UNICEF

Child Friendly Spaces/Environments (CFS/E):
An Integrated Services Response
For Emergencies and Their Aftermath

© UNICEF/HQ99-0440/Radhika Chalasani

University of Pittsburgh

December 2004
Table of Contents

Acronyms ...................................................................................................................... iv
Acknowledgments ......................................................................................................... v
Introduction ................................................................................................................... 1
Chapter 1. Policies and Strategies for Child Friendly Spaces/Environments ............. 2
  1.1. Background ........................................................................................................ 2
  1.2. Shifting strategy to a rights-based approach .................................................... 2
  1.3. Child Friendly Spaces/Environments (CFS/E) ................................................. 2
Chapter 2. Albania Case Study ..................................................................................... 8
  2.1. Descriptive Account/Background .................................................................. 8
  2.2. Key Contextual Considerations ....................................................................... 9
  2.3. Stakeholders Involved, Roles and Interests ................................................... 10
  2.4. Results ............................................................................................................. 11
  2.5. Analysis of Lessons Learned .......................................................................... 12
Chapter 3. Turkey Case Study .................................................................................... 15
  3.1. Descriptive Account/Background .................................................................. 15
  3.2. Key Contextual Considerations ....................................................................... 16
  3.3. Stakeholders Involved, Roles and Interests ................................................... 18
  3.4. Results ............................................................................................................. 19
  3.5. Analysis of Lessons Learned .......................................................................... 20
Chapter 4. Northern Caucasus Case Study ................................................................ 23
  4.1. Descriptive Account/Background .................................................................. 23
  4.2. Key Contextual Considerations ....................................................................... 24
  4.3. Stakeholders Involved, Roles and Interests ................................................... 25
  4.4. Results ............................................................................................................. 25
  4.5. Analysis of Lessons Learned .......................................................................... 28
Chapter 5. Colombia Case Study ................................................................................ 31
  5.1. Background ...................................................................................................... 32
  5.2. Key Contextual Considerations ....................................................................... 33
  5.3. Results ............................................................................................................. 33
  5.4. Analysis of Lessons Learned .......................................................................... 37
Chapter 6. Liberia Case Study ................................................................................... 39
  6.1. Background ...................................................................................................... 39
  6.2. Key Contextual Considerations ....................................................................... 40
  6.3. Stakeholders Involved, Roles and Interests ................................................... 41
  6.4. Results ............................................................................................................. 41
  6.5. Analysis of Lessons Learned .......................................................................... 44
Chapter 7. Gujarat Case Study .................................................................................... 46
  7.1. Background ...................................................................................................... 46
  7.2. Key Contextual Considerations ....................................................................... 46
  7.3. Stakeholders Involved, Roles and Interests ................................................... 47
  7.4. Results ............................................................................................................. 47
  7.5. Analysis of Lessons Learned .......................................................................... 51
Conclusions.................................................................................................................. 53
## Acronyms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACF</td>
<td>Action Contre la Faim</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADRA</td>
<td>Adventist and Development Relief Agency International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALP</td>
<td>Accelerated Learning Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARD</td>
<td>Action for Relief and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BTS</td>
<td>Back to School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBI</td>
<td>Classroom-Based Interventions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCs</td>
<td>Core Commitments to Children in Emergencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEE/CIS</td>
<td>Central and Eastern Europe/Commonwealth of Independent States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFS/E</td>
<td>Child Friendly Spaces/ Environments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPCD</td>
<td>Centre for Peacemaking and Community Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRC</td>
<td>Convention on the Rights of the Child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRC</td>
<td>Cluster Resource Centres</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFID</td>
<td>Department For International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECCD</td>
<td>Early Childhood Care, Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECHO</td>
<td>European Union’s Humanitarian Aid Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELN</td>
<td>Ejército de Liberación Nacional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAVE</td>
<td>Federation of African Women Educators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FARC</td>
<td>Fuerzas Armadas Revolucionarias de Colombia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GINIE</td>
<td>Global Information Networks in Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HWA</td>
<td>Hilswerk Austria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDP</td>
<td>Internally Displaced People</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMSMA</td>
<td>Information Management System for Mine Action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IOM</td>
<td>International Organization for Migration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IRC</td>
<td>International Rescue Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDGs</td>
<td>Millennium Development Goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOE</td>
<td>Ministry of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOH</td>
<td>Ministry of Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoNE</td>
<td>Ministry of National Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MRE</td>
<td>Mine Risk Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTSP</td>
<td>Medium Term Strategic Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NATO</td>
<td>North Atlantic Treaty Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCCF</td>
<td>National Children’s Consultative Forum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCHA</td>
<td>UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OSCE</td>
<td>Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PHCC</td>
<td>Pre-Existing Primary Health Care Centres</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PHO</td>
<td>Pan-American Health Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PINF</td>
<td>People in Need Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RALS</td>
<td>Rapid Assessment of Learning Spaces</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RPTC</td>
<td>Recovery Plan for Turkish Children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCF</td>
<td>Save the Children Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SHCEK</td>
<td>Department of Social Services and Child Protection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TACRO</td>
<td>The Americas and the Caribbean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNHCHR</td>
<td>Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>United Nations Children’s Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VECs</td>
<td>Village Education Committees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VoM</td>
<td>Voice of the Mountains</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WFP</td>
<td>World Food Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WV</td>
<td>World Vision</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Acknowledgments

We are spinning our own fates, good or evil,
and never to be undone.
Every smallest stroke of virtue or of vice
leaves its never-so-little scar.
~ William James, *Talks to Teachers*

This is the first product of a new partnership spun between UNICEF and the University of Pittsburgh. The purpose of this partnership is to share strengths in designing the emerging global strategic framework of child-friendly systems. UNICEF, as the lead international agency for a human rights based approach to child survival and development began creating child-friendly schools and environments as a humanitarian response to the growing demands of conflict and natural disasters. The University of Pittsburgh’s School of Education houses one of the oldest and most respected international centres for the study of education. Over the last decade, the centre has developed a special expertise in education in nations in crisis. It has worked with UNICEF staff in many crisis countries, providing both technical expertise and student creativity.

The University of Pittsburgh would like to thank the many contributors to these case studies. The University of Pittsburgh team was directed by Maureen W. McClure, Director, Global Information Networks in Education (GINIE) project and Chair, Department of Administrative and Policy Studies, School of Education. GINIE team members included Mary Jane Alm, Alvaro Higueras, Mary Margaret Kerr, Bruce Perrone and Birgitta Ryberg. The team is grateful for the generosity and patience of the UNICEF staff in New York, especially in education, child protection, and early childhood. Thanks to Pilar Aguilar, Education in Emergencies, Education Section, Cream Wright, Head of the Education Section, and the Education team at UNICEF-New York, the Regional Education Advisors and Country Offices, and a special thanks to Nydia Quiroz and Saudamini Siegrist. Many thanks also to the careful and thoughtful comments of UNICEF reviewers.
Introduction

Since it was launched in April 1999, UNICEF's "Child Friendly Spaces Initiative" proved to be an effective means of providing large numbers of Kosovar refugee children and women with basic social services. Preventive maternal-child health and psycho-social services, pre-and primary school education and recreation were provided within one identifiable site which also served as a space for protection of children and their caregivers.

The initiative, grounded in a holistic rights-based approach, constituted an integrated program that could guarantee minimum standards with regard to essential protection and services in the Albanian refugee camps. The concept as such, along with many of its elements, could prove to be useful and appropriate in other humanitarian crisis situations or within programs addressing the rights and needs of children at risk or children in need of special protection measures.

After the Kosovar crisis the Child Friendly Spaces/Environments (hereafter referred to as CFS/E) Initiative continued to develop in successive emergencies, i.e. Turkey, East Timor, North Caucasus, Angola, Liberia, Colombia and El Salvador, among others. In each situation the concept has been adapted to respond to the specific needs of a particular context.

Although CFS/E has been implemented in several countries affected by armed conflict or natural disasters, there is no documentation available illustrating a systematic critical analysis, a thick, rich description of each experience including lessons learned, what has worked, constraints, opportunities, operational issues, the whole question of governance, development of local capacity, the issue of spaces vs. environments, joint planning, implications for the UNICEF project and program officers, inter-sectoral co-ordination, and partnerships. This compilation of field experiences in the form of case-study analysis is a fundamental initial step.

UNICEF requested that the University of Pittsburgh conduct a review of its Child Friendly Spaces experiences in CEE/CIS (Central and Eastern Europe/ Commonwealth of Independent States), TACRO (The Americas and the Caribbean Regional Office) and selected countries of other regions The CEE/CIS countries/regions were Albania, Turkey and North Caucasus). The TACRO countries were El Salvador and Colombia. Other countries considered were: East Timor, Angola, India (Gujarat) and Liberia) through structured and rigorous cases studies. The original Terms of Reference (TOR) called for a desk review of 8 countries. The lack of accessible documentation made it impossible to review East Timor and El Salvador at this time. The review envisaged establishing a framework of issues that should be taken into consideration of the CFS/E with special emphasis in the two regions: CEE/CIS and TACRO. Due to insufficient documentation, it was not possible to carry out case studies for Angola, El Salvador or East Timor. See Annex 2 for the TOR.

It is hoped that this study will provide a solid basis for guidance for CFS/E strategy in future contexts. Until now the CFS/E has been reinvented in successive emergencies without the benefit of previous experience. These case studies can help others draw on both UNICEF’s technical expertise, cultural diplomacy and its historical memory.
Chapter 1. Policies and Strategies for Child Friendly Spaces/Environments

1.1. Background

The nature of armed conflict has changed significantly in the post-cold war era. Previously, wars were enacted between sovereign nations, and although civilian casualties were inevitable, civilians were not targeted outright. Contemporary conflicts, however, tend to be intra-national rather than international and are increasingly characterized by local struggles. Between 1990 and 2003, there were 59 armed conflicts in 48 locations, and only four were between states. In many countries, already existing internal tensions, combined with restrictive structural adjustment policies, have further weakened nations and led to the collapse of governments and to conflicts between the state and rebel groups. Sixteen of the twenty poorest countries have suffered from a major civil war in the last fifteen years. One of the main impacts of such wars is that innocent civilian populations have been increasingly a target of armed forces, and approximately 90% of conflict-related deaths are civilians. Of those affected by armed conflict, 80% have been women and children. Children are particular targets of violence, and are at increasing risk of being recruited into armed forces. The unstable political and economic situation often destroys children’s protective environments and networks of support and leaves them in a particularly vulnerable position.

1.2. Shifting strategy to a rights-based approach

The occurrence of violence has a pervasive psychosocial impact on children and families. The social, psychological, moral and emotional deprivations they suffer, uprooting, the persistent fear of losing, as well as the actual loss of parents and carers, are as damaging as being deprived of food, water and health care. One of the most urgent tasks when conflicts threaten is to find ways to protect children. Protection in this sense means not only defending them against physical aggression but also ensuring that their full range of rights and needs are respected and fulfilled. Children’s rights have been encompassed in a number of international declarations and conventions, which recognize children as individuals with specific rights that must be respected and protected. In particular, the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) in 1989 marked a definitive change in children’s rights and adult responsibilities in contemporary society.

These crucial concerns for children’s well-being have been translated by UNICEF into an increasingly coherent strategy that focuses on the protection of children’s development and learning through the construction of safe environments for development and learning. The framework of the CRC is articulated through UNICEF’s current medium-term strategic plan (MTSP), which describes UNICEF’s vision and framework for action for 2002-2005. This rights and results-based approach to programming has five main priorities: girls’ education, integrated early childhood development, immunization ‘plus’, fighting HIV/AIDS, and improved protection of children from violence, abuse, exploitation and discrimination. All these priorities must be implemented during a complex emergency, and adapted to meet the challenges of the crisis.

1.3. Child Friendly Spaces/Environments (CFS/E)

One of the main strategies adopted by UNICEF to ensure the protection and assistance of children in armed conflict situations and natural disasters is the concept of Child Friendly Spaces/Environments (CFS/E). Child Friendly Spaces/Environments (CFS/E) is rights-based approach developed by UNICEF to guarantee children’s rights to survival, development, participation and protection, particularly in a situation of crisis or instability. Since the initiative was launched for the first time in Albania in April 1999 during the Kosovo Crisis, CFS/E has gained recognition as a successful model for promoting the rights of refugee and internally displaced
children. Child Friendly Spaces have since been adapted to serve the needs of children affected by armed conflict or natural disasters in the UNICEF field of operations with a mixed variety of outcomes. The CFS/E has been the only endeavour to develop a concrete model for better sectoral integration in line with the MTSP and the Core Commitments for Children in Emergencies (CCCs). CFS/E has translated these into operational guidelines which have been easily adaptable to various settings where they have been implemented.

The CFS/E concept balances the complex range of relationships across physical and emotional security, social and cognitive development, health and nutritional status. This integrated approach provides a wide perspective for assessment and operational planning.

The diagram below captures the key points of the basic conceptual approach:

---

**All-inclusive Integrated Basic Services**

- Education
- Recreation
- Child Well Being
- Health & Hygiene
- Psychological Support

*Interdependent circle to ensure children's rights to Survival, Development, Participation and Protection.*

---

At the operational level, Child Friendly Spaces attempts to integrate primary and fundamental services in health, primary education, child care and psychosocial development into a protective environment that is both family-focussed and community-based. Centres set up as part of the CFS/E approach provide a safe, caring space where children can engage in structured recreational and educational activities, and also have access to basic primary health and nutrition services. The centres have targeted programmes for pre-school children, primary school-aged children, youth and parents.

The package intends to be mutually-reinforcing. Ideally, but not necessarily, every service (education, recreation, preventive mother/child health care, psychosocial support and youth activities) can be made available and tailored to the needs of the affected population. The package also includes clearly identified but flexible spaces, supplies and training activities. Minimum standards have to be established to ensure that sufficient space and equipment is provided for each service. Non-discriminatory protection and access for all to the “space” and its services must be
guaranteed.

This approach also focuses on empowering families and communities in the healing process. Families are worn down by conflicts, both physically and emotionally, and face increased impoverishment. The most effective and sustainable approach to recovery is to mobilize the existing social care system. This involves motivating refugee and displaced communities to commit themselves to the protection of children, especially those without family support. For example, peer-group living arrangements can be strongly integrated into communities. Institutional approaches can contribute to isolation and stigmatization.

One key to the success of the Child-Friendly Spaces approach is building participation of children, their families and communities into the planning of the activities. Planning itself becomes a healing activity. With CFS/E, UNICEF provides a common strategic framework to guide the various actors responding to the emergency needs of children. All stakeholders need to be visibly committed to the protection of children. The Child Friendly Spaces concept provides a clear opportunity for partnerships. CFS/E operationalises its Core Commitments for Children in Emergencies by “positioning UNICEF in sector coordinating roles whenever appropriate.” It has proved to be an important tool to deepen existing and building partnerships. For example, it has strengthened Governments’ capacities by training teachers, health and social workers.

Creating protective environments through Child Friendly Spaces

One of the main objectives of Child Friendly Spaces is to provide child protection and access to basic services. The protective qualities of CFS/E derive mainly from their components. Based on the whole child approach of the CRC, CFS/E integrates all the sectoral components that contribute to the protection and fulfilment of a child’s rights.

The holistic approach of the Convention emphasises the importance of promoting a multi-disciplinary and cross-sectoral perspective when consideration is given to policies, programs or actions in favour of children. The aim is to focus on the whole child and to promote the effective realization of all his or her rights. It is essential, therefore, to foster an increasing synergy amongst the various sectors which are relevant to the child’s life, and prevent fragmented interventions. With a cross-sectoral and inclusive perspective, the value of each specialized sectoral component will be taken into consideration, but a common context will be promoted where complementarity and interrelationship will prevail.

The child protection elements of CFS/E also stem partially from the “Protective Environment Framework” developed by UNICEF’s Child Protection Sector, which illustrates the many and interactive factors which play a role in protecting children. This Framework identifies systems and areas of activities at all levels – national, societal, and familial – most relevant to securing child protection. It identifies eight major and interconnected variables as having the greatest impact on child protection against all protection abuses:

1. Government commitment to and capacity for fulfilling protection rights
2. Legislation and enforcement
3. Culture and Custom
4. Open discussion (including civil society and media)
5. Children’s life skills, knowledge and participation
6. Capacity of Families and Communities
7. Essential Services (basic and targeted)
8. Monitoring and reporting

This set of interrelated elements is common to all protection problems and underscores the
need for multifaceted and integrated approaches. The Framework also serves as a tool for analysis of child protection strategies and actions. Although the Framework’s main concern is protection from abuse, violence and exploitation, rather than the protection of children’s rights, it explores broader protection strategies including preventive actions. The Framework rethinks existing strategies and instruments for child protection, as they mainly consist of responding to specific incidences of abuse. Typically abuse is assumed to be an event that needs to be contained and controlled. The Framework instead builds protective environments for children. The Framework makes more effective use of traditional development activities and approaches such as strengthening basic services, monitoring results, and recognizing individuals as actors for their own development and protection. The Framework stresses that even in near-complete systems breakdown in emergencies, a protective environment approach can be established locally, mitigating loss and trauma.

In the current Medium Term Strategic Plan (2002-2005 MTSP), the prevention of violence, abuse and neglect, exploitation and discrimination of children is one of the five organizational priorities. The protective environment framework provided a common platform for UNICEF’s work on child protection. As a result, there are now fewer small-scale projects with limited impact and a greater emphasis on systemic changes, addressing factors such as legislation, attitudes, the capacity of those working with children, monitoring and reporting systems and children's own knowledge and skills.

So far, Child Friendly Spaces has been the only endeavour to develop a concrete model for better sectorial integration in line with the MTSP and the revised 2003 CCCs. It has been translated into operational guidelines which were easily adaptable to the different settings wherever they have been implemented. The package of integrated mutually reinforcing services provided through CFS/E contributes to the creation of a protective environment, mainly in three of the eight key areas identified in the Protective Environment Framework: Children’s life skills, knowledge and participation; capacity of family and communities; and essential services (basic and targeted).

**Education in Child Friendly Spaces**

Education is another important element of CFS/E. UNICEF recognizes the crucial role of education in emergencies, not only as a fundamental right, but also critical for the protection and the normal development and learning of children. Education has a crucial preventive and rehabilitative part to play in fulfilling the needs and rights of children in conflict and post-conflict situations. It also gives shape and structure to children's lives and can instil community values, promote justice and respect for human rights and enhance peace, stability and interdependence.

During the last decade educationists have developed educational strategies and curricula that respond to children exposed to pervasive levels of violence. These strategies have integrated education with protection and psychosocial support. Humanitarian education required more than cognitive outputs because education is also an instrument for rehabilitation. It is the foundation needed to build sanity and recover from the horror of genocide and natural disasters.

