Reframing Education in COVID19 era
Why education shapes societies’ economic, social and cultural restoration and recovery

May 2020
Reframing Education in COVID19 era

1. A DIRE EDUCATIONAL CRISIS

“Education is a fundamental human right for all children and youth. It creates the voice through which other rights can be claimed and protected.”

Of the many inequalities that this emergency has highlighted, access to education is one of the most obvious ones, and it affects not only students, teachers and schools, but also families and communities. By early April, most countries had introduced nation-wide early childhood care, school and university closures, affecting over 91% of the world’s student population – more than 1.5 billion learners. As of the first week of May, the number of students affected by these closures still stands at 72.4% of total enrolled learners.

In order to mitigate the impact of school closures, governments all around the world have implemented programs of distance learning through radio, television and online classes. Virtual classes represent the best alternative to in-person learning, as they provide the possibility of interaction between teachers and students.

However, relying only on this medium can exacerbate inequalities as access to the internet is not equally available among different social classes and geographic areas. Globally, only 55% of households have an internet connection: in the developed world 87% are connected, compared with 47% in developing nations, and just 19% in the least developed countries. In total, 3.7 billion people have no internet access.

COVID19 does not discriminate, but its impact does:

On FAMILIES:

- More than 364 million schoolchildren currently do not have access to the meals normally provided by schools;
- Children, especially boys, currently face an increased risk of disengagement from education, as they turn to income-generating activities to cope with increased economic hardships.

On WOMEN:

- Several studies highlight that in times of crisis, women and girls are overburdened by unpaid work (including domestic tasks and childcare) and less able to continue with educational or professional activities.
- Moreover, adolescent girls face increased risk of early and forced marriages, and early pregnancy, jeopardizing their return to school.
- All around the world, reports of domestic violence towards women and girls have increased.
The closure of schools and the shift to distance learning has also had a strong impact on teachers: in a short span of time, they have had to adapt the diverse curricula they teach to radio, television and online channels, in order to be able to reach their students and continue their lessons.11

According to UNESCO’s monitoring, 71 countries have already announced when schools will reopen. From this total number, 12 have reopened schools, 52 have set the date for reopening during this academic year and seven plan on reopening during the next year. The majority of countries – 128 – have not announced any dates yet.

In this framework, UNESCO, UNICEF, WFP and World Bank have issued new guidelines for governments and partners to facilitate the reopening of schools for students, teachers and families. Such guidelines focus on: policy reform, financing requirements, safe operations, compensating learning, wellness and protection, and reaching the most marginalized.12

Due to the Covid19 pandemic and the subsequent lockdown, all schools and centres have been closed, leaving about 9,040,000 boys and girls and more than 1 million babies at home.13 Schools and universities have had to resort to distance education, but this has been exacerbated by the digital divide inside the country.

The Digital Economy and Society Index rates Italy 24 out of 28 European countries in its “digitalisation index”. Last year, Istat14 reported that 23.9% of Italian families have no access to the internet.15 Moreover, 12.3% of children between 6 and 17 years of age – 850 thousand in absolute terms – do not have a computer or tablet at home; the percentage rises to 20% when considering only the Southern part of Italy.16

Access to internet and to devices are not the only elements required to guarantee the proper continuation of the educational path of a child, given the current circumstances. The learning environment is essential: 42% of the minors in Italy live in overcrowded houses, where the conditions for distance learning are not adequate (small, shared spaces, noises...).

In response to the closures, the government has devolved the following resources:

- 8.2 million euros to strengthen distance learning, through the figure of “digital animators”17
- 165 million euros to strengthen distance learning; of those, 10 million for schools, 150 million for disadvantaged students and 5 million to train school personnel.

During the elaboration of this position paper, the government announced that they have started working on plans for the schools’ re-opening in September18, but it is not clear yet whether the measures will be enough to address the current educational deficit. It is necessary to develop solutions to assist kids and youth now and during the summer period (recreational, sport and socialisation activities) and to re-think how to organise classes, spaces and activities once schools re-open.

2. **HOW IS WEWORLD−GVC RESPONDING?**

WeWorld−GVC has developed a distinctive approach to education, operationalized both through quality Education in Emergencies (EiE) programs in complex crisis and emergencies (i.e. Syria), and policy and programmatic actions with national institutions and actors active in marginalized and excluded areas (i.e. Italy and Europe).

