me certain that it was Russian, as Syrian warplanes can’t attack at night.” “There are no rebels or armed men. The battlefronts are on the outskirts of the city, and not in the middle of it. Russian forces are deliberately targeting children and women.”

\(^2\) We contacted Alaa via Telegram on July 26, 2017
\(^3\) We contacted Anas via Telegram on July 26, 2017
Ein Tarma town – Friday, July 14, 2017
Around 09:30, fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian targeted a residential building in the middle of Ein Tarma town, which resulted in the killing of 14 individuals, including four children and six women. Additionally, no less than 12 others were wounded. The town was under the control of armed opposition factions at the time of the incident.

Alaa al Ghoutani ⁴, a local media activist who was in town on the day of the attack and took part in aiding the wounded, told us: “I saw the Russian warplane. I could identify it by its color and sound. The bombing took place around 09:30. I got to the attacked site a few minutes later, and I saw a building that was destroyed and another that was on fire. I heard the victims screaming from under rubbles. 15 Minutes later, we managed to pull a girl from the rubbles, while it took us about an hour to rescue her mother.”
Alaa said that about 10 families live in the targeted building, some of them are residents from Ein Tarma, while others are IDPs from Joubar neighborhood. Alaa confirmed that there are no military bases for armed opposition factions in the neighborhood.

- Raqqa governorate
Raqqa city – Monday, December 12, 2016
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired a number of missiles that targeted a residential neighborhood in Raqqa city. The bombing resulted in the killing of 22 civilians, including five children, while about 30 others were wounded. The neighborhood was under the control of ISIS at the time of the incident.

Al Badou neighborhood – Friday, March 24, 2017
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired a number of missiles that targeted al Ma’ari Street in al Badou neighborhood, Raqqa city, which resulted in the killing of five civilians, including two female children and two women. The neighborhood was under the control of ISIS at the time of the incident.

- Deir Ez-Zour governorate
Dablan village – Wednesday, June 28, 2017
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired a number of missiles at Dablan village, eastern suburbs of Deir Ez-Zour, which resulted in the killing of nine civilians, including five children. The village was under the control of ISIS at the time of the incident.

⁴We contacted Alaa via Facebook on July 15, 2017
Al Salhiya village – Tuesday, January 24, 2017
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired a number of missiles at al Salhiya village, southeastern suburbs of Deir Ez-Zour governorate, which resulted in the killing of 14 civilians, while about 22 others were wounded. The village was under the control of ISIS at the time of the incident.

Al Tebni town – Wednesday, August 2, 2017
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired a number of missiles at a residential house in al Tebni town, western suburbs of Deir Ez-Zour, which resulted in the killing of 15 civilians, mostly from the same family, including seven children and four women. Additionally, about 19 others were wounded. The town was under the control of ISIS at the time of the incident.

- Hama governorate
Al Latamena city – Friday, April 7, 2017
Around 01:00, fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired one missile in the north-western parts of al Latamena city, northern suburbs of Hama. The missile landed near a shelter that was built inside a cave where a family was hiding, which resulted in the killing of four individuals who were mostly from one family (a father, a mother, and a female child). In addition, the shelter, where they were hiding, was heavily destroyed. The area was under the control of armed opposition factions at the time of the incident.

Manaf al Saleh, director of the civil defense in al Latamena city, told us that he heard the armed opposition’s observatory announcing that Russian warplanes are flying in the sky before the attack, then he headed for the site: “The bombardment involved a bunker-buster, as the huge size of the destruction suggests that a missile of this kind was used. These missiles go through the ground and then explode inside, and has the ability to destroy fortified buildings. I saw the hole that was created by the missile, and it had a depth of nearly six meters and a diameter of 15 meters. A whole family was killed in the bombing inside the cave. We pulled out the dead bodies of the mother, father, and their daughter. It was horrifying.”

- Idlib governorate
Kafr Jales village – Tuesday, November 15, 2016
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired a number of missiles, targeting a number of residential buildings in the middle of Kafr Jales village, western suburbs of Idlib governorate, which resulted in the killing of six civilians, including one child and one woman.

5 We contacted Manaf via WhatsApp on April 28, 2017
Additionally, about seven others were wounded. The village was under the joint control of armed opposition factions and Fateh al Sham Front at the time of the incident.

