1,864 Civilians, Including Six Media Workers and 21 Medical and Civil Defense Personnel, Documented Killed in Syria in the First Half of 2019

SNHR Documented 59 Massacres and 159 Persons Who Died due to Torture

Monday, July 1, 2019
The Syrian Network for Human Rights (SNHR), founded in June 2011, is a non-governmental, independent group that is considered a primary source for the OHCHR on all death toll-related analyses in Syria.

Contents
I. Introduction and Methodology
II. Death Toll of Civilian Victims
III. Death Toll of Victims Who Died due to Torture, and Victims amongst Media, Medical and Civil Defense Personnel
IV. Record of Most Notable Massacres
V. Conclusions and Recommendations

I. Introduction and Methodology
The documentation process to register victims killed in Syria is one of the most important roles which have been performed by the Syrian Network for Human Rights ever since March 2011. This is all the more crucial since murder is the most prevalent of all the violations perpetrated, and the one which most profoundly affects the Syrian people, with families suffering incalculable and irreparable trauma through the loss of fathers, mothers, brothers, friends, etc. These violations have become widespread, primarily through Syrian regime forces’ and affiliated militias’ systematic killing of civilians using every kind of weapon. The regime began by using tanks and artillery, then progressed to also deploying warplanes and helicopter gunships which have dropped or fired barrel bombs, in addition to Scud missiles and chemical weapons.

The entry of several parties into the Syrian conflict has increased the importance and complexity of documenting the victims killed in Syria. Since 2011, the Syrian Network for Human Rights has created complex electronic programs to archive and categorize the victims’ data, which the team collects and verifies, enabling us to catalogue the victims according to their gender and the location where each was killed, the governorate from which each victim originally came, and the party responsible for the killing, and to make comparisons between these parties, and identify the governorates which lost the largest proportion of residents.
Since 2011, we have also deemed it appropriate to highlight the death toll among women and children due to the vulnerability of these groups, their central role in the community, and because they give a strong indication of the targeting of civilians. We later added other groups which have played a key role in the popular movement and later in the armed conflict, such as media, medical, relief and civil defense personnel.

Given the importance and sensitivity surrounding the murder of Syrian citizens, the Syrian Network for Human Rights has never stopped issuing daily death toll of victims for nearly eight years, or publishing monthly reports documenting the death toll of victims Syria lost each month, in addition to issuing an annual report, as well as dozens of other reports documenting massacres committed on Syrian soil. Also, SNHR periodically sends a special form to the United Nations Special Rapporteur on extrajudicial killings.

It should be noted that the United Nations has relied on the Syrian Network for Human Rights for all the statistics it has used in its analysis of victims in the conflict, given SNHR’s prominent role as one of the most credible sources concerning events in Syria. SNHR is also used as a trustworthy source by a large number of Arab and international news agencies and many international human rights organizations.

**Methodology**

This report records the death toll of victims killed by the main perpetrator parties to the conflict in Syria in June and in the first half of 2019, particularly focusing on those victims killed under torture, and victims amongst media and medical personnel, paying particular attention to the massacres which the SNHR was able to document that were committed by the main perpetrator parties to the conflict during the preceding month.

We should note that in this context we use the term “massacre” to refer to any attack that resulted in the deaths of five or more peaceful individuals in the same incident.

The report also includes an outline of the most notable incidents during this period. Finally, we maintain the full details of every incident on the SNHR database.

The report catalogues the death toll of victims perpetrated by each of the main perpetrator parties in the Syrian conflict. Accurately ascribing responsibility sometimes requires more time and investigation than usual, especially in the case of joint attacks. On some occasions, when we are unable to definitively assign responsibility for particular attacks to one specific party, as in the case of air strikes by Syrian or Russian warplanes, Syrian-Iranian attacks, or attacks by Syrian Democratic Forces and International Coalition forces, we indicate that responsibility for these attacks is held jointly by the parties in question until we are able to establish which one of the parties was more probably responsible, or it’s proved that the attack was a joint initiative carried out in coordination between the two parties.
The main perpetrator parties to the conflict in Syria are:

- Syrian Regime forces (army, security, local militias, and Shiite foreign militias)
- Russian forces
- Extremist Islamist groups
- Factions of the Armed Opposition
- Kurdish-led Syrian Democratic forces (the Democratic Union Party)
- International Coalition forces
- Other parties

Through use of SNHR’s extensive database, we can catalogue the victims according to the governorate where they were killed, and also by the governorate from which they originally came. This report catalogues the death toll of victims according to the governorate in which they were killed, rather than by the governorate they originally came from.