Research on the quality of education in "normal" classrooms depended most on the "classroom climate". This indicator measures the impacts of violent or positive peer support and the quality of teacher-student relationships on the processes of teaching and learning. These variables were far more relevant than other aspects such as physical conditions of the school, systematic use of evaluation, or distribution of children by ability. Thus the quality of education in complex emergencies should integrate a ‘healing climate’ into teaching and learning in the classroom. Educational interventions aim at establishing “safe environments for children for learning, recreation and psychosocial support.” The integration of both dimensions the cognitive (which provides recreation of habits and normalized relational behaviours) should be matched with the access to creative
expression, play and humour.

Back-to-School Campaigns and other rapid educational responses need to avoid low quality education that does not confront the "multigenerational transmission of traumatic re-enactment". In other words, breaking the cycle of abuse of children that have been victims of war and trauma constitutes quality education, able to improve not only cognitive skills, but also prevent recycling anger and human destructiveness within and across generations.

It may take the children who were victims of armed conflict or natural disasters some time to readapt to the standard school curriculum. This process may take a few months, even years. More systematic assessment tools for the evaluation of the condition of children victims of violence are needed to insure the appropriate provision of integrated services. UNICEF's emerging strategic framework of Child Friendly Spaces/Environments integrates education services into community-based protective environments.

School is also a place of convergence of children and their families. It offers a physical "safe space" where other forms of programmatic services to children can also converge offering adequate care in terms of not only psychosocial support but also health, nutrition, sanitation and in general creating a "protective environment". Consequently, UNICEF commits itself to provide educational services from the outset of an emergency.

But, in the aftermath of armed conflict, children cannot resume educational activities without having the chance to heal their wounds. The learning space needs to become a protected healing environment where pupils and teachers are given the opportunity for building resilience, reflection, healing and self-expression. Reconciling with their own environment/community is an essential process in which developing resilience through self-expression, play, sports, story telling, dance and other socio-cultural recreational activities are critical elements. Empowering families and communities was also recognized as essential for children's care and protection.

The case studies that follow describe in detail the Child Friendly Spaces that were developed in selected countries. Each case study offers a background of the emergency, the key contextual considerations and stakeholders involved, as well as the main outcomes of the CFS/E, lessons learned, challenges, opportunities and constraints of the experiences.

The final conclusions then compare the various case studies and provide a critical analysis of the main strengths and weaknesses, opportunities and constraints of Child Friendly Spaces and offer suggestions for improvements going forward.

4 K. Landgren. Protective Environments. Child Protection Sector, UNICEF. New York n/d
5 Ibid.
7 LLECE, First International Comparative Study (Language Mathematics and Associated Factors) UNESCO/OREFALC, Santiago de Chile, 2002.
8 Ibid.
9 Ibid pp. 57-59.
10 "The child is usually defeated by the superior strength of the adult, but the defeat does not remain without consequences; it would seem to activate a tendency to overcome defeat by doing actively what one was forced to endure passively: to rule when one had to obey; to beat when one was beaten; in short, to do what one was
forced to suffer, or to do what one was forbidden to do." Erich Fromm, The Anatomy of Human Destructiveness. Pimlico, 1997, p.317.


12 “Set up temporary learning spaces with minimum infrastructure; resume schooling by re-opening schools and starting the reintegration of teachers and children by providing teaching materials and ongoing semi-structured recreational activities. Re-establish primary education, provide education and recreation kits and basic learning materials and teacher training.” (UNICEF Core Corporate Commitments).
Chapter 2. Albania Case Study

2.1. Descriptive Account/Background

The 1999 Kosovo Crisis

In February 1999, negotiations between Yugoslav and Kosovar Albanian representatives in Rambouillet broke down. OSCE withdrew its mission. On March 24, NATO launched air strikes. Within 72 hours, thousands of Kosovar Albanians, many expelled from their homes, were forced to flee. Between April and May, one million people – about half of the population - took refuge in countries close to Kosovo. Albania alone received approximately 450,000 escaping Kosovo refugees. Anticipating that the refugees would spend many months in exile, international agencies, governments and AFOR began to construct dozens of camps.

Albania, already one of the poorest regions in Europe, found itself especially challenged: as many as two thirds of the refugees in Albania were hosted not in camps, but within the local community. While some Kosovars could pay for their accommodations, others could not. Albanian families opened their homes to the refugees, and Albanian youth mobilized in social support of their Kosovar peers.
During the mass exodus from Kosovo into Albania, families remained intact, thereby minimizing the number of unaccompanied and separated children. This protective factor, coupled with the good nutritional status of Kosovar children and the rapid deployment of immunizations and safe water, halted the threat of epidemics and malnutrition. The refugees did not stay as long as expected. Within six weeks of the Yugoslav army withdrawal agreement, most refugees had returned home; by August 6, only about 6,667 refugees remained behind in Albania.¹

**Status of national health and education services in Albania**

In Albania, basic social services widely available under communism had deteriorated badly during the nineties. Rates of infant and maternal mortality were very high by European standards, because many essential primary health care services for mothers and children were grossly under-funded. A chronic lack of resources had also weakened the quality of education. Per pupil expenditure fell, despite a decline in enrolment. Real resources for education fell from well over 4% of GDP in the early 1990s to less than 3.0% in 1998.²

This rapid deterioration diminished the perceived value of education, especially in the eyes of poor families. As a result, primary school attendance dropped from 100% to 94%. The number of young children attending preschools dropped very significantly from 58% in 1990 to 35% in 1997.

### 2.2. Key Contextual Considerations

UNICEF’s overall strategy was to focus on refugee children and women in camps, centres and with host families, while simultaneously strengthening the social sector infrastructure and services.

The magnitude and speed of the influx of refugees into Albania demanded a common strategic framework to guide the massive number of emergency responders assisting already vulnerable and traumatized children. This synergized common and strategic framework was necessary to ensure children's rights in the emergency. Coordination was not only crucial for the numerous and well-resourced NGOs but also for new partners such as NATO. UNICEF met this challenge by providing policy, hardware and software on how to set up "a camp with a child's face." UNICEF designed:

- A minimum package of services (health, well baby, psychosocial, recreational, education, parents' counselling) to be delivered holistically and simultaneously
- Minimum standards of space and equipment for the set up and functioning of CFS/E in camps and collective centres
- Kits for each set of services namely: recreational & psychosocial, well-baby (health and hygiene), education
- A framework for ensuring a resumption of normal childhood activities and re-instating the adult refugees’ role as principal caregivers, protectors and educators of their children
- Training for care providers.³
### Minimum Standards For Child Friendly Spaces in Albania, 1999.

1. The CFS/E should have a total area of 1,700 square meters (sqm) for a population of 2,500 refugees; it should be clearly identified, separated and easily distinguished from other living and service areas in the camps and collective centres.

2. In a total refugee population of 2,500, it is estimated that 750 children will be of school age. The CFS/E should include 4 tents (70 to 75 sq m each) for pre-school and primary school grades 1-4. An additional 3 tents should be allocated to primary grades 5-8 - preferably inside the CFS/E but outside if space is too limited.

3. The Well-Baby Centre should be organized in a separate tent of approximately 50 sqm. including a kitchen area. This area, especially designed for mothers, babies and young children will serve approximately 150-200 children daily.

4. The Adult Area should be devoted to mothers and children attending the Well-Baby Centre. The area should be an open space provided with tarpaulin of 50 sq m.

5. The playground should be on a level site of at least 50 sq m close to the Adult Area. The CFS/E should also include a water point close to the Well-Baby Centre and a bulletin board next to the water point.

6. There should be a Human Rights Information and Referral Centre on-site.

UNICEF took on a role of coordinating child-focused NGOs through their "Child Friendly Spaces" (CFS/E) initiative. This initiative sought to ensure a set of services for children as an imbedded and routine component of camp design and management. CFS/E sought to guarantee, from the very onset of the emergency, the child's right to education, recreation, psychosocial care, counselling, information, protection, proper hygiene and nutrition.

#### 2.3. Stakeholders Involved, Roles and Interests

Albania called for the implementation of integrated standards for the layout of CFS/E services. The CFS/Es were to provide human rights information, health services, education, recreation and psychosocial support to Kosovar women and children living in camps and collective centres.

The agreement between UNICEF and the Albanian government was critical to the establishment of CFS/E. The administration of Albania mobilized considerable resources to absorb the refugees.

UNICEF also sought to mainstream the CFS/E-building concept into the planning and inception of refugee camps. At the height of the emergency, 37 NGOs (including SCF, CARE and IRC) were part of the UNICEF-led CFS/E coordination and liaison process.

Greene et al. noted:

*The number of international actors was overwhelming. Multilateral, bilateral, domestic governmental and private actions were highly funded and present. While a welcome boost to resources and capacities, this complicated coordination of the response, and generated competition, especially for visibility.*

To respond to these challenges, UNICEF organized weekly meetings with international and national NGOs. Initially focused on the principles of CFS/E, these meetings became crucial forums to coordinate the work of the different actors involved in the implementation of the CFS/E. Participation was excellent: thirty to thirty-five NGO representatives came each week. This collaboration enabled UNICEF to work effectively with a wide range of actors in the field, some of
whom continued as partners in other UNICEF country programs.

UNICEF staff organized field trips to evaluate its operational options for CFS/E. Each field trip involved meetings with local NGOs to identify potential partners. Together they visited the camps and centres to assess the situation. They then met with local authorities to identify district needs. NGOs used both their own and UNICEF resources to implement CFS/E in their operations areas. UNICEF allocated resources as outlined in the table below.

### Results

CFS/E incorporated improvised educational, recreational, health and psychosocial facilities, normally in tents, run by NGO partners and child professionals from within the refugee community. According to the UNICEF Albania 1999 Annual Report:

As the emergency came to end, at least 24 partial or complete Child Friendly Spaces had been established across Albania reaching up to 100,000 children. Child Friendly Spaces secured basic rights for tens of thousands of refugee children during their time in Albania.

**TABLE: 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Unit</th>
<th>Quantity</th>
<th>Price per unit in US $</th>
<th>Total in US $</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tents 70m2</td>
<td>Unit</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>3452.</td>
<td>37,972.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tents 25m2</td>
<td>Unit</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>630.</td>
<td>1890.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tents 12 m2</td>
<td>Unit</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>630.</td>
<td>3150.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School in a bag</td>
<td>kit</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>102.46</td>
<td>2049.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classroom kit</td>
<td></td>
<td>658</td>
<td>252.30</td>
<td>166,013.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recreational kits</td>
<td>kit</td>
<td>630</td>
<td>253.38</td>
<td>159,629.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Well baby kits</td>
<td>kit</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>883.30</td>
<td>8833.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hygiene kits</td>
<td>kit</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>7.50</td>
<td>3750.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toys</td>
<td>Unit</td>
<td>370</td>
<td>253.38</td>
<td>93,750.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radios</td>
<td>Unit</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>25.88</td>
<td>698.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biscuits</td>
<td>kg</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>450.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>478,186.36</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Ymeraj, in her evaluation of CFS/E, concluded that 9% of an estimated number of 200,000 refugee children were reached through CFS/E. According to her report, 22 CFS/E were implemented, while another 15 were planned. An appendix to her report states that six of the 22 presumably implemented CFS/E were not fully developed beyond planning stages. Among the 16 that operated, nine provided the full range of integrated services (i.e., education, health, recreation and psychosocial services). Those nine reached about 5500 children. The remaining centres offered partial services for 3430 beneficiaries. The rapid repatriation of the refugees necessarily reduced the effectiveness of CFS/E operations. By July, most Kosovars already were leaving Albania. According
to UNHCR only 6,667 refugees remained in Albania by August 6.

The long-term objectives of CFS/E from the Albanian perspective are clearly spelled out in Ymeraj’s report: strengthening of basic services for children in Albania; introduction of new skills among child professionals in Albania and Kosovo and improvement of overall knowledge concerning childcare and development, strengthening of the capacity of local Albanian NGOs through cooperation with more experienced international NGOs and agencies; and provision of an ideal structure for the involvement of young volunteers from both the refugee and local communities, increasing their long term sense of social responsibility, solidarity and self-esteem. On the other hand, HQs main objective was to field test an innovative concept.

2.5. Analysis of Lessons Learned

The CFS/E initiative established at least two important innovations.

1. It created strategic alliances across international and local NGOs. It succeeded because of its in-country presence.
2. It designed an innovative community-oriented integrated services strategy with the Albanian government that started during the emergency and continued into the post-emergency period.

Without question, CFS/E was an effective tool for advocacy. According to the Greene et al. report:

The partnership with local organizations that were established or built during the emergency are a reflection of UNICEF’s advantage as an agency that had in-country presence before the crisis. UNICEF’s contacts and high calibre local staff yielded good access to partners in direct contact with the refugees. …The Albania office has developed a quality assurance system that could be useful in emergencies in the future as well as monitoring and supervision systems in the ongoing program.

Challenges

One major challenge that was successfully met used the relief response to strengthen basic services for children in host communities. The goal was to alleviate the burden on the generous Albanian people and to reduce unavoidable tension that could lead to conflict between host and refugee communities. The CFS/E concept was transformed progressively into what became, towards the end of 1999, "Integrated Community Services" (ICS). Following thorough mapping of child facilities in a given city/area, these ICS were established to provide a set of mutually reinforcing services for Albanian and Kosovar children and youth. In 2000, ICS became central in the plan of action.

It appeared that once the potential of the CFS approach for local purposes was seen, UNICEF Albania concentrated most of its efforts on adapting the concept and transforming it into Integrated Community Services (ICS). Beginning in 2000, this ICS model became a successful development program for Albania. Given the short duration of the emergency, this approach was obviously justified. In the end, the interests of HQs and the Country Office converged as the creation of ICS showed the flexibility as well as the sustainability of the CFS/E approach.

With respect to other challenges faced by CFS/E strategists, the DFID report concludes:

If UNICEF were to consider implementing CFS/E in an emergency again:
Field capacity to present, support and monitor the initiative should be put in place at the earliest stage. Enhanced staff capacity in the field would be required whatever the package, if integrated services were to be systematically provided.

Wolff confirmed this observation during a mission to Albania:

Officers were initially sceptical of 'CFS/E' utility, complaining at times that it drew them away from their regular program obligations. Their doubts were reasonable - who knew if this new thing would work? - and much effort has since gone into adapting procedures to serve both endeavours rationally.9

Opportunities

Building on the experience of CFS/E, UNICEF has subsequently sought to promote sustainable and integrated community based services for Albanian children. This has been a vital strategy for harnessing the new sense of confidence among community-based organizations mobilized during the Kosovo crisis. The program's emphasis has been the reduction of regional disparities and the building of complementary community-based services in an integrated and participatory manner.10 UNICEF’s standard monitoring and evaluation systems need to be part of the planning. The integrated approach was difficult to monitor given the institutional sectoral planning pattern of UNICEF.

At the time of this writing, three ICS projects were underway in El Bassan, Vlore and Fier. Twelve additional projects were planned to start before December of 2004.

Constraints

Despite decades of sensitization, time and effort is still required to convince influential agencies of the need for education and psychosocial support in emergencies as a complement to food, water and sanitation, shelter and nutrition. As reported and recommended by one of the evaluations of the CFS Albania experience:

The CFS Initiative must not remain "packaged" in its current form. The presentation (or more crudely put, the 'marketing') under the label 'CFS' of an integrated approach to providing services to women and children does not seem to have added value. The terminology and concepts are not readily translatable in many languages. The reaction to the CFS packaging in Albania also shows that "Child Friendly Services" is not instantly recognizable as a shorthand way of saying "Integrated Services...UNICEF [should] lobby the International Community for the systematic inclusion of CFS (i.e. space to provide integrated services - school, well baby, adult and recreation) in the first phase of emergency camp design. As heard repeatedly, day two is too late."11

However, the lessons learned that followed the implementation of the Albanian experience, in Turkey, Caucasus and other emergency situations, has shown a good acceptance by donors and a sequence of progress of the CFS integrated approach.12

---

2 The mean level among 19 transition countries was 4.8% in 1998.
3 UNICEF FYR Macedonia, Lessons Learned from the Emergency Programme Implemented in Response to the 1999 Kosovo Crisis. n.d.
4 This included: Joint responsibility for the effective establishment of “Child-Friendly Spaces” (CFS/E) and the adoption of the Child-Friendly approach to assist Kosovar refugees and host Albanian families and
communities.

5 As Greene et al. (UNICEF Preparedness and Response in the 1999 Kosovo Refugee Emergency. UNICEF/DFID 2000) observed that UNICEF’s efforts were constrained: 

In the context of limited UNICEF field presence, the Emergency Management Group (EMG) tasked the OSCE with presenting the CFS/E Initiative at the regional sector meetings. (It is, incidentally, worth noting that a UNICEF initiative to create a ‘social’ desk within the EMG was turned down by that body. This may indicate a degree of scepticism among ‘hardened’ emergency managers and/or novices, about the priority to be accorded to psychosocial, child friendly and educational initiatives in emergencies, compared to the classical ‘life-saving’ sectors). When CFS/E was presented, some reports from the field suggest that what was intended to be a flexible tool came across as a set of unsupported instructions. The specifications for space in camps were particularly misunderstood and provoked assertions that there were other priorities; food, shelter, water and sanitation, health. In Shkodra, the presentation of CFS/E came at a time of high security risk and was seen by some as a lack of attention to regional detail on the part of UNICEF.


8 According to Greene: The UNICEF emergency psychosocial programs built on already established partnerships in different ways. The Zagreb based Society for Psychological Assistance (SPA) was already working in Albania while the Center of Crisis Psychology (CCP) has established a relationship with UNICEF in some crisis countries: Both organizations provided emergency training in working more effectively with trauma sufferers. Trainees included teachers, social workers and youth volunteers who were themselves refugees, as well as these groups in the host population.


10 Typical integrated community service projects supported by UNICEF include the opening of schools or cultural centres after hours to facilitate mother and toddler groups, informal learning environments, cultural activities, sport and play activities and dissemination of social information. At the local authority level, thorough mapping of available services for children takes place. Technical and material assistance strengthens services and enhances the prospects for children's rights.

Chapter 3. Turkey Case Study

3.1. Descriptive Account/ Background

On 17 August 1999 an earthquake measuring hit the Marmara region, in north western Turkey, one of the most densely populated parts of the country killing 18,000 people, injuring 44,000 and leaving approximately 300,000 homeless. Less than three months later, another massive earthquake hit the same region. Official figures indicate that the second earthquake killed 845 people and injured 4,948. In addition there was an average of 12 daily aftershocks over a period of 119 days. About six million people live in the disaster-affected areas.