Idlib city – Monday, December 5, 2016
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian targeted Mansour area, north of Idlib city with a number of missiles, which resulted in the killing of 11 civilians, including seven children and three women. Additionally, about 15 others were wounded. The city is under the control of Hay’at Tahrir al Sham, whereas it was under the joint control of armed opposition factions and Fateh al Sham Front on the day of the attack.

Idlib city – Wednesday, March 15, 2017
Around 03:25, fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired two missiles in within no more than five minutes that targeted two locations of close proximity. The first missile targeted a multi-floor residential building in al Qosour neighborhood in the southern parts of Idlib governorate, which resulted in the killing of 24 civilians, including 15 children, one female infant, and four women (adult female), who were mostly IDPs from Aleppo suburbs. The missile also caused great destruction in the building. The second missile landed about 100 meters from the same building. We released an extensive report documenting al Qosour neighborhood massacre in April 2017.

Idlib city is currently under the control of Hay’at Tahrir al Sham, while it was under the joint control of armed opposition factions and Fateh al Sham Front on the day of the attack.

Mahmoud al Sayeh, a doctor from Aleppo suburbs who lost all of his family -seven children and their mother- in the massacre. Mahmoud, whom we contacted via WhatsApp, told us that he woke up to the sound of a warplane soaring. A few minutes later, he heard the warplane hovering and his children’s screams for help: “The missile was directed, and it wasn’t a free-fall missile. The rubbles piled up on me, but I hardly managed to dig a small crack in the rock rubbles to breath. A few minutes later, I heard the sound of civil defense vehicles and ambulances, which was followed by a second missile.” Mahmoud added that he remained under the rubbles for nearly two and half hours until the civil defense pulled him out and took him to the medical center: “I sustained fractures in my rips and my right leg. I was the only one to survive from my family. Russia has killed them all.”
Heish town – Friday, April 7, 2017
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired one missile in al Shamali neighborhood, Heish town, southern suburbs of Idlib governorate, which resulted in the killing of nine civilians, including three children and three women, while no less than seven others were wounded. The area was under the joint control of armed opposition factions and Fateh al Sham Front at the time of the incident.

- Aleppo governorate
Al Sukkari neighborhood – Wednesday, November 16, 2016
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired a number of missiles that targeted residential houses in al Sukkari neighborhood near Moufaq Circle, which resulted in the killing of 10 civilians, including three children and one woman. Al Sukkari neighborhood is currently under the control of Syrian regime forces, whereas it was under the control of armed opposition factions on the day of the attack.

Ibrahim Jabali, a resident from al Sukkari neighborhood, told us that he saw a parachute missile falling from a Russian warplane approximately at 10:30. The missile landed on a residential building where three families live: “The building is a five-floor building. It was completely leveled to the ground, and everyone was buried in the rubbles. Among the victims was Bare’ Hejazi and his five-year-old son Moatesm. There were no rebels or armed men. They were killed in their houses.”
Jub al Qubba neighborhood – Tuesday, November 29, 2016

Around 08:00, fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired one missile that targeted an IDPs gathering from Eastern Aleppo’s neighborhood who were heading for al Sakhour neighborhood. The missile fell in a sub-street between Bab al Nayrab neighborhood and Jub al Qubba neighborhood near Hjeij Grocery Store in eastern Aleppo city. The bombing resulted in the killing of 17 civilians, including children and women, and heavily destroyed residential buildings, while the nearby Barsin Mosque was also damaged. Jub al Qubba neighborhood is currently under the control of Syrian regime forces, whereas it was under the control of armed opposition factions on the day of the attack.

Abu al Izz, a media activist who was present when the bombing took place, told us, via WhatsApp, that he was in Jub al Qubba neighborhood to film some of the displacement waves in the neighborhood, when the missile landed near him after it was dropped from a fixed-wing warplane: “I couldn’t see a thing, as smoke was everywhere. I fell on the ground from the pressure that was generated by the explosion. I got up and saw tens of dead civilians who were trying to flee Aleppo neighborhood to Syrian regime-held areas.”

“The bombing sounds before the airstrike were heard before the airstrike and lasted afterwards. But the sound of the missile that targeted the area was very loud.”
Abu al Izz told us that he couldn’t identify the type of warplanes that targeted the area due to the heaviness of the bombardment.