Since the start of the COVID19 pandemic, WeWorld−GVC programmatic approach has focused on preparing, coordinating and recovering education systems so that they can integrally embed the
capacities to properly respond to and recover from the COVID-19 pandemic impacts\textsuperscript{9}, abiding with the UNESCO Education 2030 Framework for Action for Implementation of SDG 4.\textsuperscript{20}

WeWorld-GVC understands education as an integral component to the safety and dignity of societies, not only the intellectual, social and physical development it fosters for children, but also the safety net schools can provide for those vulnerable to domestic abuse, sexual violence, forced labour and other threats, as well as arrange daily meals in certain instances, or extra-curricular activities. Providing education thus satisfies a range of different needs in regard to the protection of communities, as it is inherently linked to the social, cultural, economic and political dynamics that weld the community together.\textsuperscript{21}

The central objective of the organization is to guarantee that children and youth continue to learn during and after the crisis, while receiving lifesaving information and psychosocial support.\textsuperscript{22}

The efforts made in this direction have brought together the experts and experiences in delivering EiE, and the acquired knowledge and positioning in system wide interventions at a national level in Italy. The resulting approach focuses the 5 pillars illustrated in Figure 1.

The COVID-19 pandemic has intensified the challenge posed by the necessity to adapt to each countries’ (and each region within the country) particular situation to ensure the continuation of education. Plans and activities driven by contextualized approaches are now, more than ever, a necessity.

One method might not necessarily work in another environment, and thus WeWorld-GVC programmatic approach focuses on guidance and protocol to roll out systematically the pillars by combing actions of preparedness, response and recovery.

Figure 1: WW-GVC Education Approach Pillars

Figure 2: WW-GVC Integrated Operations
WeWorld-GVC is giving priority to those groups already affected by social exclusion, marginalization, natural disasters, protracted crisis, armed conflicts and forced displacement. In Lebanon, together with partners, we are providing recreational activities and COVID-19 information to Lebanese and Syrian students and their families, and surveying their socio-economic needs impacts and analysing their effect on education. In Syria we are providing EiE in the areas of Deir-Ez-Zor and Rural Aleppo. In the Occupied Palestinian Territory, together with partners, we are co-leading strategies with the Education Clusters and the MoE to ensure education in Area C of the West Bank, and currently surveying socio-economic effects of COVID19 on education. In Tanzania and Kenya we are currently developing a system-wide surveying in schools to assess knowledge and actions on COVID19 pandemic.

In Italy, through R.E.A.C.T., we systematically work to identify challenges adolescents are facing with home education and, together with local active actors, educators, counsellors and parents ensure quality remote learning is provided.

### 3. THE EDUCATIONAL CRISIS MULTI-DIMENSIONAL IMPACT ON FAMILIES, COMMUNITIES AND SOCIETIES

“Extended school closures may cause not only loss of learning in the short term, but also further loss in human capital and diminished economic opportunities over the long term.”

The halt on education, including school closures or activities disruption, has had a devastating domino effect with far-reaching social and economic impacts to families, communities and the whole of society. The toll is far higher for the most vulnerable and marginalized areas and groups. The scope of it – nearly 1.5 billion students – amplifies exponentially the loss of education and schools’ support to life-saving and life-sustaining needs (food, psycho-social), economic capacities, families and communities’ daily life, and the growth and prosperity of states. No societal, or “just” economic recovery plan during and post-COVID19 pandemic is possible without addressing the impacts of the educational crisis first.

WeWorld – GVC is conducting a continuous analysis on the system-wide impacts both of the COVID19 pandemic to education, and the impact of the educational crisis to any foreseen recovery plan post-pandemic. The preliminary analysis shows that, notwithstanding the worldwide calls and activation of support to ensure education, the initial phase of response has already highlighted unsurmountable challenges and shortcomings, thoroughly assessed by leading actors and initiatives, such as by UNICEF; the World Bank, UNESCO, INEE and others. WeWorld-GVC has identified several core challenges that, if not addressed, will overwhelm the society as a whole, with unresolvable negative effects on children, families and communities.

1. **Shortage of necessary funding for the appropriate educational approach to the situation.**

   System-wide funding is not enough. Flexible funding is not yet developed enough to ensure that educational approaches are tailored to each situation, jointly sustaining family, community and educational systems.

2. **Drop-out and/or difficulty to return to school.**

   Especially for the most vulnerable and marginalized families, there is no assurance that children can, or are capable of returning to school. Distance solutions, even if sustainable, are not accessible to most.
3. Family losses and/or distress (economic, social, etc.).