Of the 1,040 primary schools in the worst affected provinces, 534 either collapsed or suffered major damage. According to the Ministry of Education, of the 2.8 million school children in the region 500,000 were directly affected by the quake. 137 teachers died. Additionally, almost 25% of teaching staff and their families fled the area. The health situation was also bad. 70 percent of pre-existing primary health care centres (PHCCs) were partially or totally damaged.

By March, 2000 of the total population of 2,626,120 in the five most affected provinces 220,411 people were still homeless, 85,291 living in tent camps, and 134,345 in prefabricated housing units. Over 77,000 children between 0-18 years remained homeless. Prior to the August 1999 earthquake, a relatively broad and sophisticated range of services for children and women in the Marmara region had been in place. They were provided under the auspices of government ministries and quasi-governmental directorates, and met children’s basic rights in the areas of health, education and recreation.
3.2. Key Contextual Considerations

The Government of Turkey quickly declared a state of emergency and requested international assistance. The Turkish authorities responded to the catastrophe by sending around 34,000 soldiers for assistance and maintain order. Local volunteers quickly responded by distributing food, water and clothing and medical care.

Based on initial the findings of an inter-agency Disaster Management Team, UNICEF, which was already working in-country, set up an Emergency Team to respond. The team was composed of an Emergency Coordinator, and experts in Water and Environmental Sanitation, Psychosocial, and Health and Nutrition, each assisted by Program and Field Assistants in three locations, Adapazari (Sakarya), Goleuk (Kocaeli) and Yalova.

In August 1999, UNICEF developed a 16 month Recovery Plan for Turkish Children (RPTC) in consultation with the Government of Turkey. The RPTC had its main focus on following areas:

1. Clean water and sanitation facilities to the affected areas until permanent services were restored
2. Psychosocial and educational activities, to raise awareness of and decrease the negative after effects in children and families, and to prevent long-term negative psychological problems
3. Coordination of psychosocial services for children and families
4. Health and nutrition to support rehabilitation of the basic health services for mothers and children

A minimum package of integrated services following the model of Child Friendly Spaces/Environments (CFS/E) was designed building on its success in Albania. The services included health, mother support and baby area, psycho-social education and recreation, and parent counselling.

The concept of CFS/E was presented and discussed first in UNICEF internally and later presented by the Emergency Coordinator to the relevant counterparts. All of them welcomed the initiative and made suggestions to further improve its implementation in the country. The implementation of the CFS/E approach was adapted and endorsed in collaboration with relevant counterparts in Turkey as part of the RPTC. The Prime Minister’s Office endorsed the CFS/E Initiative by signing a decree. A series of meetings were organized with the aim of establishing a specific Implementation Plan for all foreseen activities and develop a clear coordination mechanism within UNICEF and with various government/non-governmental partners.

The Ministry of National Education, MoNE, suggested priority should be given to CFS/E in the areas where schools had not re-opened. In addition, youth involvement was considered vital. It highly recommended the participation of Scouts and other national youth associations. Initially, it was planned to set up the CFS/E in all the tent cities. Sweden donated 656 tents for this purpose. “School-in-a-box” and recreational kits were revised by ministry experts.

Cross-ministry co-ordination needed to be strengthened. For example, the Ministry of Health, MOH, representatives expressed concerned for overlapping psychosocial training. The MOH had developed a psychosocial training for medical personnel working with the affected population.
Implementation and Adaptation of the Child Friendly Spaces Approach in Turkey.

Initially, the homeless population moved to makeshift shelters in the gardens or on the roads directly adjacent to their damaged or destroyed homes. Eventually, the majority of the homeless moved to the tented camps. Within two months of the first quake, the government initiated a strong drive to provide prefabricated housing, and over the ensuing months more families were assigned to these semi-permanent housing units.

Within each tent camp/city, one or more areas were secured according to community size. The area was equipped with sheltered space, structured according to minimum space requirements established for each of the services to be provided. The basic activities provided a safe haven with integrated basic services for children and mothers, in line with their age. They included:

- Basic health, nutrition and baby care
- Hygiene, water and sanitation services
- Early childhood care, development (ECCD) and mother support
- Primary school and recreation
- Psychosocial support
- Youth activities

A set of minimum standards were based on an average tent camp population size of 1,500. Tented camps in the affected provinces ranged from smaller 50 tent complexes housing some 1,300 people, to mega conglomerates of up to 2,000 tents housing as many as 7,500 at any one time. The size of each CFS/E was modified according to the population served, maintaining the service space/population ratio identified in the minimum set of standards. The graphics below show the tented and open air spaces for a standard tent camp population of 1,500.


Child Friendly Spaces - Minimum standards for 1500 people
- Primary schooling space 300 m²
- Pre-school space 150 m²
- Primary health care space 110 m²
The CFS/E concept was short-lived in Turkey. The Albanian model had been designed for refugees and IDPs facing a total absence of state-provided services. In the Turkish scenario, however, the homeless population still lived in their home region. The earthquake regions provided comprehensive basic community services before the disaster. The state, with the support of the relief organizations present, reactivated them after the earthquake. The service infrastructure recovered gradually. Most of the CFS/E activities were eventually replaced by recovering state services.

The focus of the CFS/E operations then shifted from providing comprehensive services to ensuring local community access to these integrated services. This new “Child Friendly Environment (CFE)” approach supported the state and the provincial municipalities in reactivating local infrastructure and services. CFE also provided them in toto where the state could not. CFE remained an integrated package of services.

3.3. Stakeholders Involved, Roles and Interests

UNICEF’s key counterparts were the sectoral Ministries and their directorates, namely the MoNE, the MoH and the Department of Social Services and Child protection (SHCEK), through their representatives at federal, provincial and local level. The intended cross-sectoral integrated approach could not be realized, as the Turkish ministries worked in parallel. Wolff observed:

*One central obstacle to the establishment of integrated services for women and children in any environment is that the principle runs counter to the managerial (and power conservation) inclinations of the ministries themselves…And indeed it is undeniable that in the case of the response to the disaster in the Marmara, the Turkish ministries concerned with re-establishing services did precisely what their mandates required of them.*

This situation was compounded by UNICEF officers in the field:

*It is important to note that the same dynamics inherent in CFS/E ought to also be reflected in the UNICEF emergency team’s field operations. That is to say that all sector specialists would benefit from an understanding of what their colleagues are planning and accomplishing. This approach would also have value in instances where UNICEF serves as an advocate for child rights in affected areas -to the extent that these...*
3.4. Results

**Water and Environmental Sanitation**

UNICEF, through a subcontracted engineering company, developed a design for easily detachable and movable water and sanitation clusters. A total of 51 clusters were installed in the earthquake area, benefiting more than 30,000 victims. By the end of 2000, the clusters from the tent cities were relocated to schools and health centres.

UNICEF also procured leak detection equipment and water test laboratory equipment. As a consequence, the quality of drinking water of 150,000 people was monitored daily. Advocacy material on hygiene practices reached more than 300,000 beneficiaries through the dissemination of posters in schools and health centres.

**Health and Nutrition**

Although the provincial health infrastructure had suffered extensive damage, sufficient health personnel remained in the area to initiate the re-activation of health services. The UNICEF Health and Nutrition section in collaboration with the MoH structured activities into three main projects:

- Expanded Program of Immunization Nutritional Surveillance
- Revitalization of the PHCCs
- In order to resolve the problem of a high rate of burn-out of local health staff, MoH put a rotation system in place, but staff from other provinces found it very hard to stay in the earthquake areas for prolonged periods of time under trying working conditions. UNICEF played a vital role by providing additional attention to the serving staff. UNICEF together with the MoH organized a series of workshops for 1,600 health workers. The workshops covered topics relevant to disaster aftermath.

**Education**

The MoNE made extraordinary efforts to provide spaces and facilitate the resumption of school activities. Many schools with the support of relief organizations and private donors were started in tents. UNICEF contributed significantly by providing tents, floor pallets, whiteboards and markers, cupboards and later floor fans to the 140 neediest schools. The reduced number of teaching facilities obliged the MoNE to operate in double and sometimes triple shifts during the initial months after the earthquake.

UNICEF’s initial activities reached out to the teaching staff, as they were also victims of the disaster. They distributed sleeping blankets, gas stoves, tents and 30 kV generators to support teachers’ families. UNICEF also provided help to the institutional “Teacher House” in the five provinces. They were equipped with computers and printers, facilitating the registration of school children in each province and the compilation and print of educational materials and archive reports. These facilities provided a sense of normalcy for teachers and their families and contributed to a sense of cohesion among the teaching staff.

Two thousand four hundred sixty-three (2,463) standard educational kits were distributed to 288 schools for 117,459 beneficiaries. The kits proved to be a key item in the resumption of educational activities as both the provincial MoNE directorates and children’s parents were unable to
provide these items to needy children.

In addition, the few existing centres for children with special needs were also badly damaged. To facilitate the work of the teaching staff UNICEF provided 25 centres with materials and equipment in the form of a “special needs kit.” The counsellors of the special needs centres also participated in the Classroom based Intervention training seminars held by the Boston Trauma Centre.

**Psychosocial Intervention**

In accordance with the RPTC, UNICEF in cooperation with the MoNE prepared and launched a large-scale psychosocial school project for implementation in the affected areas aimed at decreasing the negative psychological impact of the disaster on children, their parents and teachers. In the earthquake areas, the psycho-social program targeted 8,235 teachers for the debriefing of 35,000 children in classroom-based interventions (CBI), 240,000 schoolchildren for psycho-education and 1,500 severely traumatized children for group counselling.8

An agreement was signed between the MoNE and UNICEF in February 2000 to enhance the institutionalization of the approach, with a view to integrating these methods within a disaster preparedness framework that could be used countrywide. Ankara University Psychology department and a consultant from Middle East Technical University carried out an evaluation study between March and June 2000.9

In 2001, the MoNE committed itself to implement the Psychosocial School project for earthquake victims nationwide after UNICEF phased out its assistance in Mid-2002. In 2002, the psycho-education training package was extended to all schools in the country. A core group of school counsellors in each province received training in psycho education. Manuals of CBI, psycho-education and group counselling were developed by international experts and continuously revised based on feedback by implementers.

**Recreation, early childhood development and youth activities**

Among the services not provided for by the state were Early Childhood facilities. In close cooperation with SHCEK, UNICEF developed a project for the installation, furnishing and training of social workers for up to 145 centres. In 2001, the crèches initiated by UNICEF for prefabricated housing settlements were run by SHCEK. Cooperation with NGOs gradually widened with the involvement of CARITAS and ADRA in the project. By 2001, the crèches were serving 1,000 3-6 year olds benefiting a total of 9,567.10

UNICEF also assisted in the establishment of 25 youth centres in the earthquake areas involving the active participation of 1000 youth volunteers.11 The programs included social, cultural, educational, sport and professional activities such as drama and music workshops, photography, English language courses, psychosocial support, and psychodrama and earthquake therapies.12

**3.5. Analysis of Lessons Learned**

- **UNICEF's greatest achievement was to create national capacity to cope with trauma.** Prior to the 1999 earthquakes, the government had no capacity to respond to psychosocial trauma. UNICEF provided the training that contributed to the establishment of a sustained independent capacity in the Special Education Directorate of the MoNE. This included several psychologists and a rapid response team resource network of about 2,000 people in government social services and academia who were already trained by master
trainers.

- The lessons learned under the Earthquake Recovery Plan laid the foundations for the development of the National Disaster Preparedness Plan that has been mainstreamed into the regular country program. It aims to institutionalize effective preparation measures to mitigate the impact of disasters on women and children. A Disaster Preparedness Manual, which was based on UNICEF’s experience and promotes child-and-mother-friendly environments, was shared with counterparts for review.

- The reactivation of the school system offered an effective channel for the implementation of collateral relief aid activities. UNICEF and many other relief aid organizations transformed school channels into the core of CFS/E to distribute multiple forms of aid. The school system was used to distribute high energy, protein vitamin and mineral supplements on a daily basis for a period of five months. Likewise, the psychosocial intervention project could only have been implemented in collaboration with the MoNE. The system also helped local authorities register and locate survivors.

- Youth centres and early childhood facilities – non existent before the disaster - were not only supported by the local authorities, but also attracted support of national and international NGOs. International donor support was eventually terminated. More consideration should have been given to recurrent costs and sustainability.

- UNICEF provided a comprehensive package of basic social services to children and women as set out in the CCC. The components of the RPTC were delivered sectorally, so the success of the RPTC cannot be effectively assessed in relation to the CFS/E approach. The physical proximity of the units in the CFS/E, however, created a more convivial environment for coordination and supervision.

**Sectoral versus Integrated approaches.** Many people trained in sectoral-based approaches had difficulty thinking in terms of integrated ‘webs of support’ for children. ‘webs of support’ are the social relationships that join people to one another. They are local and international integrated services designed to support mobile children and their families as they move from place to place.13

- In the Turkey Earthquake Site Reports #16 and 18 CFE is presented both as a strategic framework for the implementation of the entire RPTC and as an additional “sectoral”, mainly recreational, component, or, according to the wording in these publications, as “complementary” or “collateral” services - alongside with the health, water and environmental sanitation, educational and psychosocial components. Both old sectoral and new integrated service structures exist within UNICEF itself. These organizational contradictions need serious attention before UNICEF loses its unique comparative advantage because it is unable to manage either approach well.

---

2 Ibid.
3 This was under the authority of another ministry Department of Social Services and Child protection - SCHEK
4 The local authorities and the central government very rapidly began to advocate and encourage the relocation in structured tent cities built with the help of the military, relief aid organizations and municipalities.
5 Since the government’s initiative was not clear for the first one and a half months, UNICEF’s initial strategy was based on the assumption that basic services such as shelter, food, basic health, safe water and sanitation, education and child protection had to be provided ex-novo and began providing the basic services within the tent cities themselves. To this end UNICEF adopted and used the recently developed concept of Child-Friendly Spaces.
Each week of the six week CBI period emphasizes a specific theme to provide children with the opportunity to safely and slowly debrief their earthquake experiences in a secure group environment. This 6-week program is designed to support children in doing what they do best: playing and learning. It is a program recovery focused and resilience based.

The study reported that CBI were best targeted at adolescents with high levels of post traumatic stress disorder symptoms (PTSD). The program was an important step towards post-trauma normalization and reducing the (PTSD) related symptom areas such as anxiety, depression, somatization, hostility negative self-image and school related problems. The result in general showed that Psycho-Education seminars were helpful for parents and children to learn about the psychological reaction which people have after an earthquake and gave opportunities to share their reactions with others. The teachers who attended the Teacher Debriefing Meetings found them beneficial. The majority express that they shared and applied the information to their daily lives the group who benefited reported less post-traumatic stress reaction. Overall the results of the study indicated that the project had reached its targets.

The Mothers Training Program (MOT), which had operated in Turkey since 1993 was implemented in the earthquake provinces in 40 crèches.

The centres began operations in May 2000 to help the psychosocial needs of primarily two age groups, 7-12 year olds and 13-18 olds. The SHCEK assisted by UNICEF ran youth centres and youth committees.

Like the crèches, the youth centres suffered from understaffing because SHCEK was unable to provide sufficient personnel. Unfortunately, 20 out of 25 youth centres were closed down in 2002 due to lack of funding from SHCEK to relocate the centres into sustainable quarters.

References:

6 M. Wolf, UNICEF Field Report No.2, 1.11.1999
7 Ibid.
8 The study reported that CBI were best targeted at adolescents with high levels of post traumatic stress disorder symptoms (PTSD). The program was an important step towards post-trauma normalization and reducing the (PTSD) related symptom areas such as anxiety, depression, somatization, hostility negative self-image and school related problems. The result in general showed that Psycho-Education seminars were helpful for parents and children to learn about the psychological reaction which people have after an earthquake and gave opportunities to share their reactions with others. The teachers who attended the Teacher Debriefing Meetings found them beneficial. The majority express that they shared and applied the information to their daily lives the group who benefited reported less post-traumatic stress reaction. Overall the results of the study indicated that the project had reached its targets.

10 The Mothers Training Program (MOT), which had operated in Turkey since 1993 was implemented in the earthquake provinces in 40 crèches.

11 The centres began operations in May 2000 to help the psychosocial needs of primarily two age groups, 7-12 year olds and 13-18 olds. The SHCEK assisted by UNICEF ran youth centres and youth committees.

12 Like the crèches, the youth centres suffered from understaffing because SHCEK was unable to provide sufficient personnel. Unfortunately, 20 out of 25 youth centres were closed down in 2002 due to lack of funding from SHCEK to relocate the centres into sustainable quarters.

Chapter 4. Northern Caucasus Case Study

4.1. Descriptive Account/Background

Ingushetia, or "Galgaachia" in the native tongue, is the smallest constituent republic in the Russian Federation. It is located in the Northern Caucasus. The Ingush and their eastern neighbours, the Chechen, are distinct ethnic groups with distinct languages, histories, and political identities, but so closely related and so similar that it is convenient to describe them together. Present-day Chechnya and Ingushetia correspond roughly to the traditional territory where, until recent decades, almost all Chechen and Ingush have lived.
This complex human geography is the consequence of events of recent decades: mass deportation of both groups to Central Asia from 1944 to 1956. In late October 1992, tens of thousands of Ingush were forced from their homes in the Prigorodni District of North Ossetia. This refugee problem became a major problem for the beleaguered government of Ingushetia, already faced with soaring unemployment (as high as 50 percent), a worsening ecological crisis, a high concentration of Russian troops stationed there because of the war in neighbouring Chechnya, and a flood of Chechen refugees from that conflict.

Chechen families and their children had not yet recovered from the 1995-1996 civil wars when they were again uprooted from their homes in late August 1999. The bordering Republic of Ingushetia has absorbed nearly 200,000 internally-displaced persons (IDPs) from Chechnya since September 1999. Over 45% of the displaced were below 18 years of age.1

Humanitarian engagement in Ingushetia, through education, health and other programs, has helped to restrain the authorities from forcibly returning IDPs. UNICEF’s support for alternative schools when enrolment of IDP children in public schools was contested is an example of this. Such actions helped establish the IDPs in Ingushetia. They were there because of the lack of security in Chechnya. The international community provided assistance that the Russian Federation was capable of providing, but did not.2

There were almost as many IDPs as Ingushetians. These proportions were phenomenal; the peak figures for Kosovar and East Timorese refugees were about 15%. Prior to the IDP influx Ingushetia was already one of the poorest and most densely populated republics of the Russian Federation.3 Resource transfers from the federal to the regional level were so low that even de-mining was not funded although there were approximately 500,000 landmines and UXO in Chechnya.