We released an extensive report on September 18, 2017 that documents three massacre against IDPs from Eastern Aleppo’s neighborhoods

**Babka village – Thursday, January 12, 2017**
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired a number of missiles that targeted a residential house east of Babka village, western suburbs of Aleppo, which resulted in the killing of six civilians (three children and three women). The village was under the control of armed opposition factions at the time of the incident.

**Darat Ezza city – Thursday, March 9, 2017**
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired a number of missiles that targeted Darat Ezza al Sharqiya School in Darat Ezza city, western suburbs of Aleppo, which resulted in the killing of seven civilians, including two children. The city is under the control of armed opposition factions.
B. Targeting vital civilian facilities

Places of worships
- Mosques

Sabhan Mosque, Aleppo governorate – Wednesday, December 7, 2016
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired a number of missiles that targeted the vicinity of Sabhan Mosque in al Kallasa neighborhood, east of Aleppo city. The mosque building was heavily damaged. Al Kallasa neighborhood is under the control of Syrian regime forces, whereas it was under the control of armed opposition factions on the day of the attack.

Al Rahman Mosque, Raqqa governorate – Monday, July 31, 2017
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired a number of missiles at al Rahman Mosque in al Khamisiya Fouqani village, which administratively follows Ma’adan city, eastern suburbs of Raqqa governorate. The mosque building was heavily destroyed, as the mosque was rendered out of commission. The village was under the control of ISIS at the time of the incident.

Vital educational facilities
- Schools

Nour al Din Zinki School, Aleppo governorate – Sunday, October 16, 2016
Sunday noon, fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired a number of missiles at Nour al Din Zinki School in al Sukkari neighborhood, Aleppo city. Some of the class rooms were heavily destroyed and the school furniture was heavily damaged, as the school was rendered out of commission.

Al Sukkari neighborhood is under the control of Syrian regime forces, whereas it was under the control of armed opposition factions on the day of the attack.
Hitteen School, Idlib governorate – Thursday, November 17, 2016
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired a number of missiles at Hitteen School for Elementary Education in al Sharqi neighborhood in Saraqeb city, suburbs of Idlib governorate. The bathroom building and the school fence were partially destroyed. In addition, the main building was moderately damaged. The city was under the joint control of armed opposition factions and Fateh al Sham Front at the time of the incident.

Vital educational facilities
- Medical facilities
Al Jami’a al Surriya Hospital, Idlib governorate – Monday, February 27, 2017
Around 14:30, fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired four missiles at al Jami’a al Surriya Hospital on the western outskirts of Der al Sharqi village, eastern suburbs of Idlib governorate. The hospital roof and walls were partially destroyed, and its cladding materials and equipment were moderately damaged, as the hospital was rendered out of commission. The hospital was targeted before by the same forces the day before. The village was under the joint control of armed opposition factions and Fateh al Sham Front at the time of the incident.
Al Latamena Surgical Hospital, Hama governorate – Wednesday, April 26, 2017

Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired one missile that targeted al Latamena Surgical Hospital on the western outskirts of al Latamena city, northern suburbs of Hama governorate. A number of sections were damaged, as the hospital was rendered out of commission. The area is under the control of Jaish al Ezza – an armed opposition faction.

Free Hama Health Administration had issued a statement on April 27, 2017, that says that highly-explosive missiles destroyed the fortified hospital building, injuring a number of the medical staff members and destroying medical equipment.

Ibrahim al Shamali, the spokesperson for Free Hama Health Administration told us, via WhatsApp, that the bombing took place at approximately 05:15, and it was two missiles that destroyed the hospital building that was inside the cave: “The missile type and accuracy suggest that the warplanes that targeted the hospital was Russian. In addition, the rebels’ observatory announced that Russian warplanes soaring the sky before the attack. The hospital sections were damaged, and three medical staffers were injured – one of them stayed four hours under rubbles. The hospital was rendered completely out of commission.”