The COVID19 pandemic is causing family losses, disruption of livelihoods, economic shortfalls and the loss of social networks, among other dire impacts, which affects the families' ability to ensure education for their children.

4. Not enough teachers and/or teachers not sufficiently trained with the right skill sets.

A teachers’ deficit was a reality before the COVID19 pandemic. In addition, the necessity of studying new modalities and distance learning solutions demonstrates the general lack of necessary skills worldwide.

5. No equal access, capacity, resources and/or knowledge to distance learning opportunities.

Innovative and effective instruments exist and are available to ensure that distance learning can become a reality for pupils. Nonetheless, the world digital divide is a dreadful barrier, adding to the general inability of families to ensure quality access for distance learning.

6. Increased pressure on household and families (economic, relational, etc.)

The burden of parenting is not relieved with the child's absence from school, nor reinforced by the additional support schooling provides to the family, adding further to the constraints that the COVID19 pandemic has placed on the family.

7. Loss of a school's enabling and protective environment (social interaction, connectivity).

Children are losing the essential skills for their personal growth in society provided by the school's environment, the exchanges and interactions, and the alternative models it can provide to children. This increases protection risks and exacerbates the negative impact on the children's well-being caused by the pandemic.

These challenges are intertwined factors slowly eroding the status of individuals, families, communities and societies to cope with and react to the COVID19 pandemic consequences, beyond educational considerations. The impact that these intertwined challenges are currently having on the educational crisis will have long-term consequences, which will need to be studied.

Yet, these impacts are already patent and cannot be ignored in the current worldwide recovery and restoration plan post COVID19. With the WeWorld-GVC analysis, they can be summarized (not exhaustively) in four system-wide consequences of the current educational crisis, challenges and shortcomings:

1. Loss and/or worsening of the children and youth wellbeing.
2. Increased economic pressure on the family due to additional costs to cover educational needs and/or limited productivity of parents as a result of school closures.
3. Increased social exclusion and inequalities.
4. Interrupted learning and deprived opportunities for development and growth.
For a child, the stagnation or halt in educational development, the erosion of his/her mental wellbeing and increased vulnerability to various forms of violence and abuse are the immediate effects of the pandemic. The resulting pressure overburdens the household; parenting is not relieved with the child’s absence from school, adding further to the constraints that the COVID19 pandemic has placed on the family.

Parents with jobs find it difficult to balance their commitments to work and those left unemployed face serious economic shortcomings. Children are at risk of child labour whether out of financial desperation or exploitation, drawing them further away from education.

The pressures on the household can lead to intra-familial conflict and Gender Based Violence (GBV), which has unfortunately become more frequent since the global outbreak began. Children and youth belonging to vulnerable groups face the risk not having access to the resources or social protections to cope with these effects, with dire impacts on pre-existing social exclusion and inequality. The loss of education has then devastating long-term effects on the social, economic and cultural achievements of families, communities and societies.
4. FAMILIES, COMMUNITIES AND SCHOOLS MUST WORK TOGETHER

“We must work together to make our education systems more resilient and better prepared for the current paradigm shift as well as to face possible crisis in the future.”

The COVID-19 Pandemic is showing globally that there is not a unique solution to the challenges previously described, as well as that traditional systems are not fully equipped to respond effectively.

Educational systems can be more resilient and better prepared for future crises only if the solutions rely on innovative ways to move from a schooling system (rooted in physical access to schools) to an Educational Community approach (the combination of the efforts of families and community actors alongside schools to ensure education for children).

Good practices and lessons learned from Education in Emergency assistance have been showing that effective education in complex situations does not rely solely on schooling. Different educational spaces, constructive and tight dialogue, multi-sector support to families, a combination of presence and distance learning (radio, digital, outreach, etc.) supported by locally active actors and civil society organizations, are just some of the essential pillars ensuring quality education where traditional education remains inaccessible.

The COMMUNITY becomes the essential space where families (specifically the most marginalized and excluded) are supported. The school system can find local resources and capacities within to offset pedagogical approaches and delivery mechanisms overcoming access to school barriers. Within the community, rapid mechanisms can be put in place leveraging on the coordinated efforts of different educational actors within the community itself (civil society, individuals, sport centres, community services and others).