As of 15 October 2003 a total of 74,294 IDPs from Chechnya were registered for assistance in Ingushetia.4 As the result of a military incursion of Chechen rebels in Ingushetia in June 2004, pressure for repatriation by the Federal authorities increased. Of the approximately 50,000 IDPs from Chechnya who are currently living in Ingushetia, about half are ethnic Chechens while the rest are ethnic Ingush. Some 28,000 who were living in private accommodation remained largely unaffected by the backlash, while some of the 24,000 living in 181 temporary settlements faced threats of eviction or utility cuts.

4.2. Key Contextual Considerations

Evolution and trends

The UN recognized that the size and scope of the humanitarian response in Chechnya was inadequate and that humanitarian needs remained largely unmet. In Chechnya, as a result of funding and security constraints, UNICEF and its partners were only able to provide limited assistance to education, principally for the rehabilitation of a small number of damaged schools. A comprehensive assessment carried out by UNICEF, in collaboration with its partner NGOs, revealed that up to one third of the school buildings were totally destroyed (Grozny).

Children attended classes in alternative premises – in some cases in rented private houses and even tents, often totally unsuitable and normally without the most basic equipment. In the absence of electricity or functioning stoves, teaching was severely hampered in most of the schools apart from the few districts that were spared from the hostilities.
The situation for pre-school age children was even worse. The lack of kindergartens limited the opportunities for mothers, often alone, to work. While UNICEF supported the management of four “Child Friendly Spaces” run by Caritas Internationalis in Grozny, the needs remained immense.

**Child Friendly Spaces in Ingushetia and Chechnya**

In early 2004, UNICEF held consultations with the Chechen MoE and Caritas on the status of pre-school education facilities in the republic. The possible hand-over to the MoE of five kindergartens managed by Caritas in Grozny was also briefly discussed. These centres, where 1,200 children aged 3-6 were offered an opportunity to develop basic physical, cognitive and social skills in a healthy and friendly environment were financially supported by UNICEF and the European Union’s Humanitarian Aid office (ECHO). The officials from the MoE expressed their readiness to gradually take over the kindergartens. In parallel, UNICEF planned to focus on increasing the coverage of young pre-school age children through the provision of support to community-based centres. 

**Ingushetia**

Contacts with families revealed that educational prospects for young displaced people were of great concern to parents, community members and young people themselves. As of 30 January 2004, there were 52 IDP schools with 6,896 students and 285 teachers. UNICEF continued to conduct regular monitoring trips to the camps and spontaneous settlements. It also maintained a close dialogue with the Chechen and Ingush MOEs to protect children’s rights to education in this rapidly evolving context.

**Psychosocial support to traumatized children in Chechnya**

In January, 152 students of 10 regular schools in Grozny benefited from the psychosocial counselling support and stress-relieving activities conducted by PINF, the local implementing partner for UNICEF, with financial support from ECHO. Experienced activity leaders provided counselling to children and parents monitored the children’s behaviour and emotions during the sessions as well as conducted exercises to decrease their anxiety/aggression and promote mutual tolerance.

UNICEF also provided support to 5 Children Centres (kindergartens) hosting approximately 690 pre-school age IDP children and run by Caritas Internationalism. In 37 IDP schools and other facilities UNICEF supported a wide range of extra-curricular recreational projects, thus promoting the development of a ‘normal’ social environment and reducing the children’s exposure to dangerous and illegal activities. Special evening and ‘catch-up’ classes were also been held in some of the IDP schools.

4.3. Stakeholders Involved, Roles and Interests

The four components of UNICEF’s emergency program included education, mine action, health & nutrition and water & sanitation. UNICEF became the lead agency for education and mine action. The UNICEF EP gradually expanded the involvement of NGO partners including PINF, ARD, PHO, IRC, CPCD, the Salvation Army and HWA. See Results section for details on the role of partners.

4.4. Results

*The idea of "Child Friendly Spaces" was critical not only for educational activities but also reconstruction strategy.* CFS/E’ approach integrated active learning with elements related
to the themes of the emergency: child protection, child rights, mine awareness, psychosocial and healing activities, and HIV/AIDS.

UNICEF is quite properly credited with having undertaken excellent work in the education sector through ‘child friendly spaces’ and mine awareness in the Northern Caucasus, in which it is the lead agency. The work has been relevant and necessary, clearly within UNICEF’s mandate to lead efforts to ensure children’s access to basic education and, in the circumstances of displacement, preserve educational attainment. Moreover, basic education, recreation and sport do serve a protection function in so far as schools are normally safe environments, while recreation and sport are therapeutic and constitute an alternative to illegal, dangerous activities. This had worked well in Ingushetia for IDP children…

Child protection provided the strategic core from the onset of the emergency due to the inconsistent and ambiguous protection policies of the Federal Government. Its integrated strategy emerged from close and creative consultation with UNICEF partners. With the core of educational strategy re-centred on child protection, other emergency workers quickly grasped its importance.

An OCHA representative made the point that UNICEF made a contribution that nobody else initially considered critical, yet education is ‘as critical as water’. Other positives include the fact that many children have missed years of school and the NGO-run schools offered them a way back in; the integration of IDP and local children where possible; the employment of IDP teachers; and the continuity with NGO partners over the years.

Child Friendly Spaces’ inter-sectoral approach with NGO partners

Caritas

The "Child Friendly Spaces" of Caritas restricted coverage to pre-school populations. The organization and integration of sectoral work among agencies in this case was a good example of how CFS/E strategy was built in the Northern Caucasus. The current Caritas Children’s Centre Programs are 10 in number. The first of these were initiated in 2000: five in Ingushetia and five in Grozny.

Children were initially accommodated in tents with limited space. The tents were gradually replaced with “box tents” – pre-fabricated wooden accommodations (3 Centres), or wooden buildings (2 Centres) in Ingushetia. These new accommodations provided more space and a more pleasant environment for the children and the staff. Each Centre was colourful, well maintained, with good standards of hygiene and sanitation. The Children’s Centre staff and the parents gradually took ownership of the Centres.

The Centres are well organized, with indoor and outdoor playing spaces and equipment. Children dine indoors during winter, and have space for dining out of doors in summer. Each Centre has a staffed medical point for health checks, as well as sleeping areas for the children. Hammer Forum has provided some of the medicines others are purchased. Nutritious meals are provided. Basic food items – flour, sugar and oil are provided by WFP in Grozny. Psychological support is also available twice weekly. Drinking water is tinkered to the Centres by the Polish Humanitarian Organization (PHO) in Grozny and by International Rescue Committee (IRC) in Ingushetia. The centres and atmosphere facilitates socialization and there are possibilities for music, drawing and other creative activities, such as drama and dancing. UNICEF provides toys and other educational materials as well as considerable financial support.

In Chechnya, one centre was a state-owned Kindergarten which Caritas rehabilitated, set up and then handed over to the Ministry of Education (MOE). This Centre ran well and standards were
maintained. The MOE paid the major part of the salaries for staff in a second Centre and negotiations with the MOE had begun about assuming some responsibility for a third. This approach was indicative of Caritas’ and UNICEF’s future strategy for the sustainability of the Child Friendly Spaces experience in the reconstruction of Chechnya. Indeed, most agencies working in IDP camps either in Ingushetia or Chechnya followed UNICEF’s recommendations. Thus, a systematic effort was made to integrate multi-sectoral activities into educational responses.\textsuperscript{12}

\textit{International Rescue Committee (IRC)}

At the beginning of the program, IRC’s Children Affected by Armed Conflict Unit in collaboration with a researcher from the Harvard School of Public Health embarked on a longitudinal study of the impact of the program on Chechen adolescents.

\textit{Initial findings indicate that Chechen youth see the education program as ‘helping’ by returning young people to their studies as well as giving children a safe and reliable place to go and an emotional space to turn their thoughts towards more age-appropriate concerns. Not only do teens feel that young people need a place to ‘forget about the war’, they also need a place to be ‘understood’. … Indeed, the education program is seen as providing a place for children to connect to others, gain social support and offer hope for a better future. Many adolescents spoke about the opportunity to study in any form as a means of improving the potential for peace and success within their generation and for the region as a whole. The teens spoke generally about their desire to overcome the ravages of war and have future opportunities to be productive and successful.\textsuperscript{13}}

The conclusions of this study were used to develop similar approaches among NGOs in Northern Caucasus.\textsuperscript{14} UNICEF provided considerable support for recreational centres, sport projects, information and counselling centres, dance groups and other social and cultural activities in Ingushetia to reduce the risk of adolescents getting involved in dangerous or illegal activities.

\textit{People in Need Foundation (PINF)}

The People in Need Foundation (PINF), a Prague-based non-governmental, non-profit organization, was founded shortly after the fall of communism in then Czechoslovakia. PINF is the largest indigenous NGO in the post-communist part of Europe. PINF operated in the North Caucasus in 1994-95 and again since January 2000.

PINF provided educational opportunities to over 1,700 pupils, constituting the largest alternative educational network in the republic. PINF rehabilitated and improved schools for IDPs in Ingushetia and recently in Chechnya. It implemented a complex, WFP co-funded initiative of rehabilitation of school kitchens and dining halls (31) in all Grozny schools. Most labour (unskilled) was undertaken by food-for-work participants, mostly unpaid school staff and parents of school children.\textsuperscript{15}

Psycho-social centres operated at five PINF rehabilitated schools in Grozny. In all centres, professional psychologists provided individual consultations to pupils, their parents and teachers. The centres were often visited in the children’s spare time and complemented after-school activities also organized by PINF. In addition, a major part of the work was also devoted to the prevention of AIDS, drug abuse and other risky behaviours. In April 2004, PINF psychologists conducted 150 therapeutic sessions, 103 group and 47 individual sessions. The main objective was to help children cope with traumatic experiences. Other health issues, such as drug abuse, AIDS, TB, etc. were also addressed on a regular basis.\textsuperscript{16}
World Vision (WV)

A similar approach was developed by “World Vision” (WV) at the Community Mobilization Centre “Peace and Hope” in Grozny. The Centre integrated psychosocial, health and educational projects, targeting IDPs from Ingushetia and those from North Ossetia. The psychosocial project included individual and group work. Working with both children and adults, professional psychologists applied music, game, and dance and art therapies. The centre was equipped with a playroom with toys and materials to stimulate children's thinking, imagination and fantasy.17

Voice of the Mountains (VoM)

UNICEF coordinated the Information Management System for Mine Action (IMSMA) facilitated by the local implementing partner Voice of the Mountains (VoM). VoM managed the IMSMA database and provided information to the Northern Caucasus agencies. In January 2004, the database had about 1500 entries. The overwhelming majority of incidents were registered in Grozny. Apart from de-mining and victims rehabilitation, an important role was given to mine awareness education within the realm of the Child Friendly Spaces initiative.

The Mine Risk Education (MRE)/ Mine Awareness (MA) program led by VoM was developed in schools in Chechnya and Ingushetia. VoM provided more than 1,000 sessions of mine awareness activities. The group also provided children with UNICEF mine awareness materials, pens and notebooks. Training sessions on mine awareness for school teachers from districts in Chechnya were developed. The teachers used UNICEF's mine awareness materials and booklets for course teaching.

4.5. Analysis of Lessons Learned

Child Friendly Spaces: A Coherent Transition Strategy

Successes

The concept of ‘child friendly spaces’, although used before by UNICEF in other operations, was particularly innovative and valuable in the Northern Caucuses because it:

- **Re-centred education strategy around child protection activities that moved with families and communities from emergencies into reconstruction.** UNICEF simultaneously constructed and operated camp-based schools and propped up mainstream schools with large displaced populations

- **Developed integrated trans-sectoral and trans-national planning for children with mobile families.** The success of the CFS/E strategy demonstrated that ‘stand alone’ protection or ‘back to school’ sector access strategies were not viable in emergency conditions. Security and protection issues needed to be embedded into all aspects of children’s services.

- **Integrated the efforts of international and national NGOs under the umbrella of the Ingush Ministry of Education.** It introduced child-centred methodologies, child-friendly learning environments and child rights education teachers in every school in Ingushetia and to senior education staff from the Ministries of Education of Chechnya and Ingushetia. A sound child-centred approach emerged from the crises and served as a window of opportunity for governmental reform during reconstruction.
• **The NGOs were able to create a sustainable legacy for the governments that remained.** The focus only on pre-school in some cases (CARITAS) or the innovative and more community based approach of the IRC on psychosocial support were transferred into a common strategy.

**Challenges**

• **The success of the Child Friendly Spaces could have been better monitored if the UNICEF reporting system was better geared to assessing the process of implementation,** rather than generalizing about successful outputs orientated to the international donor community.\(^{21}\)

**Recommendation**

The work successfully implemented in the Republics of Ingushetia and Chechnya speaks to all of UNICEF’s emergency responses because it demonstrates the value of streamlining the variety of its interventions to promote more coherent transitions from emergencies to reconstruction and renewal.

---

1 OCHA, Relief web. December 1999.
3 Johanna Nichols *The Ingush (with notes on the Chechen): Background information* University of California, Berkeley and *Information on the Chechen refugee situation in Ingushetia*, University of California, Berkeley Last update: Sept. 10, 2000.
4 Database operated by DRC.
6 Theresa Stichick ,Claude Bruderlein *Children Facing Insecurity: New Strategies for Survival in a Global Era* Policy paper produced for the Canadian Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade*
11 Ibid. The teachers took responsibility for painting and decorating the Centres regularly. Parents and the local community contributed “in kind” or through work. A Food for Work program with WFP food was implemented in the rehabilitation of some Children’s Centre. The grounds were cleared, and part of the demolished building removed.
14 Support programs recognize the role of family, peer and community connectedness in the mental health and adjustment of war-affected youth. They encourage parents and extended family to participate in education through family-student-teacher discussion groups, school-based health activities or community education committees; liaise from the outset with local authorities to ensure that student learning and teacher training are certified with local Ministry authorities; move quickly, where possible, from the non-formal nature necessary for immediate interventions to formal education programming; explore collective arrangements for parental and student involvement in education programming; and study the impact of emergency education and further
improving program design.

Extra-curricular activities were continuously organized at most schools, reaching 43 various clubs. The most popular activities were wrestling, boxing, handcrafting and engraving. In an informal educational way, children aged 6-16 were offered a variety of culturally based, goal-oriented, spare-time activities under the leadership of skilled supervisors ranging from sports to national dance. An inter-school newspaper created by pupils from all PINF schools was developed to reinforce the network of IDP ‘Child Friendly Spaces’ in Chechnya and Ingushetia.

People in Need Foundation (PINF) 
*Humanitarian Operations in Chechnya and Ingushetia* - April 2003; Petr Kostohryz 


Child Friendly Spaces created lower cost, higher impact, and longer lasting services through an integrated delivery strategy (mine-awareness, supplementary feeding, sanitation and psychosocial support). This highly-leveraged approach sustained children and their families from emergencies into reconstruction by creating transition spaces for NGO programs to transfer responsibility to the government.

UNICEF 

Teachers, youth, and participants in the Child Friendly Spaces as well as Ministerial Officials became sensitive to the value of an integrated strategy based on child protection. This is a very important issue that requires further discussion and analysis. Protection needs the "teeth" that an integrated program can provide and sectoral programs cannot. The most obvious example was the 'child friendly spaces' supported in Grozny. UNICEF could address CRC and CEDAW human rights through sectoral programs (i.e. mainstreaming rights) without a separate protection component. In practice a stand-alone protection component risks failing to adequately address fundamental issues, most notably relating to the safety of children and women.

UNICEF Evaluation Report (Broughton, B. 
Chapter 5. Colombia Case Study
5.1. Background

A 40-year insurgent campaign to overthrow the Colombian Government escalated during
the 1990s, supported in part by funds from the drug trade. An anti-insurgent army of para-militaries
has grown to be several thousand strong in recent years, challenging the insurgents for control of
territory and illicit industries such as the drug trade and the government's ability to exert its dominion
over rural areas.

Historically, Colombia's bipartisan political elite has focussed on the defence of its urban
interests. The political exclusion of the rural poor, a highly concentrated pattern of land ownership
and an inefficient justice system created the conditions for the development of autonomous political
movements. The two main guerrilla groups still active, the Ejército de Liberación Nacional (ELN)
and the Fuerzas Armadas Revolucionarias de Colombia (FARC), began operating in the mid-1960s.

Colombia's economy suffers from weak domestic and foreign demand, austere government
budgets, and serious internal armed conflict. Two of Colombia's leading exports, oil and coffee, face
an uncertain future; new exploration is needed to offset declining oil production, while coffee
harvests and prices remain depressed.

A culture of violence and impunity has captured much of the country. For example,

[In the year 2000] more than 4,000 people were victims of political killings, over 300 "disappeared", and
an estimated 300,000 people were internally displaced. At least 1,500 people were kidnapped by armed
opposition groups and paramilitary organizations; mass kidnaps of civilians continued. Torture—often
involving mutilation—remained widespread, particularly as a prelude to murder by paramilitary groups.
"Death squad"-style killings continued in urban areas.1

Displacement is the first survival strategy of victims of organized violence. According to a
UNHCR report, 95.5 % of the IDP population were rural workers or were related to similar activities
in their area of origin. Unemployment among IDP heads of family is 64.6%.2

An IDP survey reported that 94% of households were displaced as a result of direct threats
to their lives, while 40% left their homes out of a more general fear. Prior to displacement, the vast
majority (75%) worked in agrarian activities. After, more than one half (59%) worked primarily in
the service sector, mostly in stores or as street vendors. Their incomes were not sufficient to meet
basic market basket needs. Fifty-three percent of homes stated that their main survival strategy was
assistance from neighbours, relatives, friends, the government, or some NGOs.3

Displaced Teachers

In Colombia, teachers in the government school system were often directly targeted
by armed groups aiming at destroying communities. Clearly, teachers — and schools — were not
perceived as neutral actors. Many of them held public positions in their communities, often as the
sole government representative. The IDP 2003 Colombia Report stated that “2,900 teachers were
forcibly displaced and 82 teachers and school employees were killed during 2002, twice as much than
during 2001”.4 Furthermore,

…around 290,000 children — equivalent to 3.6 percent of the public education system's primary school
students — had to leave school temporarily or permanently due to the forced displacement of [those] 2,900
teachers.

Threats forced many teachers to request transfers to other schools. From 1995 to 1997, in the Department
of Antioquia alone, 686 teachers were forced to abandon their work posts to be relocated elsewhere. As a result, according to information available to the Commission, there is a lack of teaching personnel in some especially violent areas due to the displacement of teachers who were working in those areas.  