Irbeen Surgical Hospital, Damascus suburbs governorate – Monday, May 1, 2017

Around 12:15, fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired two missiles that targeted a dispensary point that is affiliated to Irbeen Surgical Hospital. The point is located inside a residential building in Hamouriya town, Eastern Ghouta. The bombing resulted in the killing of three individuals, one woman and two children, and the surgery room was heavily damaged as well as the point’s medical equipment. The town is under the control of armed opposition factions.
Abdul Mu’in, the documentation officer at one of the medical points in Hamouriya town told us, via Facebook, that he didn’t hear the sound of the warplane that carried out the attack, but he heard the sound of the missiles exploding: “I was 200 meters away from the attacked site. I immediately headed there, and saw the victims and the wounded, there were children and infants.”

Abdul Mu’in added that the medical point is not near any military bases for armed opposition factions, confirming that all the victims were civilians: “They are children, women, and sick people. Why are they targeting them? We recorded that a 14-year-old child, a woman in her fifties, and a female infant that is no older than four months have all been killed. Are those the terrorists?”

Al Mahdoum village health center, Aleppo governorate – Wednesday, March 29, 2017
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired a number of missiles at the health center in al Mahdoum village, eastern suburbs of Aleppo governorate. The center building was heavily destroyed, as it was rendered out of commission. The village was under the control of ISIS at the time of the incident.
Communal facilities
- Markets

Al Hal market, Idlib governorate – Saturday, January 14, 2017
Around 03:45, fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired two missiles at al Hal market in the northern parts of Ma’aret Misreen citym northern suburbs of Idlib governo- rate, which resulted in a massacre. Additionally, a number of shops were heavily destroyed, while the market facilities were heavily damaged.
The city was under the joint control of armed opposition factions and Fateh al Sham Front at the time of the incident.

Sarin city market, Idlib governorate – Thursday, April 27, 2017
Around 09:00, fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired two missiles at the main market in the middle of Sarmin city, northern suburbs of Idlib governorate. A number of shops were destroyed, while the market facilities were moderately damaged. The city was under the joint control of armed opposition factions and Fateh al Sham Front at the time of the incident.
Communal facilities
- Civil defense centers

The civil defense center in al Aatareb city, Aleppo governorate – Sunday, November 13, 2016

Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired a number of missiles the preparation and training center which is affiliated to the civil defense in al Atareb city, western suburbs of Aleppo governorate. The center building was heavily destroyed as well as its furniture and fence. The city is under the control of armed opposition factions at the time of the incident.
Bakeries

The automatic bakery, Idlib governorate – Saturday, January 14, 2017

Around 03:45, fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired one missile at al Awwal automatic bakery in the northern parts of Ma’aret Misreen city, northern suburbs of Idlib governorate, which resulted in casualties. Additionally, the bakery building and its equipment were moderately damaged.

The city was under the joint control of armed opposition factions and Fateh al Sham Front at the time of the incident.

Al Hayat Bakery, Damascus governorate – Thursday, February 2, 2017

Around 10:00, fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired a number of missiles that targeted a number of projects for Hayat Institution for Development. As a result, Al Hayat Bakery building was heavily damaged, as the bakery was rendered out of commission. The neighborhood was under the control of armed opposition factions at the time of the incident.

SNHR contacted Mr. Abu Walid, who works at al Hayat Group’s documentation and media office via Facebook. Mrs. Abu Walid was near the attacked site: “Dust was everywhere and it was impossible to see anything. I had to wait five minutes before I was able to barely see. I was able to get close to the targeted place and aid some people. It was painful to see, and I can’t describe it. When you see the martyrs and the injured in front of you and can’t help them all.”
Abu Walid said that the bombardment was accurate and precise, and added that approximately three missile landed on projects for al Hayat Group – a shoe factory, the bakery, and the animal project: “The Syrian regime can’t hit targets with such accuracy. It had to be a Russian warplane. The destruction was huge, and the building collapsed completely.”

The automatic bakery, Raqqa governorate – Monday, July 24, 2017
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired a number of missiles at the automatic bakery in al Jayer village, eastern suburbs of Raqqa governorate. The bakery building was heavily destroyed, and was rendered out of commission. The village was under the control of ISIS at the time of the incident.

Refugee camps
Al Farja Camp, Idlib governorate – Saturday, October 1, 2016
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian (Su-24) fired a number of missiles at al Farja camp that is located near Tal al Sheih in eastern Khan Sheikhoun city, southern suburbs of Idlib governorate, which resulted in a massacre. Additionally, a number of tents were moderately damaged. The area was under the joint control of armed opposition factions and Fateh al Sham Front at the time of the incident.