Within an Educational Community:

- The FAMILY, becomes the centre-piece of solutions and support towards the education of children, to address the barriers caused by school closing, ensure the quality of distance learning and address the limitations in educational access to any other educational support mechanism or instrument. In traditional systems, family has not usually had an active role, properly embedded in the service delivery options. To play this active role, families need to be economically supported through multi-sector actions and services.
- The SCHOOL, does not rely only on delivery mechanisms based on its physical access. It is rather conceived as an apparatus of solutions fully interacting with families and communities. The school in itself cannot be replaced, but its role is redefined to include outreach actions and resources to offset families and communities’ solutions. Schools should become more inclusive, reducing access and retention barriers.
5. WEWORLD-GVC DEMANDS TO DONORS, GOVERNMENT and THE INTERNATIONAL COMMUNITY

WeWorld-GVC considers that there is irrefutable evidence on how the impact of the educational crisis induced by the COVID19 pandemic determines the effectiveness of any societies’ economic, social and cultural restoration and recovery.

For this reason, WeWorld-GVC welcomes the The Global Partnership for Education (GPE) commitment to fund US$250 million for developing countries battling COVID-19 and UNESCO's Global Education Coalition for COVID19 response, but considers that the donors, the aid community and governments should ensure relentless efforts to:

1. Prioritize education in any COVID19 recovery plan, recognizing that without the normalization of educational processes, societies will have medium and long-term shortfalls, requiring additional global efforts.
2. Maintain and support the global commitment on Education in Emergencies (EiE) as a programmatic priority sustained by DG ECHO, to learn and expand EiE good practices and lessons learned to all areas affected by the COVID19 pandemic.
3. Operationalize the policy recommendations set out by the SDG-Education 2030 Steering Committee for COVID-19 Education Response
4. Develop structured monitoring mechanisms to monitor home-learning environments, considering for instance the recommendation by UNICEF and the UNESCO Institute for Statistics to use SDG Indicator 4.2.3, which reflects “the percentage of children under the age of five who experience positive and stimulating home-learning environments”.
5. Ensure that inclusion and equity guiding principles are reflected in operational mechanisms
   a. by prioritizing those areas and families already left the most vulnerable and marginalized before the COVID19 pandemic.
   b. by thoroughly applying mechanisms of analysis to understand local educational, socio-economic and digital inequalities, and apply locally-driven mechanisms preventing them from widening, ensuring equal opportunities for all.
   c. by including outreach programs to marginalized areas in the design of educational systems and programs.
   d. by including specific gender and age safety nets, social protection or institutional support packages to families with children of appropriate age.
   e. by involving women and girls in the assessment and design of innovative and appropriate measures to ensure that girls remain educated, protected, and safe during and after the pandemic, and mitigate the additional burden usually falling onto women as main children care takers.
6. Apply adaptive learning approaches, where proper investment is made in understanding local contexts, systematically learning along the way and adjusting rapidly when plans change, always ensuring the quality of education and the protection of children.
7. Support the educational services for children aged 0 to 6 years old, to create the conditions for household care-takers (in the majority of cases women) to pursue job opportunities and have dignified life conditions. Moreover, depriving pre-school children of important intellectual, motorial and social development during their formative years will have lifelong negative impacts on their development and growth.
8. **Build on the changes and invest in new and tech-led modalities applied during the crisis, to improve and innovate educational systems in reaching and supporting marginalized children in the future.** The investment in distance learning must be capitalized to overcome the shortcomings shown in more industrialized countries (i.e. Italy)\(^2\) and to ensure proper responses for hard to reach areas during future humanitarian crises.

9. **Invest in research and learning on how to combine solutions** applied in "less conventional contexts", affected by marginalization, conflicts, difficulty of access, fragility and extensive social exclusion, in combination with innovative instruments and resources that more stable and well-funded educational systems have or can develop.

10. **Invest in the capacity of Teachers and Families,** to develop the necessary skills and instruments to ensure quality education through distance and other alternative modalities, to reinforce expert, remote support to outreach educators and increase the engagement of students in finding innovative solutions.
Endnotes