In relation to victims amongst armed forces, these are divided into two categories:

- Victims from the armed opposition: We face additional difficulties in assessing these casualties as many of these victims are killed on battlefronts rather than in cities or other urban settlements. We are also often unable to obtain information on the victims such as names, photographs and other important personal details due to the reluctance of armed opposition forces to reveal such sensitive information for security concerns among other reasons. Therefore, the actual number of victims is far higher than the number documented.

- Victims from Syrian Regime forces, extremist Islamist groups, and Kurdish Democratic Union Party forces: It is almost impossible to access information about this category of victims and the margin of error is considerably higher than usual due to the lack of any applicable methodology in this type of documentation, since these parties don’t publish, reveal, or document information about their casualties. From our perspective and given these facts, it is rational to conclude that the statistics published by some groups concerning casualties amongst this category of victims are fabricated rather than being based on any actual data.

In this report, we record only the toll of civilian casualties - with the exception of the death toll among victims who died due to torture, which includes armed combatants as well as civilians - whose deaths we were able to document during the last month. Some of the victims documented may have been killed months or even years ago, as in some cases of death due to torture; in these cases, where the deaths have only recently been confirmed, we include two dates, the date when we were able to document the victim’s death, and the date on which we think the death occurred.
The methodology adopted by the Syrian Network for Human Rights in documenting the victims can be seen at this link.

This report draws upon the ongoing daily monitoring of news and developments by SNHR’s team, and on information from our extensive network of various sources that has been built up over the course of our work since 2011. When we receive information or learn some news about violations via the internet or media outlets, our team works to follow up these reports and attempts to verify information and collect evidence and data. In some cases, researchers are able to visit the incident location promptly. However, this is a rarity in light of the incredibly high security risks, and given the frequency of daily incidents and the scarcity of human and material resources. Therefore, the opportunities available to access evidence vary between one case and another, and consequently the level of certainty in classification of each incident varies. SNHR’s customary policy in such cases is to rely on accounts from survivors who experienced the violation firsthand, in addition to analyzing available materials from open sources such as the Internet and media outlets. We also talk with medical personnel who treated the injured in these incidents, examined the deceased victims’ bodies, and identified the cause of death. The Syrian Network for Human Rights also provides a special form that can be filled with victims’ names and personal information so that the Victims Documentation Department can follow up on this information and verify its accuracy and then include it in the database.

SNHR has analyzed videos and photographs that our team documented, which were posted online, or submitted by local activists via e-mail, Skype, or social media platforms. These videos and photos show, amongst other things, the sites of attacks, and bodies of the victims and the injured, whilst other photos may show the bodies of victims killed under torture, and of victims amongst medical and media personnel who died in attacks carried out by parties to the conflict. We also retain copies of all the videos and photographs included in these reports, which are also reviewed in this report, in a confidential electronic database and in hard disk backup copies, and we ensure always that all these data are stored with their original source.

---

We do not claim, however, that we have documented all cases, given the severe prohibitions, restrictions and persecution by the Syrian Regime forces and some other armed groups.

This report contains one account that we obtained through speaking directly with eyewitnesses, rather than relying on citing any open sources. We explained the purpose of this interview beforehand to the eyewitnesses, who gave us permission to use the information they provided without us offering or giving them any incentives. Also, SNHR endeavors always to spare eyewitnesses the agony of remembering the violations as much as possible, providing assurances that we will conceal the identity of any witness who prefers to use an alias.

Our investigations confirm that all of the attacks included in this report that were carried out by the main perpetrator parties to the conflict in Syria targeted civilian areas where we documented no military presence or armories before or during the attacks, and in which the perpetrators failed to issue any warnings to civilians prior to any of the attacks as required by international humanitarian law.

The type and level of evidence available varies from one case to another. In light of the aforementioned challenges, the legal definition of many of the incidents documented may be subject to change based on any new evidence or information which emerge after this report is released. We shall update our data archive with any such items of evidence and information as soon as they become available. Meanwhile, although many incidents don’t technically constitute a violation of international humanitarian law under the terms of such legislation, they involved collateral damage, so we have recorded and archived these incidents to document what happened historically and to preserve these as part of the national record, although we don’t qualify these specific incidents as crimes.