C. Use of cluster munitions
- Idlib governorate
Jisr al Shoghour city – Tuesday, March 14, 2017
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired two RBK500 missiles – one carrying AO-2.5RTM or AO-2.5RT submunitions, while the other was carrying PTAB-1M submunitions. The two missiles targeted al Masihiya area in al Gharbi neighborhood, Jisr al Shoghour city, western suburbs of Idlib governorate, which caused a fire in one of the houses. The city was under the joint control of armed opposition factions and Fateh al Sham Front at the time of the incident.

The road between Ma’er Shourin village and Babila village – Tuesday, March 21, 2017
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired a RBK500 missile carrying AO-2.5RTM / AO-2.5RT that targeted the agricultural lands near the road between Ma’er Shourin village and Babila village in the eastern suburbs of Ma’aret al Nu’man city, eastern suburbs of Idlib governorate. The city is under the joint control of armed opposition factions and Hay’at Tahrir al Sham.
Bsamis village, Sunday, April 9, 2017
Around 08:32, fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired a RBK500 missile carrying ShOAB-0.5 submunitions that targeted the agricultural lands in Bsamis village southern suburbs of Idlib governorate. The village was under the joint control of armed opposition factions and Fateh al Sham Front at the time of the incident.

Ma’aret Harma village – Monday, September 25, 2017
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe were Russian fired a RBK500 missile carrying ShOAB-0.5 submunitions on the west side of Ma’aret Harma village, southern suburbs Idlib governorate, which injured two civilians. The village is under the control of armed opposition factions.

The international highway Aleppo – Damascus – Wednesday, September 27, 2017
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired two RBK500 missile carrying PTAB-1M submunitions that targeted the highway near al Sharqi neighborhood in Khan Sheikhoun city, southern suburbs of Idlib governorate, which injured two civilians – one of whom was a woman. The area under the joint control of armed opposition factions and Fateh al Sham Front.
- Aleppo governorate

**Al Sahhara town – Sunday, November 13, 2016**

Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired a RBK-500 missile **carrying** PTAB-1M submunitions that targeted the west side of **Al Sahhara town**, western suburbs of Aleppo governorate, which injured three civilians, including one child and one woman. The town was under the control of armed opposition factions at the time of the incident.

**Hayyan town – Sunday, March 4, 2017**

Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired a RBK-500 missile carrying ShOAB-0.5 submunitions that targeted the **east side** of **Hayyan town**, northern suburbs of **Idlib** governorate. The town is under the control of armed opposition factions.

**Al Tawwama village – Thursday, March 23, 2017**

Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian fired two RBK-500 missiles carrying ShO-AB-0.5 submunitions in **al Tawwama village**, western suburbs of Aleppo governorate. The village was under the control of armed opposition factions at the time of the incident.
- **Deir Ez-Zour governorate**  
  **Marat village – Friday, April 14, 2017**  
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe were Russian fired a RBK-500 missile carrying AO-0.5RTM / AO-2.5RT submunitions that targeted Marat village, eastern suburbs of Deir Ez-Zour governorate. The attack injured five individuals and destroyed a residential house. The village is under the control of ISIS.

D. **Use of incendiary weapons**

- **Idlib governorate**  
  **Ariha city, Wednesday, March 22, 2017**  
Around 19:50, fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian used incendiary weapon to target al Gharbi neighborhood and al Majmah al Hokoumi neighborhood in the middle of Ariha city, southern suburbs of Idlib governorate. Fire broke out in the area, and three civilians were injured. The city was under the joint control of armed opposition factions and Fateh al Sham Front at the time of the incident.
Incendiary weapons remnants in the aftermath of an attack by fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian in Ariha city, Idlib – March 22, 2017
- Hama governorate
Al Latamena town- Saturday, April 8, 2017
Around 18:15, fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian used incendiary weapon to target the agricultural lands that are located about 2-3 kilometers to the northwest of al Latamena town towards al Zaka village. Fires broke out in the targeted area. The town is under the control of armed opposition factions.