5.2. Key Contextual Considerations

Rejection of IDP Children

The incorporation of displaced children into school systems in regions of peace is hampered by few vacancies in classrooms and by community rejection.

- Displaced children had limited access to education, together they comprised most of the 1.6 million children outside the educational system.
- 20% IDP children did not attend school at all. IOM found that 74% IDP children attend school, compared to the 92.2% national rate.
- 54% of IDPs said they could not afford to send their children to school.
- Although IDP children were entitled to free school enrolment for one year, no budget was allocated for them. Nothing was planned for their education after one year.
- Even when enrolment was free for IDPs, more than one half were out of school due to the high costs. 23% were out due to the necessity of contributing to family income and 9% because they had to care for their siblings.
- Some directors refused to accept IDP children in their schools, blaming insufficient resources allocated by the Education Administration.

According to a study done by the Faculty of Law, Social and Political Sciences of the National University:

_A consequence of the critical situation generated by the armed conflict and displacement is the emotional burden produced on parents and care takers affecting both adults and children. This is observed in the difficult family relations where abuse to minors is intensified if it already existed or surfaces as a consequence of the armed conflict._

5.3. Results

Humanitarian neutrality is essential to emergency education. _Retorno de la Alegría_ (Return to Happiness) and the development of Escuelas Amigas (Child Friendly Schools) _established this neutrality by emphasizing the participation of adolescent and adult members of the community as key players in the process of restoring children’s well-being_. UNICEF’s Child Friendly Spaces strategy was able to flexibly and rapidly integrate existing high quality education and psychosocial programs into an emergency response.

The Colombian Trilogy, UNICEF and its CFS/E components.

_Retorno a la Alegría–Escuelas Amigas–Escuela Nueva_ was a trilogy of strategies for Colombia’s displaced children in which _UNICEF’s emergency strategy was integrated into on-going and locally designed children-friendly programs_. The Child Friendly Spaces strategy in Colombia produced high quality educational services as well as multi-sector approaches to the protection of children’s development and healing.
Where are the Escuelas Amigas? In the Areas of Displacement\textsuperscript{1} Enrolled Students: 38,000 (UNICEF/CELAM 2003)

- Antioquia
- Córdoba
- Caquetá
- Cauca
- Cundinamarca
- Chocó
- Guajira
- Meta
- Nariño
- Quindío
- Putumayo
Total CFS: 161 (UNICEF/CELAM 2002)

The reports from the field stress the unequivocal commitment of members of local communities to help children.\textsuperscript{8} In addition, the successful experiences of Colombia’s on-going high quality rural education program provided a solid strategic base for rural emergency responses. CFS/E’ flexible strategy was integrated into the \textit{Escuela Nueva}. This approach rapidly empowered local community participation in the planning of emergency responses.

A brief description of the \textit{Escuela Nueva} program is fundamental to understand the context of Child Friendly Spaces in Colombia. This national rural educational experience provided the basis and the local know-how for rapid and adequate responses for IDP children and their communities.\textsuperscript{9} Colombia’s \textit{Escuela Nueva} was created in 1974 and has drawn from and combined various features of progressive education theory and practice.\textsuperscript{10}

In 1985, the Colombian government adopted \textit{Escuela Nueva} as a national policy for rural primary schools. Flexible promotion and individualized instruction allows students to advance at their own pace. Students learn democratic behaviour by participating in student government. Mastery learning (peer instruction) is practiced as older students tutor younger students.\textsuperscript{11} UNICEF Colombia decided to reinforce a policy and strategy of education for peace, social mobilization and the psychosocial recovery of affected children and adolescents.

\textbf{The ‘Return to Happiness’ and Child Friendly Schools.}\textsuperscript{12}

The Return to Happiness Program was designed to provide urgent mass psychosocial support to children affected by violence. The crucial component to the program enabled families and communities to take part in the recovery process. Adolescent volunteers, supervised by teachers, were the key to the program. Young volunteers were trained in “play therapy” and taught how to encourage the trust and hope of younger children through games, art, puppetry, song and storytelling.
The ‘Return to Happiness’ program brought help to children in their own communities. The program broke with the western clinical model of psychosocial therapy by offering a community-based participatory approach. The child-to-child relationship, which was the foundation of the ‘Return to Happiness’ program, helped rebuild the children’s trust through play. Through their work as “play therapists” the adolescent volunteers come to serve as role models in their communities. They create a link between families, schools and communities, forming a network of reconstructive peace-building. The simplicity of the program is its cornerstone: children’s right to play.13

UNICEF played a key role, both as a catalyst for the Colombia Children’s Peace Movement and as facilitator of the ‘Return to Happiness’ program. In order to jumpstart the ‘Return to Happiness’ program, UNICEF sought partners in schools and communities, and among young people themselves. Alternative spaces were designated in churches and parks, under trees or in building kiosks that served as safe havens for use in ‘play therapy’. Many of the children who participated in the ‘Return to Happiness’ program also joined in the national children’s movement for peace.14

From the start, adolescents proved an to be ideal role models for the younger children. They consoled and supported each other. One volunteer, age 17, described his efforts to create a sense of normalcy in the lives of younger children,

“Some of the children have seen terrible things. If it is something very bad, like watching their father be tortured and killed, they find it very difficult to explain what happened. The story comes out in pieces and may take weeks to tell.”

Not only did the play sessions create open communication and trust in the relationship between adolescents and younger children, but the sessions also built self-esteem among the adolescent volunteers. Consoling younger children and helping them overcome their distress taught coping skills to the young volunteers.

The program demonstrated its success through improved relationships between teachers and children, and among the children themselves. This has contributed to the quality and relevance of the education curriculum. This is especially the case for the coordination with the other basic component of the IDP UNICEF/CFS/E strategy, the Escuelas Amigas de la Níñez (Child Friendly Schools).

The basic elements of ‘Return to Happiness’

The ‘Return to Happiness’ program reached out to children affected by the war – children who had lost their parents or their homes, or witnessed atrocities carried out against their communities.15 The program mobilizes:

• Adolescent volunteers from the community who become the ‘agents’ of psychosocial recovery.
• Parents, teachers, church volunteers, health workers, teachers and community leaders who assist the program as supervisors or trainers, and serve as self-help groups within the community.
• A “knapsack of dreams’ containing materials handmade by members of the community, including rag dolls, puppets, wooden toys, books and songs.
In the northwest of Colombia, refugees fled across the border into Panama, taking refuge in the border province of El Darien. Although humanitarian agencies had access to the refugee communities, there was a high risk of attack. In January 2003, attacks were carried out by paramilitary groups, resulting in the death of several indigenous community leaders. The vulnerability of the refugee communities in El Darien left children exposed to fear and violence.

In the displaced communities of El Darien, the ‘Return to Happiness’ program was integrated with “child-friendly spaces”. Child-friendly spaces were designated areas in displacement camps and communities that were set aside as a ‘safe haven’. They provided a location for the safe delivery of integrated services, such as infant feeding, nutritional support, hygiene, water and sanitation services, early childhood care, education, recreation and psychosocial support. A child-friendly space was informally constructed or simply set up outdoors, and marked with yellow tape.

Located close to the heart of the community, the child-friendly spaces in El Darien were seen as a kind of interior space, using human bodies as a shield. After only 6 months, more than 500 young people were trained as play therapists in the ‘Return to Happiness’ program. Although there is continued risk of violence in the refugee communities of El Darien, the program has contributed to a sense of security and brought new life to the children. On one occasion, when the community was threatened by an armed group, the priest prepared a letter about the situation and the children signed the letter, stating their neutrality.

Results: Colombian Child Friendly Schools

UNICEF emphasized the creation of new Child Friendly Schools as part of their education planning:

The Escuelas Amigas de la Niñez are becoming solid foundations as education experiences for acknowledging and enforcing children’s rights. In 2002, UNICEF has concentrated its efforts on the creation of Escuelas Amigas, supporting the introduction of changes in some existing public schools to promote equal rights for boys and girls, end discrimination, active individual and group learning, improvement of student relationships, and enhancing the participation of the community in the life of the school, while at the same time improving the breadth of academic objectives.

By the end of the year [2002], there were 131 transformed schools in 14 departments in various locations including the Bogotá, in which teachers, clerks, and other community leaders had been updated with the new approach. Overall the Escuelas Amigas had a 15% increase in school acceptance, 95% student continuity success that reached the schooling of 29,622 children. In 2003, the enrolment grew to about 38,000 children.

Cooperation between UNICEF and CELAM (the Latin American Episcopal Conference) was also long-standing. Its National Secretariat of the Social Pastoral in Colombia started the ‘Road to Health for Children.’ In 1987, the Children's Social Pastoral was founded. The creation of Escuelas Amigas, Child Friendly Schools, is a crucial partnership in the recovery of normal civic conditions in areas affected by violence.
The aim of the Child Friendly Schools was not only academic knowledge, scientific skills or any other standard that is the norm in a school in a region or city in peace. It insured children peace of mind, creativity, hope and initiative in the period leading toward greater internal stability. UNICEF, together with the Diocese, coordinated training of teachers to design methodologies rooted in children’s rights and in the participation of an organized community.

"The school is a privileged and fundamental space for the psycho-affective recuperation and socialization of children. For example, during the Colombian earthquake of 1999, workshops for teachers and other officials were set so as to unwind them, and then transfer techniques for a better communication with the affected children and help to heal their distress."22

5.4. Analysis of Lessons Learned

The strategy involved adolescents as a fundamental means to reconstruct the social network in communities affected by disasters. It included games and recreational components with well-structured objectives as tools to significantly increasing the quality of children’s communication.23 This methodology added simple, locally-based community interventions with the participation of the local government, health workers, the schools and parents.

The current heroes of humanitarian intervention treat emergencies as events to be managed by international actors.24 Traditional donor funding supports this view. It does not address the central objective of civil societies: learning how to inherit, improve and pass knowledge to the next generation. Instead, a culture of philanthropy in humanitarian circles is heavily biased towards the support of international NGOs.25 The Colombian experience of CFS/E, in contrast, was designed, managed and implemented by local actors. UNICEF’s child-friend strategies were cheaper and substantially more effective than international programmes elsewhere.

UNICEF’s ongoing and longstanding in-country presence allowed emergency responses to move beyond the purely medical approach. Child Friendly Spaces served both as a mobilizing instrument for peace, reconciliation and healing and as a central activity for the reconstruction of the human and social capital of a country in crisis. It worked because it was owned by people, not victims.

The program effectively changed the lives of many children. Young people who participated in ‘Return to Happiness’ were encouraged to stay in school. Some went on to a career in social work. The program also contributed to young people delaying marriage, in order to help the children of others. A number of those involved became leaders in their communities. All developed skills in communication and exercised their rights to participation and free expression. The greatest impact may be the enrichment of children’s lives and the creation of safer more supportive families and communities, even in the midst of war.26

2 The additional burden of their low schooling level made insertion into the urban or semi-urban labour market more complex. United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), La Población Desplazada por la Violencia en Bogotá, una Responsabilidad de Todos p.30. Bogotá July 2003.
5 Inter-American Commission On Human Rights (IACHR), Annual Report 2000 Chapter IV Colombia [Internet]. p. 79).
6 Internacional Organization for Migration (IOM), Diagnóstico sobre la población desplazada en seis departamentos de

8 Romero, Cesar. Cuestionario Atención Psicosocial: Respuestas a Questionnaire on Psychosocial Support Intervention(s). Bogota UNICEF n/d also see Atención psicosocial a niños y niñas afectados por el conflicto armado. Bogotá UNICEF n/d.

9 A UNESCO /LLECE study showed that against all predictions, Colombian rural schools showed better results than urban schools in the average of Latin America. This is mainly attributed to the quality factors and the school climate created by Escuela Nueva. See: LLECE, First International Comparative Study (Language Mathematics and Associated Factors) UNESCO/OREALC, Santiago de Chile, 2002.

10 Escuela Nueva differs from traditional schools in the following ways: it is multi-grade; it features flexible and not automatic promotion; special instructional materials are used such as self instructional textbooks; the curriculum is rural oriented; specially trained teachers are required; mastery learning or peer instruction is supported; study corners and small libraries are established; teachers, students and the community all become active participants in the school; and a student government is formed.


12 Most of this aspect of the report is based on: Siegrist, Saudamini, Colombia Case Study. UNICEF /EMOPS. New York. 24 August 2003.

13 Play dynamics help kids rediscover attachment. It includes games and recreational components with well-structured objectives as tools to achieve psychological and emotional recuperation in children, significantly increasing the quality of children’s communication.

14 To reach thousands of children in need, hundreds of volunteers were trained in only four weeks time. More than 500 young volunteers from 15 towns and villages were initially trained as play therapists. The young people learned how to recognise symptoms of stress in the children, to observe and communicate with them. Little by little, using toys and puppets as characters in their stories, they were able to build relationships and create a safe environment where children could express their feelings and begin to overcome the painful experiences of war.

15 "In rural areas 30 per cent of children drop out of school. " (UNHCHR, 28 February 2002, para. 118).


17 The community has used the symbol of the human hand to show their commitment to protect the children from harm. Each finger of the hand is raised in protection and identified with a particular quality associated with peace. These actions have created a local movement that is linked with the broader Colombia Children’s Peace Movement, combining psychosocial support with community-based actions for peace.


19 A plan for an integrated proposal on school quality is currently being developed based on the strength of these three initiatives. New quality standards were included in the public education policies of municipal, departmental and national education offices. UNICEF's long-term collegial relationships with Colombians have paid off well.


23 Quiroz, Nydia ' Children First: ' Organization and Recovery in Latin America.' Forced Migration Review .15. p. 13

24 Ibid.

25 "Rather than taking a strategic approach, relief organizations usually provide discrete, short term interventions not explicitly leveraged for sustainable income generation. Many such programs die in quiet obscurity after cameras leave and the rush for agency cash shifts to the next activity".


Chapter 6. Liberia Case Study

In this country there are more guns than books…
…Actually, we start seeing more cars than books!
(Senior Official - Ministry of Education - Liberia)

6.1. Background

Liberia has long been one of Africa's-and the world's-most troubling spots: the Economist magazine voted it the "worst place to live" in 2003. Western investment by Firestone and other rubber companies "served as the principal catalyst for Liberia's infrastructure." Workers, however, were paid little by the rubber companies, and their tribal chiefs received the first cut from their villagers' wages. Civil war and misgovernment destroyed much of Liberia's economy, especially the infrastructure in and around Monrovia. Richly endowed with water, mineral resources, forests, and a climate favourable to agriculture, Liberia was a producer and exporter of basic products - primarily raw timber and rubber. Liberia's worst times came in the past two decades, with rampant corruption and civil war.

According to J. P. Pham, Liberia failed as a nation state for a variety of reasons including tribal and ethnic tensions as well as the collapse of weak states propped up by the superpowers before the end of the Cold War.1 A final devastating impact of the war has been the massive displacement of Liberia's population.
In early 1995, the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) put the figures at over 850,000 refugees across West Africa (471,100 in Guinea, 360,000 in Côte d'Ivoire, 16,000 in Sierra Leone, 14,000 in Ghana and 4,200 in Nigeria), with over a million internally displaced and 150,000 dead. While these figures were very rough estimates, it was clear that the displaced represented a significant majority of Liberia’s 2.6 million pre-war populations. The process of displacement became continuous (See Table 2).

Table: 2 IDP sites and population in the different camps, June 2002

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>County</th>
<th>Sites</th>
<th>Population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Montserrado</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>102,057</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bong</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>46,916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kakata</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14,113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buchanan</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2,425</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ganta</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>16,753</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>182,264</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Liberia Refugee, Repatriation, Resettlement Commission, LRRRC, 25 June 2002

6.2. Key Contextual Considerations

During the last decade, Liberia’s illiteracy rates fell from 60% in the early 90s to close to 50% in early 2000. This rate was still alarmingly high, especially when compared to the average in sub-Saharan Africa, which was 38%. The MOE’s more recent data after years of violence and disruption of the schooling system suggested an even higher rate. The illiteracy rate among women was more than double that of men: 62% against 29%.

At a household level, poverty was the key factor for children’s exclusion from access to quality education. According to a UNICEF survey in 1999, 86% of those surveyed in Montserrado (one of the more developed counties) indicated that school fees were a key barrier to educational access. In comparison, 68% of people in the rural areas cited similar reasons. This interplay between poverty and social inequities led to the exclusion of vulnerable groups, especially girls.

According to a 2001 Monitoring Learning Achievement report, even if children completed primary education, only 42% attained the minimal levels of learning achievement, highlighting the poor quality of the education system. The low quality and participation rates of children in secondary education eroded the pool of skilled professionals. The results of the 1998-99 West African Evaluation Council (WAEC) examination showed that over 75% of all candidates from secondary schools in Liberia failed. This is not surprising considering that only 35% of Liberia’s teachers had official teaching credentials.

In response to this crisis, the MOE, supported by UNICEF and its partners, launched a Back to School Campaign starting in 2001 to respond to the immediate needs of the education sector. They trained education officers at central, district and community levels.
6.3. Stakeholders Involved, Roles and Interests

UNICEF was the only agency to fully support the Ministry of Education (MOE). From September to October 2002, there was an educational sector review to define the MOE’s role during the emergency response. The MOE led and co-ordinated the humanitarian response. UNICEF, in collaboration with OCHA, UNHCR, UNESCO, WFP and relevant NGOs, empowered the MOE to have a realistic and precise view of the education sector in the country, especially given its minimal operational capacity.

UNICEF set up Child Friendly Spaces in each of the newly-established IDP camps. They provided safe facilities for children to play, learn and acquire life skills. They also provided mothers with an area to care for their infants. Most importantly, the CFS/E provided a space where children experienced a degree of normalcy amid the chaos unfolding around them.

UNICEF also provided high energy and protein biscuits, dried skimmed milk, vaccines and essential drugs to SCF (UK), ACF and World Vision International for distribution to IDP's in Sawmill and Klay, as well as at the new sites in Montserrado, close to Monrovia, in order to provide a more integrated approach to the IDP schools.

6.4. Results

Liberia’s educational development in complex emergencies followed in two directions:

- **Child Friendly Spaces** developed during the civil confrontation in IDP and returnee camps
- The massive return to school through the *Back to School Campaign in 2003.*

**Child Friendly Spaces in IDP Camps**

In 2000, UNICEF recognized the massive unmet needs of the post-war reconstruction and the conflict in northern Liberia. It focused on revitalising and improving basic education with special attention to internally displaced children and youth, peace building and capacity development to the MOE and NGO partners. During that period, *Child Friendly Spaces* were established in four IDP camps (Brewerville area at Jah Tondo Town, Ricks Institute, Wilson Corner and Blama Cee.).