This report only represents the bare minimum of the actual severity and magnitude of the violations that occurred. Also, it doesn’t include any analysis of the profound social, economic, and psychological ramifications.
II. Death Toll of Civilian Victims

A. In the first half of 2019:
SNHR documented in the first half of 2019 the deaths of 1,864 civilians, including 468 children and 285 women (adult female), killed at the hands of the main perpetrator parties in Syria.

The death toll we documented in the first half of 2019 was distributed by the main perpetrator parties as follows:
Distributed as follows:

468 children were killed at the hands of the main parties to the conflict in Syria in the first half of 2019

As documented by SNHR

Distributed as follows:

406 females were killed at the hands of the main parties to the conflict in Syria in the first half of 2019

As documented by SNHR
- Syrian Regime forces (army, security, local militias, and Shiite foreign militias):
  We documented the deaths of 891 civilians at the hands of Syrian Regime forces, including 211 children and 136 women.

- Russian forces:
  We documented the deaths of 149 civilians, including 34 children and 21 women, as a result of bombardment which we believe was by Russian forces.

- Extremist Islamist groups: killed 107 civilians, including 15 children and seven women.
  These groups are divided between:
  - ISIS (the self-proclaimed ‘Islamic State’): killed 82 civilians, including 11 children and seven women.
  - Hay’at Tahrir al Sham (an alliance composed of Fateh al Sham Front and a number of factions of the Armed Opposition): killed 25 civilians, including four children.

- Factions of the Armed Opposition: SNHR documented the deaths of 14 civilians, including six children and one woman.

- Kurdish-led Syrian Democratic Forces (the Democratic Union Party):
  SNHR documented the deaths of 99 civilians, including 33 children and 10 women.

- International Coalition forces:
  SNHR documented the deaths of 64 civilians, including 20 children and 17 women

- Other parties:
  We documented the deaths of 540 civilians, including 149 children and 93 women, at the hands of other parties. Victims in this category include those who were killed in bombings whose perpetrators have not yet been identified, victims who died in fires of unknown sources, victims killed by landmines of unknown origin, and victims who drowned, in addition to victims who died in fires, victims who were killed in indiscriminate shelling by Turkish aerial and land forces, and victims who were killed by Jordanian or Lebanese forces.
The death toll of civilian victims killed at the hands of the main perpetrator parties documented in the first half of 2019 was distributed across Syrian governorates as follows:

The map shows that the largest death toll in the first half of this year was in Idlib governorate, followed by the governorates of Hama and Aleppo, and that most of the victims were killed by Syrian-Russian alliance forces. This means that 87 percent of the death toll among victims took place in these three governorates.
The death toll of civilian victims killed at the hands of the main perpetrator parties to the conflict in Syria since the beginning of 2019 was distributed as follows:

The previous chart shows that the highest toll of victims in the first half of 2019 was in May followed by June, following the military escalation by the Syrian-Russian alliance forces in the fourth and final de-escalation zone (consisting of Idlib governorate and parts of the governorates of Hama, Aleppo and Latakia) which is still ongoing since April 26, 2019.

B. In June 2019:
SNHR documented in June 2019 the deaths of 347 civilians, including 91 children and 40 women (adult female), killed at the hands of the main perpetrator parties in Syria.
The death toll we documented in June was distributed according to the main perpetrator parties, as follows:

- **Syrian Regime forces (army, security, local militias, and Shiite foreign militias):**
  We documented the deaths of 231 civilians at the hands of Syrian Regime forces, including 59 children and 32 women.

- **Russian forces:**
  We documented the deaths of six civilians as a result of bombardment which we believe was carried out by Russian forces.
- Extremist Islamist groups: killed 17 civilians, including two children and one woman. These groups are divided between:
  - ISIS (the self-proclaimed ‘Islamic State’): killed nine civilians, including two children and one woman.
  - Hay’at Tahrir al Sham (an alliance composed of Fateh al Sham Front and a number of factions of the Armed Opposition): killed eight civilians.

- International Coalition forces:
SNHR documented the death of one civilian.

- Other parties:
We documented the deaths of 92 civilians, including 30 children and six women at the hands of other parties.

The death toll of civilian victims killed at the hands of the main perpetrator parties documented in June 2019 was distributed across Syrian governorates as follows:
The previous map shows that the highest toll of victims in June was in Idlib governorate, which accounted for 60 percent of the civilian victims this month, 94 percent of whom were killed at the hands of the Syrian-Russian alliance forces, following the military escalation by the alliance forces on the fourth de-escalation zone.