Mohammad Qasem, who was present at the time of the attack, told us, via WhatsApp, that he heard a small explosion followed by consecutive explosions, then he saw flames in the agricultural lands that surround his house: “These bombs had a sound similar to that of fireworks. They caused the fires around us. We live in an agricultural land, and fires spread quickly there.” Mohammad told us that he saw the container and its tail and estimated the area over which the remnants spread to be 220 square meters: “A Russian warplane was the one who carried out this phosphoric attack. It also carried out other airstrikes in eastern al Latamena city and in the middle of the city as well. The rebels’ observatory was able to confirm that the warplane took off from Hmeimim Airbase.” Mohammad added that the targeted area is an agricultural land where IDPs from al Latame- na town live, and that there is no military presence for any armed opposition factions.

Al Latamena town – Saturday, April 8, 2017
Around 02:20, fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian used incendiary weapons in a residential neighborhood in northern al Latamena town. The town is under the control of armed opposition factions.
Kafr Zita city – Saturday, April 8, 2017
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian used incendiary weapons in northeastern Kafr Zita city on the road leading to al Sayyad village. The area was under the joint control of armed opposition factions and Hay’at Tahrir al Sham at the time of the incident.

Al Latamena town – Monday, April 17, 2017
Fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian carried out no less than 12 airstrikes between 02:00-04:00 in which incendiary weapons were used to target al Shamali neighborhood in al Latamena town, northern suburbs of Hama, as fires broke out in the neighborhood. Fayad al Stouf, a local media activist based in al Latamena town, told us, via Facebook, that he heard the armed opposition’s observatory announcing that two Russian warplanes are flying in the sky of northern suburbs of Hama, and then, a series of airstrikes started: “The two warplanes used bunker-blaster missiles against us, followed by phosphoric missiles. I was able to distinguish them by their less-severe sound and then by the flames they unleash. It was like a meteor flying in the air. I counted about 45 airstrikes on Souran, Lahya, Taybat al Imam, al Azwar, and Helfaya areas, including 14 airstrikes on al Latamena town alone. They have burned our town, as fires broke out in our agricultural lands.” Fayyad said that the area targeted by the Russian airstrikes is a civilian area with no military presence for armed opposition factions.

E. Targeting medical personnel and civil defense personnel
Emad Mohammad Zaitoun, an ambulance driver for Baghdad Makeshift Hospital, from Anadan city, northern suburbs of Aleppo governorate, born in 1973, has an intermediate education certificate, married and a father of four. He was killed on Monday, November 14, 2016, in a bombing by fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian that targeted Baghdad Makeshift Hospital in Iwyjel village, western suburbs of Aleppo governorate with missiles. The village is under the control of armed opposition factions.

Majed Mohammad al Omar, nurse, from Qamhana town, northern suburbs of Aleppo governorate, 30-year-old, works for Shamuna Aiding Network. He was killed on Thursday, April 27, 2017, as he was at the medical point in northwestern Ma’er Zita village, southern suburbs of Idlib governorate, in a bombing by fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian that targeted the medical point with missiles.
F. Targeting media activists
Mousab Abdul Rahim Ahmad Urabi, on Wednesday, April 26, 2017, died of a fatal injury in his abdomen that he sustained in a bombing by fixed-wing warplanes we believe are Russian that fired a missile near him, as he was covering a vaccine campaign in al Janoudiya town, western suburbs of Idlib governorate. The town was under the joint control of armed opposition factions and Fateh al Sham Front at the time of the incident. Mousab, head of the Qatari Red Crescent’s media office in Syria, and director of the office of Tube Rasd Network in Syria, from al Atareb city, western suburbs of Aleppo governorate, born in 1983, has an intermediate education certificate, married and a father of one son and one daughter.

G. Forced displacement
The Russian airstrikes and offensives forced approximately 2.3 million people out of their homes in the governorates of Aleppo, Homs, Idlib, Latakia, Raqqa, Deir Ez-Zour, and Damascus suburbs.

Since Mid-July 2017, Syrian-Russian forces have alarmingly escalated their offensive in eastern suburbs of Raqqa - located on the east bank of Euphrates River (Shamiya villages) - and western suburbs of Deir Ez-Zour - located on the east bank of Euphrates River (also Shamiya villages). These offensives involved serious violations of the customary humanitarian law, causing the displacement of no less than 135,000 ooeioko from the cities of Ma’adan and al Sabkha in eastern suburbs of Raqqa and the towns of al Tebni, Ayyash al Kharita, and al Shmitiya in the western suburbs of Deir Ez-Zour. Most of those people found themselves forced to live in unequipped desert areas that lack the most basic necessities of life.