The CFS/E increased the protection of children, promoted the integration of child-related services, and enhanced better monitoring of services for children. School-in-a-box and recreation kits were provided with supplies including crayons, books, slates, teaching and recreation aids. This initial non-formal program provided children with literacy, numeracy, recreation activities and psychosocial support.

Many children who were in CFS/E were accepted into local private schools near the camps. Teachers benefited from a psychosocial program especially designed to help them manage their own personal trauma, while at the same time helping children.

**CFS/E partnerships**

The Accelerated Learning Program (ALP) condensed six years of formal primary school into three years. It was initiated in the CFS/E with the MOE support. Other projects included Liberia’s Crusaders for Peace. A national group, the Crusaders utilised sports, music, drama and traditional as well as modern dance as the means for psycho-social healing, peaceful conflict resolution, team-building and entertainment. These programs were incorporated into the daily routines of children.
The Federation of African Women Educators (FAWE), established in 1998 in Liberia, implementing a psychosocial program in the established Child Friendly Spaces to benefit abused female teachers and students.

UNICEF also supported Don Bosco Homes, Children’s Assistance Program, Community for Human Development Agency, Child Arts Liberia and Girls in Crisis to provide art, sports and recreation activities for 15,000 internally displaced children in four Child Friendly Spaces and 6 communities.¹⁰

---

**Review of the Accelerated Learning Program, ALP.**

By 2002, ALP was clearly unable to achieve its initial goals for the national emergency. An evaluation conducted by the MOE with UNICEF support revealed that the ALP’s approach was too formal and centralized. The attrition rate was high (32.6%) and the retention was low (barely 16%)¹¹. Consequently, it moved to a different model of Rapid Educational Response tested in containing a non-formal curriculum consisting of literacy, numeracy and life skills to be used within the realm of the IDP communities. The Teacher Guide was presented and discussed with the Education and Assistant Project Officers. The program had three tracks:

- Track one provided literacy and numeracy
- Track two provided basic life skills, psychosocial support and recreation for war affected children that had some experience of primary schooling
- Track three targeted young adults in IDP communities

The suggested time-frame for implementation was 24 weeks. It worked. This new curriculum was closely monitored to ensure an effective and improved response to the crisis. An important lesson learned from the Sierra Leone experience in displaced camps was the need for more systematic reviews.¹²

---

**The Back to School Campaign: A Rapid Educational Response**

In response to the dire education needs throughout Liberia, UNICEF helped the Ministry of Education launch the Back to School Campaign (BTS) on 3 November 2003. The BTS campaign aimed to return an estimated one million children to their classrooms by the end of 2004.

At the end of December 2003, 4,623 School-in-a-Box kits were distributed within the six accessible counties, providing school supplies for a total of 333,920 children. The second phase of School-in-a-Box distribution began at the end of January 2004. As of 30 April 2004, 7,275 School-in-a-Box kits were distributed within eight accessible counties, providing educational supplies for a total of 582,000 children. Finally, radio production and broadcasting proved to be the major vehicle for children’s participation in Liberia.

As part of BTS, the Teacher Orientation program reached 7,200 teachers between October and December 2003. These teachers returned to their classrooms, equipped with new skills in Rapid Educational Responses, including numeracy, literacy, sports and recreation, psychosocial and counselling principles, music and drama education.

UNICEF partners, including the Jesuit Refugee Service, the Danish Refugee Council and ADRA, developed teacher orientation workshops and reached more than 6,500 teachers as of June 2004.
The program aims to provide approximately 1,000,000 children by the end of 2004 with basic supplies so that they may be able to return to school after so many years of limited fulfilment of their right to education. The program builds national capacity in the Ministry of Education, which has not functioned properly in almost 14 years.

The Back-to-School Campaign supported the Ministry of Education in providing education services to primary and secondary school children in Liberia. The provision of supplies and equipment to schools, temporary schools and learning spaces, teacher kits and pupil's kits (school-in-a-box and recreation kit) was a major boost for the education sector. The establishment of temporary schools and learning spaces were priority activities. The project provided training for Education officers at Central, County and District levels, teachers, international and national NGO partners.

The revitalization of basic primary and secondary education was crucial for children’s return to normal life. The Back to School Campaign was also an opportunity to reduce the more than 30-percentage point gap in Gross Enrolment Rate between boys and girls. This included the establishment of a Girl’s Education Unit in the Ministry of Education as a long-term strategy, along with creating incentives for girls and families for girls’ attendance.

**Overall Objective**

To increase access to education for all children, especially the most vulnerable ones including children from 0 to 8 years old, girls, and children associated with fighting forces.

**Specific Objectives**

- Support for Girls’ Education to address gender imbalance;
- Emergency Support for the Ministry of Education;
- Provision of temporary learning spaces and emergency rehabilitation of some schools;
- Support for community participation and capacity building;
- Support for a major media campaign for social mobilization,
- Promotion of a safe and healthy learning environment

**The Rapid Assessment of Learning Spaces (RALS)**

RALS was an exercise intended to gather information on the enrolment and condition of all schools and learning spaces in Liberia. To undertake RALS, enumerators were recruited, trained and deployed in the accessible counties of Bomi, Margibi, Bassa, Montserrado, Cape Mount and Gbarpolu. A team was also sent to Bong County to assess schools and learning spaces in Salala District. Schools and learning spaces in Maryland, River Gee and Grand Kru Counties were also assessed with the help of NGOs operating in those areas. Enumerators visited each school and learning space and conducted an interview with the principal or administrators capable of providing the basic answers to questions on the assessment form.

They were required to inspect the enrolment record of schools/learning spaces, and the responses were used to determine the number of School-in-a-Box kits that would be received by each school. At the end of 2003, 2,037 schools/learning spaces were assessed with total enrolment of 573,339 students. About 75% of these schools received school supplies. The rest of the schools were served in January 2004. Finally, radio production and broadcasting proved to be the major vehicle for children’s participation in the BTS programme in Liberia.

Currently, the RALS database is located at the UNICEF premises given the absence of the minimum conditions at the MOE for the maintenance of a database. With enhanced infrastructure
in the MOE (i.e. regular power supply), the database technology including the software and hardware will be installed. In addition, ongoing support will be provided to further develop and refine the database as well as a system of monitoring and evaluation.

The revitalization of basic education was crucial for children’s return to normal life. The Back to School Campaign was also an opportunity to reduce the more than 30-percentage point gap in Gross Enrolment Rate between boys and girls. This included the establishment of a Girls’ Education Unit in the Ministry of Education as a long-term strategy, along with creating incentives for girls and families for girls’ attendance. To ensure the sustainability of BTS and the long-term strengthening of the education system, UNICEF provided materials and equipment, including computers, office supplies and generators to the Ministry of Education.

Liberian Seeds for Child and Youth Participation.

A total of 46 children (23 boys & 23 girls) from local levels and displaced camps participated in a meeting in Monrovia that led to the formation of the National Children’s Consultative Forum (NCCF). The NCCF had branches in the various counties and displaced centres and served as the mechanism for children’s participation in various activities, including the mobilization of children and their parents to participate in National Immunization Days. They also organized HIV/AIDS awareness and sensitization dialogues in their schools and communities, and formation of child rights clubs in schools. These activities were part of the action plan developed by the children themselves.

6.5. Analysis of Lessons Learned

- **UNICEF demonstrated its growing capacities to apply and customize good practices developed in other contexts.** These capacities were rapidly adapted to emergencies and their transitions.

- **UNICEF’s logistical capacities embedded quality into UNICEF’s child protection and educational responses.** The success of these efforts was clearly observed in the implementation of the Back to School Campaign. Copenhagen provided the basic tools needed to build minimum “spaces for education and recreation.”

- **An integrated basic curriculum incorporated the cognitive dimension (literacy/numeracy) and psychosocial support through playful environments.** Positive experiences developed in Liberia in the 80s by UNICEF had served as a model elsewhere but had been deleted from the local institutional memory. Their reintroduction reduced the costs borne by UNICEF and other partners.

- **UNICEF headquarters needs more systematic monitoring strategies that integrate successful country level programs into its more mainstream structures such as Child Friendly Spaces.** They need to be part and parcel of the Back to School Campaign strategy and the work of CFS/E in IDP Camps. In this way UNICEF’s increasingly integrated strategies across education, psychosocial support, and the protection of normal child development could be strengthened at relatively low cost.

- **The Liberian BTS Campaign linked to an evaluation and monitoring system (RALS) from its initial conception.** Further analysis of this instrument will be required in order to replicate it in other educational emergency situations.
3 World Bank, World Development Indicators 2003.
6 MOE, OP. Cit., 1999.
7 Thus, a strategy for reorienting the TT Institutes as a hub for starting and coordinating in-service training rather than accentuating pre-service, would be a cost-effective and outreaching approach. Pre-service could be transfer to Higher Education level institutions, i.e. Cuttington College. However, in-service should be related to career development and also should provide different levels of accreditation opening the door for further training and accreditation to a younger generation of "empirical" teachers with special emphasis on female teachers. This is a most immediate task in the process of reconstruction and capacity building for future development of the education system.
12 Full Report on the Plan International /UNESCO Institute for Education experience in
http://www.ginie.org/countries/SierraLeone Canadian Cooperation Award 2004: The Education Renewal Project in Sierra Leone. Plan International. In 1999, drawing upon the experiences of earlier programs implemented by UNESCO in Somalia and Rwanda, Foster Parents Plan (Plan) worked with Sierra Leone’s Ministry of Education, Science and Technology and the Forum of African Women Educationalists (FAWE) to create the Education Renewal project. In addition to basic literacy, it involved peace education and art therapy to reduce the children’s psychosocial trauma and promote peace building. The integration of peace education and trauma counselling were critical pieces of the curriculum.
13 No clear reporting existed to demonstrate how other sectoral aspects were included in the use of schools as important centres of integrated services. Systematic evaluation or lessons learned could not be located in UNICEF or other agency reports. UNICEF’s partner relationships were not assessed. For example, FAWE and Crusaders for Peace integrated their gender and healing activities into the IDP schools, but this was neither described nor assessed.
14 The experiences of IDP camps mobilized MOE technical and policy cadres to integrate the lessons learned with IDP children into the reconstruction of the educational system. The "Back to School Campaign", was in a way the "brain child" of the experience in the camps and later refined in terms of teacher training, teachers guides and curriculum.
Chapter 7. Gujarat Case Study

In the words of the Director for Primary Education of Gujarat:

*We were grappling with the situation and were not sure of where to begin with about restoration of primary schools. Our teachers were all engaged in providing support to the district administration for collecting information on damage to infrastructure and human losses. However, in all the discussions held for education sector, UNICEF was able to share the positive examples from other countries about using education to bring about social normalcy.* ¹, ²

7.1. Background

A massive earthquake struck Gujarāt on January 26, 2001. The earthquake registered 7.9 on the Richter scale, according to the United States Geological Survey. At least 17,000 people were killed in the quake, and more than 700,000 were left homeless. Early estimates valued the total damage at approximately US $1.2 billion. Over 12,000 schools, 800 Anganwadis Centres (Early Childcare Centres), and many health institutions were severely damaged.

In addition to the physical and material damage, the devastation caused by the earthquake directly affected nearly three million children and 2.5 million women. As many as 1,000 students were killed in Bhuj alone.³ An estimated 200,000 children enrolled in the schools in Kutch district were affected by the earthquake and nearly 800 schools had been damaged. According to the Indian Office for Disasters the situation called for a community based care for the entire region and specifically for the vulnerable. ⁴

Children's quake nightmares

Children arrived for medical treatment with chronic symptoms - diarrhoea, respiratory problems, and infections - all related to homelessness and bad living conditions.

Local paediatrician Dr Shantu Patel set up a crisis centre for children's health. “*Children are getting up and won't sleep under a shed,*” she said. “*Even then they're not sleeping in the tent. They want to go into the open!*”….. “*So, I think they will be claustrophobic. They're not going to stay in a closed space. The fear that something's going to fall on them….They are getting up with nightmares and won't go back to sleep. I have seen people and children who have lost immense weight. I couldn't recognize some of my patients.*” In small children, hysterical laughter can sound very close to crying. On the surface children seem very resilient, but as the shattered society starts the slow task of recovery it may be the children who bear some of the worst scars.


7.2. Key Contextual Considerations

The First Emergency Response

The main initial focus of UNICEF efforts was the supply of basic necessities and the early restoration of basic social services: health care services, early childhood care services, primary education, water supply and sanitation, psychosocial support and child protection. This included a cluster strategy, whereby goods and services related to health and education were gathered at one point in the community. These focal points were established in 3,000 primary schools, sub-health centres, covering nearly 15,000 families. UNICEF also supported the installation of toilets and at least one water point in all of the two thousand rehabilitated schools.

A major effort was made to get children back to school quickly, in order to prevent drop-out
and re-establish some normalcy in their lives. UNICEF helped to reopen more than 2,000 damaged schools by 14 June, by providing 8,000 tents and education kits for about 300,000 children and 12,000 teachers, targeting preschools, health centres and schools. More than 400,000 children were going back to school for the first time in Gujarat. As the result of an unprecedented joint effort by the Government of Gujarat and UNICEF, over 2,000 schools were fully equipped and re-opened within 5 months after the earthquake UNICEF distributed nearly 8,000 tents, 32,000 tables and chairs for the teachers, 8000 blackboards, hundreds of thousands of school bags, pencils, crayons, thousands of teaching materials, family kits for the teachers and recreation kits.

The Country Representative said that psychosocial support to traumatized children was an innovative and highly successful intervention. Over 1,400 teachers and 250 NGO volunteers were trained by UNICEF. Through simple activities such as stories, songs and plays, they reached out to 124,000 children.

7.3. Stakeholders Involved, Roles and Interests

A review of partnerships indicates that the key partners for planning and implementation were the government counterparts and NGOs already working in the country. After the earthquake most of them mobilized shelter construction, livelihood related activities and child protection centres.

Partnership established with the Teacher's Union. This went a long way to ensure that educational activities were resumed as early as possible. Following the earthquake the teachers in the district were directed to support relief activities, disburse cash doles and assess damage. Despite early resistance, a dialogue was established with the Union regarding the importance of opening schools as soon as possible. The Union responded by giving a call to the Teachers to ensure that children did not lose out. More importantly, the Union members and the teachers expressed their relief at being able to get back to taking care of schools instead of the relief activities.

NGOs mobilized communities to create spaces to erect tents and set up tented schools. They also organized enrolment drives. NGOs partnered for psychosocial interventions. UNICEF’s support for psychosocial/recreation interventions was in the primary schools. The NGOs focused on capacity building for communities. The partnerships with NGOs strengthened both school–community linkages and the village education committees (VECs).

7.4. Results

As agreed in a common Restoration Plan, the Government of Gujarat, the State Education Department and UNICEF defined a Child Friendly Spaces (CFS) strategy based on lessons learned in Turkey:

Since the schools had been closed following the quake, the foremost challenge was timely restarting of schools in the second week of June which happened to be the official beginning of the new academic year for the primary schools. This meant providing access to schools, equipping them and ensuring that schools function regularly. The strategies adopted to address the above challenges was restoration of schools as early as possible in temporary shelters (tents) and provide a safe haven for children and ensure that children are able to resume their normal activities.

Planning the Medium and Long Term

The restoration of schools was planned in phases. This unique plan not only included the relief phase, it also looked at long-term interventions that would increase the quality of education.
This phased restoration was developed in consultation with the Education Department. The phases identified were:

- Setting up temporary structures for the schools.
- Initiation of education activities and community mobilization.
- Improve educational quality and develop schools as agents of social change.

The overall objective of UNICEF’s support in this emergency situation was to ensure children and women’s survival, well being and fulfilment of their basic rights. *For the Education sector the core commitment was the establishment of ‘safe environments’ for children for learning, recreation and psychosocial support.*

The Plan for Restoration was launched considering the following immediate steps for action:

- Database on infrastructure damage in consultation with the Department of Education
- Planning for temporary school shelters
- Based on consultations with the Department of Education and lessons from the Turkey experience of child friendly spaces, it was decided to equip the tents with education materials, drinking water and sanitation, recreation materials and family support kits for teachers
- Distribution and supply monitoring plan
- Development of a monitoring and assessment system with indicators that help to measure inputs, process of implementation and outputs

This instrument is unique and should be further reviewed and considered as a valuable tool to be used in future emergencies and in the construction of a strategy for integrated responses (See Annex1).

**Initiating the actions and establishing a coordinating system**

The setting up of the temporary shelters was done in a phased manner. In the initial phase the Cluster Resource Centres (CRC) were established, as these were the nodal places where teachers were reporting to after the closure of schools following the earthquake. The clusters then facilitated the establishment of the schools in the cluster and became the designated point for the dispatch of supplies.

Nearly 2,300 schools were established in temporary shelters facilitating access to nearly 400,000 children across 17 worst affected blocks.

**The Evaluation in the Aftermath of the Earthquake**

The Kutch District had 1,400 primary schools. It ranked extremely low on social development indicators compared with the rest of the districts in the state. The NER of the district is around 85%, which is lower than that of the state (93%) as a whole. Only 40% of the students were girls. One fifth of the teachers’ positions were continuously vacant because there were too few trained teachers ready to work in this district. Despite all efforts towards filling up vacancies with para-teachers (*Vidya Sahayaks*), the intake was much less than the target. The school supervision system was also inadequately staffed. 20% of the School supervisors’ positions were consistently vacant.

The temporary shelters for schools prevented a lost academic year. The tented schools helped overcome children’s fears about unsafe buildings and restored the confidence of school professionals to run the schools in the face of such a calamity. The enrolment rates in 2001 were comparable to any normal year in the region (80%). Program monitoring data for December 2001
indicated that 90% of the schools were functional.

In the discussions with the district education officials and school teachers, the peer review team observed that the support was provided with speed and in a timely manner. It was clearly evident from the discussions that this support was crucial for a timely start to schools. This ensured that the new academic session could start of as scheduled in June 2001. It was also observed that the quality of school kits for teachers and children, tents, music and recreation kits helped in increasing the credibility of the organization and setting standards.

The district level administration organized relief and rehabilitation activities through Education Sector Groups. The members were local NGOs, international NGOs and district level officials. UNICEF was designated as the Co-coordinator for Education Sector.

In the initial Education sector meetings UNICEF and others shared field assessment reports with government officials (see Box). UNICEF made a significant contribution of in terms of tents, blackboards, notebooks, pens/pencils, slates, charts, floor mats, and school bags for children in nearly 2,300 schools.

According to the President of the Teacher’s Union, the key factor for success was the special provision made for providing family kits to 6,000 of the most affected teachers. The affected teachers were also encouraged to use the tents supplied for schools as their temporary shelter. These activities enabled teachers to initiate educational activities.