III. Death Toll of Victims Who Died Due to Torture, and Victims Amongst Media, Medical and Civil Defense Personnel

A. Death toll of victims who died due to torture

1. In the first half of 2019:

SNHR documented the deaths of 159 persons due to torture in the first half of 2019, distributed according to the main perpetrator parties as follows:

- Syrian Regime forces: 142
- Extremist Islamist groups: Three
• Hay’at Tahrir al Sham: Three
- Factions of the Armed Opposition: Three
- Syrian Democratic Forces: Seven
- Other parties: Four

159 individuals died due to torture at the hands of the main parties to the conflict in Syria in the first half of 2019.

As documented by SNHR
The most notable cases documented in the first half of 2019 are:

Mahmoud Ali al Mer’e, a graduate of Damascus University's Faculty of Law, from al Rastan city in the northern suburbs of Homs governorate, was born in 1957. He was arrested by the Syrian Regime's Air Security forces on Thursday, October 13, 2011, in Homs city. His family was able to visit him in March 2012 in Sydnaya Military Prison in Damascus Suburbs governorate. On Tuesday, February 12, 2019, we learned that his death had been registered in the Civil Registry Department, with the date of death given as Wednesday, February 13, 2013. We consider it most probable that he died due to torture inside one of the Syrian Regime's detention centers.

Alaa al Din Mustafa Hammash, a university student at the Faculty of Arts, University of Aleppo's French language department, from Anadan city in the northern suburbs of Aleppo governorate, was born in 1993. He was arrested by Syrian Regime forces in December 2016 from his place of residence in one of the neighborhoods of eastern Aleppo city following a mass raid and arrest campaign after the regime seized control of the city. On Saturday, March 9, 2019, we received information confirming his death due to torture in a Syrian Regime's detention center.

Mohammad Zaki al Ammouri, a college student at the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine at Hama University, from Kafr Zita city in the northern suburbs of Hama governorate, was born in 1998. He was arrested by Syrian Regime forces on Friday, July 27, 2018, in a raid on his place of residence in Hama city. We were informed on Tuesday, April 9, 2019, that he had been registered as dead in the Civil Register Department. We consider it most probable that he died as a result of torture in Sydnaya Military Prison in Damascus Suburbs governorate.

2. In June 2019:
SNHR documented the deaths of 18 persons due to torture in June 2019, all of whom died at the hands of Syrian Regime forces.

The most notable cases are:

Amer Mohammad Nazir Khatib, a university student at the Aleppo University's Faculty of Civil Engineering, from Taftanaz town in the northeastern suburbs of Idlib governorate, was arrested by personnel from the Syrian Regime's Air Security Branch on Wednesday, May 23, 2012, in Aleppo city. On Monday, June 17, 2019, we received information confirming his death due to torture inside a Syrian Regime's detention center in Damascus city.
Hammadi Salim al Mashout, from al Boukamal city in the eastern suburbs of Deir Ez-Zour governorate, who was aged 70 at the time of his arrest, was arrested by Syrian Regime forces in January 2019, as he was passing through one of their checkpoints while on his way from Deir Ez-Zour city to Damascus city for medical treatment, and taken to Adra Central Prison in Damascus Suburbs governorate. On Saturday, June 22, 2019, we received information confirming his death due to medical negligence in Adra Central Prison.

B. Death toll of medical personnel

1. In the first half of 2019:
SNHR documented in the first half of 2019 the deaths of 15 medical personnel, distributed by the main perpetrator parties as follows:
- Syrian Regime forces: 11, including one woman.
- Extremist Islamist groups:
  • Hay’at Tahrir al Sham: One
- International Coalition forces: One
- Other parties: Two

2. In June 2019:
SNHR documented in June 2019 the deaths of four medical personnel, distributed by the main perpetrator parties as follows:
- Syrian Regime forces: Three.
- Other parties: One

The most notable cases are:
Mahmoud al Mustafa, Saer Bahloul and Abdul Qader Nahtan, from the Violet Organization’s Violet Ambulance team, were killed on Thursday, June 20, 2019, when Syrian Regime fixed-wing warplanes fired a missile near their ambulance in al Janoubi neighborhood in Ma’aret al Numan city in Idlib governorate southern suburbs, while they were aiding civilians injured in earlier bombardment of the city by the same forces. 
Violet Organization published a tribute to the three paramedics on its official website.
Mahmoud al Mustafa, from Kafr Uwied village in Idlib governorate southern suburbs
Saer Bahloul, from Ma’aret al Numan city, married with a female child
Abdul Qader Nahtan, from Ma’aret al Numan city