1 WeWorld-GVC, Activity Report 2014–2019 Education (Africa), October 2019
2 UNESCO Global Monitoring of school closure. Data update at 04.05.2020
4 WFP, New digital map shows terrible impact of COVID-19 on school meals around the world, 20 March 2020
5 HRW, COVID-19’s Devastating Impact on Children, 9 April 2020
6 Unicef, Caring in the time of COVID-19: Gender, unpaid care work and social protection, 23 April 2020
7 World Economic Forum, The coronavirus fallout may be worse for women than men. Here's why, 12 March 2020
9 UNESCO, COVID-19 school closures: Why girls are more at risk, 29 April 2020
10 UN Women, COVID-19 and Ending Violence Against Women and Girls, 6 April 2020
11 The Local, How teachers in Italy have adapted to working remotely under quarantine, 31 March 2020
12 UNESCO, New guidelines provide roadmap for safe reopening of schools, 30 April 2020
13 Forum Disuguaglianze Diversità, L’impegno per contrastare le disuguaglianze in educazione nel tempo del Covid-19
14 The Italian National Institute of Statistics.
15 Jones T., Italian lessons: what we’ve learned from two months of home schooling, The Guardian, 24 April 2020
16 More information: according to Istat, 57% of students has to share the device with other family members. Only 6,1% of boys and girls between 6 and 17 lives in a family where each member has access to at least one computer.
17 MIUR, Coronavirus, 8,2 milioni per potenziare la didattica a distanza attraverso gli animatori digitali, 20 March 2020
18 MIUR, Coronavirus, Azzolina e Ascani riuniscono tavolo con Regioni ed Enti Locali. Al centro dell’incontro, la ripresa di settembre, 5 Maggio 2020
19 WeWorld-GVC, Guidance Note on WeWorld-GVC EiE Response to Covid-19, 2020, p. 3.
21 WeWorld-GVC, Activity Report 2014–2019 Education (Africa), October 2019
22 WeWorld-GVC, Guidance Note on WeWorld-GVC EiE Response to Covid-19, 2020, p. 3.
23 WeWorld-GVC, Coping with Multiple Crises – Impact of the COVID-19 and Financial Hardships on Education in Akkar and Bekaa, April 2020.
24 WeWorld-GVC, R.E.A.C.T. – Reti per Educare gli Adolescenti attraverso la Comunità e il Territorio Programmazione, April 2020.
26 https://en.unesco.org/covid19/educationresponse/consequences
27 Lempel, Hammond and Epstein, 2009
28 Save the Children, Covid-19: most marginalised children will bear the brunt of unprecedented school closures around the world, 24 March 2020
30 https://inee.org/blog/emergency-our-doorstep-expanding-reach-education-emergencies
31 ILO, ILO Monitor: COVID-19 and the world of work. Third edition Updated estimates and analysis, 29 April 2020
32 OECD, COVID-19: Protecting people and societies, 2020
33 UNIDO, Coronavirus: the economic impact, 28 March 2020
34 OECD, Evaluating the initial impact of COVID-19 containment measures on economic activity, 14 April 2020
35 WeWorld-GVC, La Ripartenza deve avere la scuola come priorità, EdScuola, Vita, 22 April 2020

GPE, Global Partnership for Education announces US$250 million for developing countries battling COVID-19 (Coronavirus), 1 April 2020

Plan, Covid-19 pandemic appeal

UNESCO, Teacher Task Force calls to support 63 million teachers touched by the COVID-19 crisis, 27 March 2020

UNESCO, Anticipated impact of COVID-19 on public expenditures on education and Implication for UNESCO work, Issue note n°7.2 – April 2020


UNESCO, Startling digital divides in distance learning emerge, 21 April 2020

Bruno E., Scuole italiane nel caos: cattedre senza docenti, a vuoto una nomina su due, Il sole 24 ore, 5 October 2020

Orizzontescuola, Italia tra paesi UE con maggiore carenza docenti. Vediamo dove: i dati UE, EDScuola, 18 October 2019

Vegas E., School closures, government responses, and learning inequality around the world during COVID-19, Brookings, 14 April 2020

Mantellini M., Il divario digitale è una zavorra per l’Italia, Internazionale, 23 March 2020


https://www.internazionale.it/notizie/2020/05/03/chiusura-scuole-disuguaglianze

Lee J., Mental health effects of school closures during COVID-19, 14 April 2020

UN Women, COVID-19 and Ending Violence Against Women and Girls, 6 April 2020


Human Rights Watch, COVID-19 and Children’s Rights, 9 April 2020

World Bank Blogs, Why education matters for economic development, 17 May 2016

Stefania Giannini, UNESCO Assistant Director-General for Education, bit.ly/35ywNDH

https://inee.org/blog/emergency-our-doorstep-expanding-reach-education-emergencies


https://en.unesco.org/covid19/educationresponse/globalcoalition

Torrisi C. Zitelli A., La scuola italiana alle prese col digitale fra disuguaglianze, ritardi e senza una vera visione, Valigia Blu, 23 December 2019