Going to scale

UNICEF’s CFS strategy was conceived in the form of temporary shelters, mainly in tents and with materials suitable for children. These schools were called summer schools. Nearly 50,000 children participated in these summer schools in 300 cluster resource centres. UNICEF’s strategy of child friendly spaces was constructed on a large scale. For the first time trauma counselling was provided to children and teachers in the quake affected areas. Extensive discussions with the Education Department highlighted the need to provide psychosocial support for affected children. Initially school officials were reluctant to introduce psychosocial interventions in 700 schools (see Box).

In the words of the Director of the Gujarat teacher training programme:

This was something new for us. It was always assumed that people are culturally resilient and they would anyway recover. It was only after the field reports and my visit to Kutch where I realized that teachers and children were under stress and fear due to the aftershocks. The psychosocial interventions became important. And now it is being considered that this would be introduced as a part of the curriculum for the pre-service teachers.

UNICEF support was sought for tents, water and sanitation facilities, recreation kits and music kits for these camps. Summer schools provided CFS that engaged children in active learning and served as a bridge back into the regular schools. School teachers evaluated the summer schools as a special opportunity for healing.

The Distribution and Supply Monitoring Plan was successful. By summer CFS were established in nearly 7300 tents in nearly 2300 villages. These tented schools were equipped with education kits for children and teachers, music kits, games kits and books for children and adults. These tented schools also had adequate drinking water and sanitation facilities. Teachers were encouraged to use these spaces for their own shelter.
The curriculum for the summer schools included teaching literacy and supplemental content about the environment, health, hygiene and recreation. This multi-purpose curriculum was suitable for different ages. An important aspect of the summer school curriculum included the larger community. These activities included traditional songs, folk and performing art to reach out to parents and the community.

A core list of content areas was identified, educational resource materials were identified and a handbook was prepared. This was followed up with a training of volunteer teachers. More than 650 teachers participated. The summer school functioned from the first week of May until the end of June when the regular schools reopened.

**Psychosocial interventions**

There was no local expertise to address the immediate trauma-counselling needs of the large numbers of children and teachers who were affected. Fortunately, traditional family support systems provided immediate coping mechanisms. For example, unaccompanied and single parent children were supported by villagers and extended families.

UNICEF, in partnership with government agencies, initiated psychosocial interventions in the primary schools of the four worst affected blocks (sub-districts) of the Kutch district. It covered 78 school clusters, extending services to 721 village schools. The Psychosocial Support Project strategy was integrated with the restoration of the primary education system. It established a training team, sensitizing and orientating teachers to trauma symptoms and psychosocial interventions.

*School interventions proved so successful that the Education Department decided to include psychosocial interventions and related knowledge as part of pre-service teacher training programs.*

A psychosocial orientation for teachers also improved the quality of teaching and learning. Mainstreaming psychosocial interventions would improve the quality of education. On the basis of the recent assessment conducted, emphasis should be on classroom activities.

Promoting reading among children was identified as an area of immediate concern. In Kutch, this problem was more acute because the local dialect was different. Teacher orientations to the dialect were needed.

**School-community linkages**

School-community linkages were identified as an important area of intervention for the success of any of the objectives related to schools. According to the State Project Director, village education committees (VECs) had been formed in the affected areas in December 2000, following a decision to constitute these committees in all the village schools in state.

A cross section of the teachers (70%) who were interviewed on the VECs and their functioning indicated that the VECs had played an active role in the enrolment drives undertaken every year before the reopening of the school in the earthquake affected areas. 60% of the teachers also indicated that they could observe a perceptible change in the involvement of the community in the school activities. The example quoted was that the community had willingly donated land in the village for new schools to be constructed. Another 55% of the teachers shared that community and VECs maintained the schools and there were some efforts to ensure basic amenities for the children.
Impact Evaluation on Participation and Quality in CFS

The evaluation team observed teachers actively involved with children, making teaching and learning interesting. Teaching aids were used where required. In the schools visited, reading corners/school libraries were seen and materials were accessible to children. Student work was also displayed on the walls. Teaching plans were also displayed on the walls and were being used.

The team also observed that there was active community involvement in school development, enrolment and follow-up was evident in the discussions with the members of the village education committees. The VECs were aware of their roles mainly in ensuring enrolment of children and development of school infrastructure.

School construction and Child Friendly Spaces

UNICEF supported the construction of 169 schools, using it as an opportunity to demonstrate the concept of child friendly spaces. The first buildings were designed to be cyclone and earthquake resistant. This highlighted the importance of safe and secure learning environments. Equity issues were also important. Some of the different features of the schools included ramps for the physically challenged, separate toilets for boys and girls, drinking water facilities, fencing, and school furniture for both children and teachers. Children were engaged in planting trees and growing school gardens wherever possible. Schools were also used to demonstrate water conservation.

One hundred sixty-nine (169) schools (610 classrooms) were built using child friendly learning spaces. As of date, 130 schools were handed over to the government. The new infrastructure showed a positive impact on both enrolment and attendance. The review team thought these schools could serve as useful models to demonstrate child friendly spaces by providing toilets for boys and girls, school gardens, play areas and clean drinking water.

Finally, the review team recommended the documentation of stakeholders' perceptions and the impact of the new infrastructure on enrolment attendance and communities' response.

7.5. Analysis of Lessons Learned

- Introducing disaster preparedness and management into the Education and Social Program for the State. The schools provided a critical means for recovery, thus reinforcing previous experiences in emergencies. The State Education Department was not prepared to deal with the disaster. The earthquake led to the understanding that a minimum level of preparedness for the education department was necessary to ensure the safety of teachers. Stockpiled materials were necessary to set up child friendly spaces and restart schools as early as possible.

- An assessment of the capacity of the various counterparts was critical, especially when operating on a large scale. The appointment of program and logistical monitors by UNICEF greatly facilitated the tracking and distribution of supplies. Similarly program monitors provided data about crucial services in social sectors such as schools, health centres and availability of water.

- Reporting and monitoring systems for activities were especially needed in disaster situations. UNICEF program monitors provided critical feedback on key indicators such as school functioning, student and teacher attendance, availability of education materials in schools, and the provision of drinking water and sanitation facilities. To provide continuity, a district
level coordination and monitoring committee was set up to help overcome the myriad of problems created by too few local professionals and inadequate training.

- **Trauma interventions in schools were a necessary part of educational planning at the district level.** There is a need for developing a strategy for providing psychosocial support to the affected population following any disaster. The summer schools were rapidly established because of the lessons learned in other CFS (Turkey, Colombia, and Northern Caucasus etc.).

- **The restoration of the education infrastructure required a longer term perspective.** UNICEF’s CFS needs to better incorporate school design into its long-term strategy. The attraction of community participation in the school should have been better considered.

- **Activity-based learning materials were needed in every classroom.** These included worksheets, workbooks developed on the basis of the textbook content providing self-learning materials. Prior CFS experience demonstrated that activity-based learning was particularly suited for traumatized children who had difficulty sitting quietly in regular classrooms. Learning teams from different CFS countries should share ideas.

---

2 Ibid. Para. 4.1.4 Creating child friendly spaces.
4 India disasters.org.
9 Ibid.
10 UNICEF. Gujarat State Office. Peer review report on Emergency Response in Education Sector 12-14 August, 2003, para. 3.5.4 Outcomes.
11 A systematic documentation of the impact of new infrastructure had yet to be completed.
Conclusions

Strengths of CFS/E

Appropriateness: how does the model respond to the context and specific problems detected?

This rigorous and flexible ‘child-friendly’ approach based on child-focused, community-based and government supported strategy is a most appropriate institutional response for UNICEF before, during and after emergencies. Child Friendly Spaces/Environments (CFS/E) emerged as UNICEF’s most coherent operational strategy to meet its core commitments for children in emergencies and their aftermath.

- **CFS/E was developed by UNICEF to directly address, perhaps for the first time in international humanitarian work, the problems created when children and their families were the targets of war.**
  
  CFS/E is the only proven UN-based strategy that embeds education into security and humanitarian operations using integrated services focused on both child survival and the protection of children's development. Developed by UNICEF staff and partners in the field during the civil wars and natural disasters of the 1990s, it evolved into a rapid response to humanitarian crises involving large numbers of civilians, most of them mothers and children.

- **CFS/E works closely with families and communities to ensure that its ‘webs of protection’ extend from home to the schoolhouse door and beyond.** Its concrete focus on both children's health and learning helps pull devastated communities together to protect their family’s futures. It is designed to support family efforts to care for their children during emergencies and their aftermath. It works with governments to ensure safe environments for children to heal and learn. These integrated services coordinate education with physical and food security, water and sanitation, and health care for trauma and healing.
  
  A CFS/E school, for example, offers a physical ‘space’ where other forms of programmatic services to children converge, offering adequate care in terms of not only learning and psychosocial support for trauma healing but also health, nutrition, sanitation and in general creating a ‘protective environment.’ CFS/E anchors local and international partnerships, even in the most difficult situations. For example, UNICEF worked with NATO in the design for safe spaces for Kosovar children was critical to the development of the CFS/E in Albania. The primary contribution of CFS/E clearly demonstrates the consistent, fundamental and indivisible relationship of education and the necessity for the protection of children’s development and learning in insecure communities.

- **CFS/E’s integrated services approach creates more effective and lower cost responses unavailable to shorter-term, more traditional sector-based responses.** UNICEF’s continuing ‘presence’ on the ground uniquely positions it not only for emergency ‘events,’ but also for longer-term chronic crisis conditions.
  
  o In Colombia, UNICEF’s in-country presence increased preparedness. Its long-term participative relationships with local NGOs helped to create a network culture of low-cost innovation in child security to meet rapidly shifting conditions. These non-formal networks were able to respond more quickly to security lapses than the national government.
  
  o The Northern Caucasus project created “webs of support” during chronic crises within and across governments and NGOs.
In Albania, the ministry of education incorporated cost-effective integrated service delivery into post-emergency planning.

- The implementation of safe environments for children and their mothers/caregivers has contributed to the development of operations standards with the UN and its partners in both international and local communities. It established links with education and psychosocial support and other sectors such as water and environmental sanitation (WES), nutrition, health and physical planning.

- CFS/E’s visible and transparent approach to programming appropriately addresses donor concerns for accountability. The spaces become centres for both family survival and the renewal of individual community dignity.

CFS/E provides essential continuity for traumatized children and their families through longer term institutional reforms more appropriate to post-emergency conditions. For example, governments and communities may lack adequate resources for economic recovery. Traditional sectoral reconstruction projects often cannot be appropriately ‘digested’ in communities with a collapsed physical and social infrastructure. CFS/E’s focus on youth service to the renewal of civil society, as in Colombia, may provide opportunities for youth to avoid gang recruitment for a relatively low cost.

Coherence: how does the model fit with UNICEF policy and international standards?

- CFS/E’s strength is its strategic coherence in the field. This strength is built on its capacities for clarity of focus and continuity of purpose. Successful strategy creates a conceptual framework can be learned quickly and used effectively in high risk conditions. It operational success depends on continuous communications and innovation to meet shifting local circumstances. CFS/E stays focused on the protection of children, their development and learning. This focus on children demanded continuing support for mobile families. Webs of supported follow children and their caregivers.

- CFS/E is the only coherent, operational and proven strategy for education in emergencies to date. It was developed in the field by UNICEF as the lead UN agency for the protection and overall well-being of children. Its strategic focus grew out of necessity in both natural disasters and armed conflicts.

CFS/E has the capacity to mobilize these webs of support through emergency preparedness and response. CFS/E’s greatest strength is its unique capacity to extend their webs of integrated service support into post-crisis renewal. Many resources are wasted in post-emergency planning because of a profound collapse of imagination by both international donors and local governments. Governments rush to restore institutions to the way they were ‘before the event.’ This is inevitably a tragic mistake because neither the children nor their families can be restored to their pre-disaster experience. CFS/E offers an alternative more appropriately suited for children, families and their communities that face emergency related challenges for many years to come.

- CFS/E’s respectful, holistic approach to children, their families and communities during humanitarian interventions addresses a core mission of the UN, the fundamental right to the humanitarian protection of individual dignity, generational continuity and the prevention of genocide. It is also consonant with UNICEF’s commitment to the basic rights of children to protection by their families and communities, as expressed in the Convention on the Rights of the Child: for example, the right
to play (Article 31); the right to voice their opinion and participate (Articles 12-15); the right to health and education (Articles 23-25, 39). For example, the program effectively mobilized strong partnerships among NGOs, religious groups, school officials, local government officials, health officials and young people.

- CFS/E coherently operationalises the current Medium Term Strategic Plan’s (2002-2005 MTSP) adoption the prevention of violence, abuse and neglect, exploitation and discrimination of children as one of UNICEF’s organizational priorities.
  - As a result, there are now fewer small-scale projects with limited impact. There is a greater emphasis on systemic changes that address factors such as legislation that provides children access to schools that act as partners with families and communities.
  - CFS/E proved to be focussed and flexible in both armed conflicts and natural disasters. linking forward in the emergency aftermath to educational renewal through UNICEF’s Child Friendly Schools (CFS) and its emerging development initiatives in Child-Friendly Cities.

Effectiveness and coverage: how does the model influence achievement of programme objectives and affect programme coverage? How were linkages at community level established with local authorities?

CFS/E’s effectiveness stems from UNICEF’s unique organizational capacities to provide rapid, integrated and continuous responses to support mobile children and their caregivers over time.

The ‘Child Friendly Spaces’ were particularly innovative in the Northern Caucasus, Colombia and Gujarat because they:

- Provided continuity across emergency preparedness, interventions and renewal
- Simultaneously constructed and operated camp or community-based school and spaces. The CFS/E model also served to help conventional schools and related civil society organisations to integrate large displaced populations.
- Integrated the efforts of international and national NGOs under the umbrella of the Ministries of Education and/or Ministries of Social Welfare while still providing a certain space for independence and neutrality.
- Re-centred education strategy around child protection activities that transitioned families and communities from the emergency situation into the process of reconstruction.
- The programmes in Northern Caucasus, Colombia and Gujarat were adopted by governments as a model for national or regional educational reform and community participation.
- CFS/E has been able to provide, with variable degrees of success, quality education and trans-national planning for IDP or refugee children in complex emergencies. The parameters of quality in the case of humanitarian education are not purely related to cognitive outputs but need to be associated to the fact that education also becomes an instrument for rehabilitation and the psychosocial recovery of future generations affected by the horror of armed conflict and/or natural disasters.
Sustainability/Connectedness: how does the model link to longer-term initiatives? What conceptual or institutional links are established within the country programme or with partners? What is the participation of families and children?

- An additional critical achievement has been CFS/E’s creation of national capacities to respond to psychosocial trauma. UNICEF has also provided emergency preparedness training for sustained capacity building in this area in Turkey, Chechnya, Ingushetia, Gujarat, Liberia and Colombia and other countries outside the scope of this review. The use of trauma healing as part of the CFS/E initiative, using schools as the medium for protective spaces, has increasingly become a UNICEF ‘trade mark’ and is well recognized among partners in the field.

- CFS/E learned that while “stand alone protection activities” that provide advocacy vis a vis the governments and within civil society can be very valuable in cases of social turmoil and war, the element of child protection also needs to be coupled and integrated into human rights based approaches to programming. For example, the problem of child soldiers cannot be addressed appropriately through stand alone activities.

The CFS/E model links to longer term initiatives in all countries under review. Conceptual or institutional links were established with country programs, with international partners, and with mainstream national services (supported by UNICEF). In all cases the CFS/E experience explicitly encouraged the participation of youth, teachers and families:

- Certain operational aspects of the CFS/E had long-term impacts on short term emergencies like Turkey and Albania. The Turkish Ministry of Education created a capacity for psychosocial support for the overall school-aged population. Albania incorporated a youth mobilization strategy developed during the refugee crisis into national programs for community development.

- The main lesson learned from the Northern Caucasus experience was that CFS/E became an important operational model that was mainstreamed into the governmental systems of the two republics. Unlike the sectoral manner used in the psychosocial sector in Turkey, the CFS/E in the Northern Caucasus used an integrated human rights based approach.

- The success of the Colombian CFS/E is very much linked to existing long-term rural education programmes in Colombia. Much of the basic concept of the Child Friendly Schools in IDP areas as well as the healing attributes of the "Return to Happiness" youth mobilization programme are linked to a child-centred and community-based approach such as Escuela Nueva. In this particular case, the integrated approach grew out mainly from a successful ‘home-grown’ experience.

Constraints and Opportunities

Monitoring and Evaluation:

- Evaluation of operations remains mostly discursive and descriptive, based on observation and on internal financial reporting which was difficult to access for this review. In most cases, information is more anecdotal than based on hard facts. Ad hoc appraisal fielded by UNICEF or other partners are normally based on short periods of observation and interviews, but they are not necessarily objective.
UNICEF’s assessment, monitoring and evaluation is still tacitly geared towards donor-focused accountability. However, taking a purely quantitative approach is not adequate. For instance, counting immunizations is necessary but insufficient. It is also necessary to assess the consequences of traumatizing experiences on children’s development and learning, design safe places for interventions, and leave strong legacies for government and community self-reliance.

This review confirms that UNICEF needs stronger tools for field evaluation. These include reliable and measurable indicators, benchmarks and guidelines for planning. However, two good practices on monitoring and continuous evaluation of the CFS/E experiences are noted below. These should be further studied and assessed. They constitute important efforts that should be systematized and incorporated into future emergency and reconstruction operations:

- The Rapid Assessment of Learning Spaces (RALS) that was used in Liberia by UNICEF and the MOE as the monitoring system for the Back to School campaign. (see Case study on Liberia).
- The Gujarat evaluation and monitoring system developed jointly between the Government of Gujarat and UNICEF India (see Annex 1)

The desk review revealed that the reporting did not show much data disaggregated by gender. It was difficult to assess how the CFS/E may have affected girls and boys differently. It was not possible to analyse through the data available the ways in which the CFS/E addressed girls’ needs specifically.

Planning and Programming

- The desk review indicates very important progress in the definition of the logistics and the physical standards for child friendly spaces. This successful in-house capacity for rapid response and logistic support is matched with the improved cost effectiveness of an integrated response. However, a set of more systematic guidelines for planning would be helpful. Such guidelines would contribute enormously to the human rights approach to planning. They would help CFS/E to become more effective as a valid and replicable contribution of UNICEF in complex emergencies and rehabilitation.