C. Death toll of media workers
1. In the first half of 2019:
   SNHR documented in the first half of 2019 the deaths of six media workers, distributed according to the main perpetrator parties as follows:
   - **Syrian Regime forces**: Four, including two as a result of torture.
   - **Russian forces**: One
   - **Other parties**: One

2. In June 2019:
   SNHR documented in June 2019 the deaths of two media workers, distributed according to the main perpetrator parties as follows:
   - **Syrian Regime forces**: One.
   - **Other parties**: One
The most notable cases are:
On Sunday, June 23, 2019, a media activist known as Omar al Dimashqi, whose real name we reserve for security reasons, died in a Turkish hospital of several shrapnel wounds caused by the blast from an explosive device planted in a car belonging to al Rahmon Humanitarian Relief Society, which he worked for, in Sarmada city in Idlib governorate northern suburbs on Monday, June 17, 2019. We were unable to identify the party responsible for planting the device up to the preparation of this report. The city was under the control of Hay’at Tahrir al Sham at the time of the incident. Born in 1996, Omar, a photographer with al Rahmon Humanitarian Relief Society, originally came from Aqraba in the south of Damascus Suburbs governorate, was single. The SNHR contacted the media activist, Hazem al Qalamouni2, who told us what Omar’s friend, who was with him, had told him about the incident and subsequent events: “On Monday, June 17, while Omar was about to get in a car belonging to the association he works for to drive to Atma Camps to distribute bread to the displaced, an explosive device planted in the car blew up, injuring him with several shrapnel wounds all over his body. He was immediately taken to the university hospital in the Turkish city of Antakya where he underwent several surgeries, in which his left foot was amputated and a number of fingers of his hands were removed. He was then transferred to Kaderli Hospital in the Turkish city of al Othmaniya where he died six days later due to the wounds sustained.”

D. Death toll of Civil Defense personnel
1. In the first half of 2019:
SNHR documented in the first half of 2019 the deaths of six Civil Defense personnel, distributed according to the main perpetrator parties as follows:
- Syrian Regime forces: One.
- Russian forces: Four
- Other parties: One

2 Via his personal Facebook account on June 26, 2019
2. In June 2019:
SNHR documented in June 2019 the deaths of two Civil Defense personnel at the hands of Russian forces.

The most notable cases are:
Ali al Qaddour and Omar al Kayyal, members of Civil Defense- Khan Sheikhoum center, were killed when fixed-wing warplanes, which we believe were Russian, fired missiles near the Civil Defense team in al Beira neighborhood in northeast of Khan Sheikhoum city in Idlib governorate southern suburbs while they were aiding civilians injured in previous bombardment by Syrian Regime fixed-wing warplanes at the same location.
The Syrian Civil Defense published a tribute to Ali and Omar on its official ‘Twitter’ account. Ali al Quddour, from Morek town in the northern suburbs of Hama governorate, died immediately at the site of the bombardment. Omar al Kayyal, from Khan Sheikhoum City, died of his injuries later after arriving at a hospital, despite efforts to save his life.
IV. Record of Most Notable Massacres

A. In the first half of 2019:
SNHR documented at least 59 massacres in the first half of 2019, distributed according to the main perpetrator parties as follows:
- **Syrian Regime forces**: 23
- **Russian forces**: Eight
- **Syrian Democratic Forces**: Six
- **International Coalition forces**: Three
- **Other parties**: 19

The massacres perpetrated by Syrian Regime forces in the first half of 2019 were distributed according to areas of control as follows:
- 20 massacres in areas under the joint control of factions of the Armed Opposition and Hay’at Tahrir al Sham.
- One massacre in an area under the control of factions of the Armed Opposition.
- One massacre in an area under the control of Hay’at Tahrir al Sham.
- One massacre in an area under the joint control of Hay’at Tahrir al Sham and the Turkistan Islamic Party.

According to the SNHR’s Victim Documentation team, the massacres documented in the first half of 2019 resulted in the deaths of 539 civilians, including 147 children and 128 women (adult female). This means that 52 percent of all the victims were women and children, a noticeably higher proportion than usual, and a clear indication that civilian residents were specifically targeted in most of these massacres.