IV. Attachments
Russian Forces are Worse than the Syrian Regime in Terms of Cluster Munitions Use

Russian Forces Have Used Incendiary Weapons 78 Times at least since They Intervened in Syria

Detailed Account of Most Notable Violations of Human Rights by Russian Forces in One Year

The periodic and special reports released by SNHR that document the violations by Russian forces in Syria
V. Conclusions and Recommendations

Legal conclusions
1- The Russian regime has, beyond any doubt, violated Security Council Resolutions 2139 and 2254 which both state that indiscriminate attacks must be halted. Also, The Syrian regime has violated Article 8 of Rome Statute through the act of willful killing which constitutes war crimes.
2- We can confirm that the bombardment mentioned in this report has targeted armless civilians. Therefore, Russian forces have violated the rules of the international human rights law which guarantee the right to life. Additionally, these violations were perpetrated in a non-international armed conflict which amount to a war crime where all elements were fulfilled.
3- The attacks mentioned in this report, which were carried out by Russian forces, are considered a violation of the customary international law as the shells were fired at a populated area rather than a specific military object.
4- Aerial bombardment has caused collateral damages that involved loss of lives, injuries, and significant damages to civil facilities. There are strong indicators suggesting that the damage was too excessive compared to the anticipated military benefit.

Recommendations

The Russian regime
- Launch investigations regarding the incidents included in this report, make the findings of these investigations public for the Syrian people, and hold the people involved accountable.
- Compensate all the damaged centers and facilities, rebuild and rehabilitate them, and compensate all the victims’ families and the wounded who were killed by the current Russian regime.
- Completely cease the bombing of hospitals, protected objects, and civilian areas, and respect the customary international law.

The Security Council
- The Security Council has to take additional steps after Resolution 2254 was adopted, which states: “Demands that all parties immediately cease any attacks against civilians and civilian objects as such, including attacks against medical facilities and personnel, and any indiscriminate use of weapons, including through shelling and aerial bombardment.”
- The Syrian case must be referred to the International Criminal Court and all those who are responsible must be held accountable including the Russian regime whose involvement in war crimes has been proven.
- Instill security and peace in Syria and implement the norm of the Responsibility to Protect in order to protect the lives, culture, and history of the Syrian people from being destroyed, looted, and ruined.
• Expand the sanctions to include the Syrian, Russian, and Iranian regimes who are directly involved in committing crimes against humanity and war crimes against the Syrian people.

The Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights
The Office should submit a report to the Human Rights Council and other organs of the United Nations on the incidents mentioned in this report, and the massacres that preceded them, as they are a glaring point in a string of daily, sporadic and less significant massacres. The OHCHR also should work on implementing the recommendations included in this report.

The United Nations special envoy to Syria
• Expand Security Council briefings rather than only limiting them to the violations of al Nussra Front and ISIS
• Condemn the perpetrators of the crimes, the massacres, and those who were primarily responsible for shattering the de-escalation agreements.

The International Community
• In light of the split of the Security Council and its utter inability, Steps must be taken on the national and regional levels to form alliances to support the Syrian people that would protect them from the daily killing and siege and enhance the support for the relief efforts. Additionally, the principle of universal jurisdiction must be activated in local courts regarding these crimes in order to conduct fair trials for all those who were involved.
• SNHR has repeatedly called for the implementation of the Responsibility to Protect in tens of studies and reports and as a member of the International Coalition for the Responsibility to Protect (ICRtoP) after all political channels through the Arab League’s plan and then Mr. Kofi Annan’s plan have been drought out. Therefore, steps under Article 7 of the Rome Statute must be taken and the norm of the Responsibility to Protect, which was established by the United Nations General Assembly, must be implemented. The Security Council is still hindering the protection of civilians in Syria.
• Renew the pressure on the Security Council to refer the case in Syria to the International Criminal Court
• Work on fulfilling justice and achieving accountability in Syria through the United Nations General Assembly and the Human Rights Council and work on activating the principle of the universal jurisdiction.

Acknowledgment and Condolences
Our most heartfelt gratitude and condolences to all the residents and local activists who contributed effectively to this report.