- Physical rehabilitation of schools during the implementation of CFS/E is another aspect that needs to be further reviewed. In some cases, the opportunity was lost to integrate a child friendly methodology when reconstructing schools. UNICEF should take advantage of the possibilities of providing technical advice and leadership on using a child-friendly approach (including community participation spaces, adequate hygiene and sanitation, nutrition, and so forth) into the design of the new schools.

- There is a need to develop adequate standards for emergency spaces for the CFS/E. The case of Turkey remains an important example of good practice.

- There is also a need to further develop innovative building codes and standards for child friendly spaces during the phase of rehabilitation and reconstruction. As demonstrated in this review, schools constituted the central sheltering place for children and their families during the emergency. It is essential to incorporate adequate spaces for community participation and child protection into construction codes for future schools, as they have a considerable value in the process of preparedness, especially in the aftermath of natural disasters.
• The psychosocial approach of CFS/E should not be limited to those affected by emergencies. Others may benefit, too, such as those sectors of society affected by extreme poverty and social marginalization. The possibilities for the replication of this approach on larger scales and with diverse populations should be explored further, especially in light of the process of achieving the MDGs.

Partnerships and Coordination

• UNICEF needs to build on the strengths of its continuing country and regional presence. This means increased attempts to build partnerships with NGOs in the field who share this continuing presence, especially for emergency and post-emergency preparedness and renewal. It also needs to recognize the importance of mobilizing and training local expertise from the government and civil society in countries in crisis. The cases of Colombia and Gujarat stand up at present as proud ‘national’ examples of good practices that are being and should be replicated by neighbouring countries, with the support of UNICEF (Caribbean countries affected by hurricanes and South Asian countries affected by earthquakes and the recent Tsunami).

• In all cases under review, the CFS/E approach has been encouraging for creating a window of opportunity for change and modernization of educational and child protection strategies. UNICEF needs to give more systematic follow up and by providing technical assistance in order to streamline the rich diversity of interventions implemented by partners during the emergency. It should also support governmental partners by training their planners, supervisors and teachers, in order to mainstream the CFS/E integrated and child-centred approach into the stage of reconstruction.

Next Steps

Practice to Policy

The most important next steps are to begin to integrate the CFS/E approach more coherently into institutional operations policy and structure.

1. CFS/E needs to be represented with UNICEF on the Inter-Agency Standing Committee (IASC) as soon as possible so that it can help with operational coordination and standards setting.

2. CFS/E’s unique role in working with governments needs to be strengthened through stronger cooperation between global CSF/E staff specialists and the ongoing regional and national presence of UNIEF programs. This coordination can be best accomplished at the regional level. UNICEF’s regional capacities need to be strengthened so that it can better provide outreach support for government and NGO partners. Activities should include telecommunications planning for emergencies, education and health training, as well as evaluation research and planning for child-focused, and community-based integrated services in and outside of school. Regional hubs should be Internet linked to internal partners and to UNICEF hubs in other regions. The first regional hub should be built in a region with an existing track record for cooperation.

Policy to Strategy
The next most important steps are to *integrate CFS/E into a larger, more coherent institutional Child Friendly strategy through links with Child Friendly Schools and Child Friendly Cities.* This larger strategy will strengthen UNICEF’s unique position as the lead agency for children in the international community.

CFS/E staff should develop partnerships with universities and other organizations interested in Child Friendly approaches to emergency preparedness, interventions and *especially institutional renewal.*

- A global public policy study group should be quickly initiated in cooperation with UNICEF headquarters and the Innocenti Center to further the study of child-friendly strategy that integrates CF Schools, CFS/E and CF Cities. There should be a strong emphasis on the translation of CFS/E’s integrated services into sustainable civil infrastructure.

- The group should also be charged with the design of lower cost continuous consultations with group members using multi-channel telecommunications. This approach could quickly lower the cost of emergency preparedness and planning.
Bibliography


_____. ‘Hoy los Niños de Urbá…’, (www.geocities.com/EnchantedForest/Creek/8238/4urab.htm), Sitio Web n.d.


REDEPAZ, ‘Cien Territorios De Paz - Cartilla Pedagógica’, REDEPAZ, (www.redepaz.8m.net/Documentos/Pedagogica.doc), n.d.

_____. ‘Construyo La Paz Proyecto: Cien Municipios De Paz’, REDEPAZ, (www.redepaz.8m.net/Documentos/Metodologica.doc), n.d.

Relief Web, ‘When the war came and met me and my family” - Helping Vera at a Child Friendly Space’, Relief Web, (www.reliefweb.int/rw/rwb.nsf/AllDocsByUNID/f386bf71ed8e22cfc1256d2e0052bcb9), May 2003.


UNHCR supports national institutions to enhance IDP protection', Relief Web, (www.db.idpproject.org/Sites/idpSurvey.nsf/wViewCountries/85F8AEF7E476441EC1256841004F6122), 2003.


La niñez colombiana en Cifras, United Nations Children's Fund,


World Bank, World Development Indicators 2003.


Yule, W., ‘Alleviating the Effects of War and Displacement on Children’, Traumatology, Vol.8, No.3 (September 2002).
ANNEX 1: Planning for Child Friendly Spaces. (Gujarat Ministry of Education)

Lessons learned in the emergency programme

In this section the attempt is out together the main learning's and insight about how things happened in the emergency programme.

1. The need to assess the capacity of the concerned sector department to address the emergency

As has been amply highlighted, the Education department did not appear to have any plan to address such large-scale emergencies. From all the interviews it came across that it was never anticipated that such a situation could even arise. However the outcome of this experience is that the counterparts have become aware of the steps to be considered for addressing the issue of education of children. As a part of its endeavour to improve the preparedness at school level, the education department is undertaking an exercise to include disaster preparedness as part of school curricula. A high level committee has been set up at State level for this purpose and UNICEF has been designated as one of the members of this committee.

2. Schools for restoring normalcy

It has emerged from the experience following the earthquake and the restoration process that schools provide one of the important means of recovery and social normalcy. This has only reinforced the learning's from the previous experience of emergencies. Considering that Education department did not have the preparedness to deal with the situation created by the earthquake, the need for preparedness for restarting schools and developing them as safe haven for the children has been highlighted. It has also led to the understanding that a minimum level of preparedness for the education department is necessary in terms of ensuring the safety of teachers, stockpiling of the materials necessary for setting up of child friendly spaces and restarting schools as early as possible.

3. Child friendly spaces

An important learning, which has happened, is that following a disaster, it is the children who being the most vulnerable require the most attention. While the adults are involved in rebuilding their lives and setting up shelters and looking for livelihood, the children usually are without the space for activities familiar to them. The vulnerability of children could be reduced through the provisions of child friendly spaces. In this emergency the tented schools became the safe haven for the children in particular and community at large. It has been realized that a greater awareness has to be built among the community through the capacity building of village education committees and panchayat on need for and setting up of child friendly spaces.

4. Developing of a monitoring system for reporting on school activities in a disaster situation

In the events following the earthquake, there were many constraints in obtaining information from the field regarding the situation. Despite the education department's efforts of asking teachers to report to their respective from where there salaries are disbursed, the system was unable to have regular information on the developments in field situation. Subsequently, in the event of the education supplies arriving for the 2300 schools, the department did not have the capacity to distribute and monitor the receipts at the end user level (in this case the schools) and finally the establishment of schools.
This has led to highlighting the need for the department to institute monitoring mechanisms, which support the existing ones.

5. Psychosocial interventions

It was realized that despite the inherent coping mechanisms of the affected population, it was important to build capacities of the service providers such as teachers and personnel of early child care centres to understand the impact of disasters on children. An important lesson which emerged that these interventions should be started immediately and that optimum support could be provided if the community and the service providers are equipped with the requisite knowledge. In this disaster, the systems had inadequate understanding of this area of intervention and valuable time was required to be utilized in building capacities of teachers and other service providers before initiating the interventions.

Table of sample inputs outputs and outcomes and indicators used for verifying the progress of implementation of CFS.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Inputs</th>
<th>Outputs</th>
<th>Outcomes</th>
<th>Indicators for progress</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Training for summer schools</td>
<td>Cash</td>
<td>650 teachers trained</td>
<td>Interim school activities organized for more than 50,000 children at 300 centres</td>
<td>Number of teachers trained. Number of centres functional.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Establishment of temporary school</td>
<td>Cash, Supply</td>
<td>7380 tents, 6630 school kits, 2300 music and games kits</td>
<td>Schools established with education kits.</td>
<td>Number of schools supplied with the materials. Number of schools up and running in tents.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of modules for VEC training</td>
<td>Cash, Travel</td>
<td>3 workshops organized.</td>
<td>VEC module developed with modifications</td>
<td>Number of workshops completed. Use of module in the training programme.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orientation on reading programme</td>
<td>Cash, Travel</td>
<td>176 CRC co-coordinators trained. 2030 teachers oriented.</td>
<td>Reading activities initiated in schools. Children are able to read and comprehend text.</td>
<td>Number of teachers trained. Number of schools, which have initiated reading activities. Number of children who are able to decode and comprehend the written matter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training of teachers on promoting hygiene education.</td>
<td>Cash, Travel</td>
<td>176 CRC co-coordinators trained. 800 teachers trained.</td>
<td>Health and hygiene education committees formed. Schools maintain clean premises. Children participate in the maintenance of school cleanliness. Children are aware of hygiene practices such as hand washing, safe handling of water.</td>
<td>Number of schools, which have established hygiene committees. Number of schools where there is safe disposal of garbage. Number of schools having functional and well-kept toilet units. Number of children practicing hand washing, aware about safe handling of water.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ANNEX 2: Terms of Reference

Title: The UNICEF Child Friendly Spaces / Environments Experience in Albania, Turkey, Northern Caucasus, Colombia, Liberia and Gujarat

Rationale
Since it was launched in April 1999, UNICEF's "Child Friendly Spaces Initiative" proved to be an effective means of providing large numbers of Kosovar refugee children and women with basic social services. Preventive maternal-child health and psycho-social services, pre- and primary school education and recreation were provided within one identifiable site which also served as a space for protection of children and their caregivers.

The initiative, grounded in a holistic rights-based approach, constituted an integrated programme that could guarantee minimum standards with regard to essential protection and services in the Albanian refugee camps. The concept as such, along with many of its elements, could prove to be useful and appropriate in other humanitarian crisis situations or within programmes addressing the rights and needs of children at risk or children in need of special protection measures.

After the Kosovar crisis the CFS/E Initiative continued to develop in successive emergencies, i.e. Turkey, East Timor, North Caucasus, Angola, Liberia, Colombia and El Salvador, among others. In each situation the concept has been adapted to respond to the specific needs of a particular context.

Although the Initiative has been implemented in several countries affected by armed conflict or natural disasters, there is no documentation available illustrating a systematic critical analysis, a thick rich description of each experience including lessons learned, what has worked, constraints, opportunities, operational issues, the whole question of governance, development of local capacity, the issue of spaces vs. environments, joint planning, implications for the UNICEF project and programme officers, inter-sectoral coordination, and partnerships. The compilation of field experience in the form of case-studies including critical analysis is a fundamental initial step.

It is expected that the study will provide a solid basis for future guidance in different contexts since to date the concept has been adapted to respond to the specific needs of a particular context without benefiting from previous experience.

Objective
The main objective of the study is to conduct a review of Child Friendly Spaces experiences in CEE/CIS TACRO and selected countries of other regions (CEE/CIS: Albania, Turkey and North Caucasus. In TACRO: El Salvador and Colombia. Other Countries: East Timor, Angola and Liberia) through structured and rigorous cases studies. The review envisages establishing a framework of issues that should be taken into consideration of the CFS/E with special emphasis in the two regions.

Methodology
The methodology of the study will include a desk-review of the he 8 countries, liaising with UNICEF Education focal point in Headquarters, Regional Emergency and Education Advisers and Project Officers. Based on the case-studies structure provided the consultant should develop a broad, structured-information gathering protocol or instrument that will be used for information gathering, frequent contact with Country Offices, Regional Offices and HQs.
Collection and systematic analysis of indirect sources including web-based and graphic information will be conducted. In addition, interviews through semi-structured questionnaires will be prepared for the countries under study.

If we are to draw overall lessons on CFS/E which provides a solid basis for developing guidance, we need clear comparison of experiences on comparable terms. Unsubstantiated promotional pieces, with little critical analysis, are to be avoided, as these leave so many questions to people who want to reapply a concept or strategy.

I. Background:

Brief description of what is UNICEF experience in education in emergencies (overview from a sectoral to an all-inclusive approach). In line with the organisational priority of Girls’ Education, the case-studies should include a gender perspective in terms of language and contents. For example, not enough to provide the number of children but also provide gender desegregated information.

What is proven in education in emergencies?
Who is the audience?

II. Child Friendly Spaces/Environments

Evolution of CFS/E model

- What is the CFS/E concept and what is the CFS approach or strategy – i.e. what are the core elements that make the strategy?
- What programme objectives does the CFS approach support (briefly; focus on differences, use appendices as necessary)?
- How does the CFS link to the broader Child Protection strategies, and to the Core Corporate Commitments (CCCs) As the cases are researched, the common elements of the CFS approach will emerge and will probably be best covered in a combination of introductory piece as a chapeau to all the cases and appendices. The cases should be written focussing on the differences, making reference to the adaptations and variations in each country experience. Also, the listing of key issues/questions may not necessarily be the ‘structure’ used for writing and presenting the case. It should, however, structure the research and analysis of the cases.
- What were key constraints (internal and external), what were the responses to these if any and how successful were responses in circumventing the problem?
  - concept flesh out
  - experiential knowledge

III. Case Studies Structure

Proposed key issues and questions to be addressed by case studies:

A. Descriptive Account

1. Background to the case-study emergency

- What is the magnitude and distribution (geographic, ethnic, urban/rural, age, sex) of the population affected?
• What are the most critical effects of the crisis/conflict on this population (as distinct from long-term ‘under-development’)?
• Who are the parties that govern/control the country and what is the status of usual national services (health, education)?
• What are the characteristics of international presence (military peace-keeping, high numbers of NGOs, language/culture clashes, pressure by large players -- among others)?

2. Key contextual considerations
• What are the salient elements of the context that influenced the nature of CFS experience -- that led to CFS’s adoption/acceptance that shaped the strategy itself?

3. Stakeholders involved, roles and interests
• Who identified the need for or initiated CFS?
• With whom was it negotiated and how was it sold to various actors (including warring parties/armies/militia)?
• Which partners were involved in implementing and in which roles (and if this has changed, how has it evolved)?

4. Results
• What are the key outputs (immediate results from CFS) – such as, coverage (population reached, total and for specific services), human resources trained, establishment of institutional arrangements; development of new policies? (Distinguish, are these outputs attributable to UNICEF’s efforts, to UNICEF and partners? Which partners?)
• What are the outcomes (i.e. intermediate results; such as changes in knowledge, attitudes, practices of individuals; changes in cultures/environments within organisations or networks of organisations/actors; changes in practices within organisations or services)?

B. Analysis of Lessons Learned

5. Strengths/Weaknesses

As a guide to analysing strengths and weaknesses, consider The Core Corporate Commitments were not established in UNICEF policy when some of the CFS experiences developed. However, in retrospect, it is possible to examine how well the model of the CFS fit or fits with the CCCs.

• Appropriateness – how does the model respond to the context and specific problems detected?
• Coherence – how does the CFS model fit with UNICEF policy and international standards?
• Effectiveness and coverage – how well does the CFS model influence achievement of programme objectives in the various sector intervention areas? what effect does CFS model have on programme coverage?: how were local linkages at community level established with local authorities?;
• Efficiency – how do costs for the CFS model compare with other options? (as best can be estimated);
• Sustainability/Connectedness – how does the CFS model link to longer term initiatives?, what conceptual or institutional links are established with the Country Programme, with international partners programmes, with mainstream national services or programmes (supported by UNICEF, or not)? What is the participation level with families and children;
• Visibility/viability -- what have been the reactions of partners and donors to the CFS approach? has the CFS approach helped to garner additional resources from donors?

6. Opportunities/Constraints
• What are the considerations for the future if still in progress? -- What can/will be improved (efficiency, effectiveness, coverage, institutionalisation, marketability) and how?
• What factors represent risks for the future of the CFS/E?
• Replicability -- what are the key elements that makes CFS/E replicable?

C. Development of Conceptual Framework based on Case-Studies Study
• CFS as a community-based response in the continuum from crisis, transition to rehabilitation/reconstruction in complex emergencies.

V. Expected Outputs
Child Friendly Spaces Study and Lessons Learned.
I. Document including the case-studies structure:
• Background and overview of CFS within UNICEF
• Mapping of case studies
• Case studies, 6-8 pp.
• CEE/CIS: Albania, Turkey and North Caucasus.
• TACRO: El Salvador and Colombia.
• Others: East Timor, Angola and Liberia.

II. Establish a reference group on CFS/E including UNICEF at HQs and regional level to provide feedback and guidance throughout the project.

III. Web document to be launched on the UNICEF, GINIE and other websites, for information sharing purposes.

UNICEF role:
• Provide a list of contacts with the TOR, with names, titles, contact address and relevant details as preparatory steps before the study.
• Set-up an Inter-Divisional Task Team on CFS/E
• Provide input and review of the compiled documentation
• The continuation of the project will be based on a review of the first case-study draft, to ensure that it meets the UNICEF standards.
• Review of intermediate and final products
• Monitoring of the project as indicated in the time-line provided.
• Payment will be provided upon completion of TOR - see Annex for details

University of Pittsburgh role:
• Identify responsible focal point and/or other responsible partners.
• Based on TOR prepare a workplan with clear objectives, actions and reporting by (August 1)
• Compile, review, analyse and synthesise the data and information from the 8 Country Offices provided.
• Communication will be primarily by e-mail, telephone conference, or video-conference facilities.
• 2 trips (up to a maximum of two days consultations) will be paid by UNICEF for the designated focal point, in case that additional staff from the University deem necessary to accompany the focal point the cost will be covered by the University as well as all expenses incurred. First visit to UNICEF HQs at the beginning of the project (August 15) to present the Education Section and the Inter-Divisional Task Team the workplan and objective of the study. Second visit (December 1) to present the results of the study and its submission.
• The time-frame for the study is 6 months, from July 15 through December 15, 2003.

End-Product:

A document containing UNICEF experience of 8 case-studies with a critical analysis on the concept of Child Friendly Spaces/Environments in Emergencies (Preliminary November 1). The final document will be in two parts (December 15). Part 1 will contain an Analysis of the Child Friendly Spaces/Environments concept including main findings with an executive summary for both parts. Part 2 will include a rich description of 8 case-studies, including available illustrations, videos or others. In both cases references and bibliography are to be included.

The documents should be produced in 4 hardcopies and electronic form.