The death toll of these massacres was distributed by the perpetrator parties as follows:
- **Syrian Regime forces**: 164 civilians, including 56 children and 39 women.
- **Russian forces**: 89 civilians, including 21 children and seven women.
- **Syrian Democratic Forces**: 42 civilians, including 13 children and Eight women.
- **International Coalition forces**: 53 civilians, including 19 children and 15 women.
- **Other parties**: 191 civilians, including 38 children and 59 women.
The most notable massacres documented in the first half of 2019:

On Friday, January 18, 2019, fixed-wing International Coalition forces warplanes fired missiles at a residential neighborhood in al Baghouz Tahtani village, administratively a part of al Boukamal city in the eastern suburbs of Deir Ez-Zour governorate, resulting in the deaths of 28 civilians, most of whom were IDPs from areas of the eastern suburbs of Deir Ez-Zour governorate, including 10 children and eight women. The village was under the control of ISIS at the time of the incident.

On Wednesday, March 13, 2019, at around 15:15, fixed-wing warplanes, which we believe were Russian, fired three missiles at Idlib Central Prison, west of Idlib city, resulting in the deaths of 31 prisoners. Up to the time of writing, the incident is still under investigation. The same warplanes later returned to fly over the city at around 17:15, then bombed al Kasih area in the center of Idlib city with eight missiles that targeted the Government Square, which includes the buildings housing the civil services of the Salvation Government (Idlib Electricity Department and its warehouses, the Central Electricity Transformer Substation, the Civil Registry building, the Salvation Government headquarter and Ministry of the Interior headquarter).

Two missiles landed on a residential building opposite the Social Insurance building, which Hay’at Tahrir al Sham had taken as its headquarters, resulting in the deaths of 12 civilians, including five children (three females and two males) and one woman.

We note that one missile fell in an area between residential buildings located opposite the Electricity company around 250m away from the site of the massacre, resulting in the deaths of four more civilians, all from the same family, namely two children – a male and a female - and their grandparents. Idlib city was under the control of Hay’at Tahrir al Sham at the time of the incident.

The attack caused significant material damage to the buildings of Idlib Electricity Department and its warehouses, the Central Electricity Transformer Substation, the Civil Registry building and the Salvation Government headquarters, all of which were put out of service, in addition to inflicting moderate material damage to the Yousef al Azma Elementary School, located opposite the Civil Registry building.
Visual guide showing the site in al Kasih area and the details of the Russian air attack on it:

B. In June 2019:
SNHR documented at least 12 massacres in June 2019, including, distributed by the main perpetrator parties as follows:
- Syrian Regime forces: 10
- Other parties: Two

The massacres perpetrated by Syrian Regime forces in June were distributed according to areas of control as follows:
- Nine massacres in areas under the joint control of factions of the Armed Opposition and Hay’at Tahrir al Sham.
- One massacre in an area under the control of factions of the Armed Opposition.
According to the SNHR’s Victim Documentation team, the massacres documented this month resulted in the deaths of 106 civilians, including 34 children (23 males, 10 females and one unborn baby) and 20 women (adult female). This means that 51 percent of all the victims were women and children, a noticeably higher proportion than usual, and a clear indication that civilian residents were specifically targeted in most of these massacres. The death toll of these massacres was distributed by the perpetrator parties as follows:

- **Syrian Regime forces**: 75 civilians, including 25 children (16 male and nine females) and 16 women.
- **Other parties**: 31 civilians, including nine children (seven males, one female and one unborn baby) and four women.

The most notable cases are:

On Sunday, June 2, 2019, a car bomb exploded in the main street near Izaz Court in the middle of Izaz city in Aleppo governorate northwestern suburbs, killing **22 civilians**, including seven children (five males, one female, and one unborn baby) and **three women**. We were unable to identify the responsible party up to the time of the preparation of this report, given the difficulty in identifying the perpetrators of bombings. Izaz city was under the control of factions of the Armed Opposition at the time of the incident.

![A Child victim of the massacre perpetrated as a result of an unknown source car bomb in the middle of Izaz city, Aleppo – June 2, 2019](image-url)
On Monday, June 10, 2019, fixed-wing Syrian Regime warplanes fired missiles at a residential neighborhood in middle of Jabala village in Idlib governorate southern suburbs, resulting in the deaths of at least 13 civilians, including seven children (Six males and one female) and two women. Jabala village was under the joint control of factions of the Armed Opposition and Hay’at Tahrir al Sham.

On Saturday, June 15, 2019, fixed-wing Syrian Regime warplanes fired a number of missiles at al Bara village in Jabal al Zaweya in Idlib governorate southern suburbs, resulting in the deaths of six civilians simultaneously; five children (1 male and 4 female) and one woman. Al Bara village was under the joint control of factions of the Armed Opposition and Hay’at Tahrir al Sham at the time of the incident.

On Thursday, June 20, 2019, fixed-wing Syrian Regime warplanes fired a number of missiles at the northern parts of al Mastouma village in Idlib governorate northern suburbs, resulting in the deaths of nine civilians, including four male children and one woman, most of whom were from one family which had previously been displaced from Um Mwilat village in Idlib governorate southeastern suburbs. Al Mastouma village was under the joint control of factions of the Armed Opposition and the Hay’at Tahrir al Sham at the time of the incident.
V. Conclusions and Recommendations

Conclusions:

• The evidence we collected indicates that attacks were directed against civilians and civilian objects. Syrian-Russian alliance forces have committed various crimes of extrajudicial killings. There are reasonable grounds to believe that the war crime of attacking civilians has been committed in many cases.

• The Syrian government has not only violated international humanitarian law and customary law, but has also breached a number of UN Security Council resolutions, particularly resolution 2139 and resolution 2042 on the release of detainees, as well as resolution 2254, all without any accountability.

• The indiscriminate and disproportionate bombardment carried out by the alliance of International Coalition forces and the Syrian Democratic Forces is considered a violation of international humanitarian law, with the crimes of indiscriminate killing amounting to war crimes.

• Extremist Islamist groups have violated international humanitarian law, causing the deaths of many civilians.

• Factions of the Armed Opposition breached UN Security Council Resolution 2139 through carrying out attacks that are considered to violate customary international humanitarian law, causing civilian casualties or accidental injuries.

• The use of explosive arms to target densely populated areas reflects a criminal and wholly deliberate mindset and a calculated intention to inflict the greatest possible number of deaths, which is a clear contravention of international human rights law and a flagrant violation of the four Geneva Convention (articles 27, 31, 32).

• We could find no record of any warnings being issued by the Syrian Regime, or by Russian or International Coalition forces prior to any attack in accordance with the requirements of international humanitarian law. This has been the case since the beginning of the popular uprising, providing another blatant demonstration of these forces’ total disregard for the lives of civilians in Syria.

• These attacks, particularly the bombings, caused massive collateral damage that involved loss of lives, injuries, or significant damage to civilian objects. There are strong indicators suggesting that this damage was excessive compared to the anticipated military benefit.

• The magnitude and frequency of the violations, the disproportionate use of military force, the indiscriminate manner of the bombing, and the coordinated approach of these attacks leads to the inescapable conclusion that these acts are wholly deliberate and based on high-level orders, and as such constitute a part of state policy.
Recommendations:

Security Council

• The Security Council must take additional steps following its adoption of Resolution 2254, which clearly states that “all parties immediately cease any attacks against civilians and civilian objects as such.”

• The Syrian case should be referred to the International Criminal Court and all those who are responsible should be held accountable including the Russian regime whose involvement in war crimes has been repeatedly proven.

• Ensure peace and security and implement the principle of responsibility to protect civilians’ lives and to save the Syrian people’s heritage and historical artefacts from destruction, looting and vandalism.

• The Security Council should adopt a resolution banning the use of cluster munitions in Syria, similar to the prohibition on the use of chemical weapons, and include advice on how to safely remove the remnants of such dangerous weapons.

• The four other permanent member states should put pressure on the Russian government to end its support for the Syrian regime, which uses chemical weapons, and expose its involvement in this regard.

• We request that all relevant United Nations agencies make greater efforts to provide food, medical and humanitarian assistance in areas where fighting has ceased, and in internally displaced persons camps, and follow-up with those States that have pledged voluntary contributions.

International Community

• In light of the split within the Security Council and its utter inability to take any effective action, action should be taken at the national and regional levels to form alliances to support the Syrian people by protecting them from daily killing, and by lifting sieges, as well as through increasing support for relief efforts. Additionally, the principle of universal jurisdiction should be enacted in local courts regarding these crimes in order to conduct fair trials for all those who were involved.

• SNHR has repeatedly called for the implementation of the ‘Responsibility to Protect’ doctrine in dozens of studies and reports and as a member of the International Coalition for the Responsibility to Protect (ICRtoP) after all political channels through the Arab League’s plan and then Mr. Kofi Annan’s plan proved fruitless, along with the Cessation of Hostilities statements and Astana agreements that followed. Therefore, steps should be taken under Chapter VII of the Charter of the United Nations, while the norm of the ‘Responsibility to Protect’, which was established by the United Nations General Assembly, should be implemented. By failing to do so, the Security Council is still hindering the protection of civilians in Syria.
• Renew pressure on the Security Council to refer the case in Syria to the International Criminal Court.
• Work on fulfilling justice and achieving accountability in Syria through the United Nations General Assembly and the Human Rights Council and to activate the principle of universal jurisdiction.

**OHCHR**
• The OHCHR should submit a report to the Human Rights Council and other organs of the United Nations on the incidents mentioned in this report since these attacks were perpetrated by the parties to the conflict.
• Train Syrian organizations to undertake clearance of mines and other unexploded ordnance, and raise local awareness of the dangers of such ordnance.
• Establish a platform that brings together a number of Syrian organizations active in documenting violations and providing humanitarian assistance, in order to facilitate an exchange of skills and experiences within Syrian society.

**Independent International Commission of Inquiry (COI)**
• Launch investigations into the cases included in this report and previous reports. SNHR is willing to cooperate and provide further evidence and data.

**International, Impartial, and Independent Mechanism (IIIM)**
• Collect further evidence about the crimes documented in this report.

**The United Nations special envoy to Syria**
• Condemn the perpetrators of crimes and massacres, and those who were primarily responsible for dooming the de-escalation agreements.
• Revive the peace process so that it can resume its natural course despite Russia’s attempts to divert and distort it, and empower the Constitutional Commission prior to the establishment of a transitional government.

**The Syrian regime**
• Stop indiscriminate shelling and targeting residential areas, hospitals, schools and markets, and using prohibited weapons and barrel bombs.
• End the acts of torture that have caused the deaths of thousands of Syrian citizens in detention centers.
• Reveal the fate of some 82,000 Syrian citizens arrested by the security services whose fate has been concealed to date.
• Ensure compliance with UN Security Council resolutions and customary humanitarian law.
The Russian regime
• Launch investigations into the incidents included in this report, make the findings of these investigations public for the Syrian people, and hold the people involved accountable.
• Compensate all the damaged centers and facilities, rebuild and rehabilitate them, and compensate all the victims' families, who were killed by the current Russian regime, as well as all the wounded.
• Completely cease the bombing of hospitals, protected objects, and civilian areas, and respect customary international law.
• As a guarantor party in the Astana talks, the Russian regime must stop thwarting de-escalation agreements, and apply pressure on the Syrian regime in order to end all indiscriminate attacks and allow the unconditional passage of humanitarian aid to besieged areas.
• Stop using incendiary weapons in populated areas, compensate the victims and their families for all human and material damage caused by the use of these weapons, and provide treatment for dozens of civilian casualties.
• Provide detailed maps of sites where Russian forces have launched cluster munition attacks, issue these to the United Nations and inform the Syrian public about them, thus facilitating the disposal of unexploded ordnance.
• Begin to achieve a breakthrough in the issue of detainees by revealing the fate of 82,000 people disappeared by the Syrian regime.

The Coalition (International Coalition forces and Syrian Democratic Forces)
• The states of the coalition must unequivocally and sincerely acknowledge that some of their bombing operations have resulted in the deaths of innocent civilians. Rather than attempting denial, these states should take speedy steps to launch serious investigations, and immediately compensate and apologize to the victims and all those affected.
• The states supporting the SDF (which is mainly PYD) should apply pressure on these forces in order to compel them to cease all of their violations in all the areas and towns under their control.
• All forms of support, military and all others, should be ceased until the SDF commits itself to complying with the previous recommendations. This is primarily the responsibility of the supporting states. Providing the SDF with weapons and support while knowing that these can be used in perpetrating war crimes or crimes against humanity can be seen as a contribution to these crimes.
Armed Opposition factions

- Armed Opposition factions must ensure the protection of civilians in all areas under their control. These forces should also take care to distinguish between civilians and military targets and cease any indiscriminate attacks.
- Pledge to cease any arbitrary arrests and investigate incidents that have resulted in violations of international humanitarian law.
- Take punitive action against those who commit violations of international human rights law and international humanitarian law.

Humanitarian organizations:
Develop urgent operational plans to secure decent shelter for internally displaced persons.

Acknowledgments

We would like to extend our sincere thanks all family members, relatives and friends of the victims, along with the eyewitnesses and local activists, whose invaluable contributions have enriched this report.