



Vulnerability And Humanitarian Implications of UN Security Council Sanctions in Afghanistan

**OFFICE OF THE UN
COORDINATOR FOR AFGHANISTAN¹**

Islamabad, December, 2000

¹ The principal researcher for this study was Michael Semple, UN Regional Coordination Officer for Hazarajat. Additional inputs and comments were provided by many UN colleagues, as well as Afghan researchers.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1	Introduction.....	4
1.1	Background to the study	4
1.2	Rationale and Scope of the Study:.....	4
1.3	The Context of the Sanctions Regime	5
1.4	Afghanistan's experience of sanctions	5
1.5	Study methodology	6
2	Vulnerability in Afghanistan – the sanctions baseline	6
2.1	HEALTH AND SOCIAL INDICATORS	6
2.2	POPULATION AND DISPLACEMENT	7
2.3	ECONOMIC INDICATORS	8
2.3.1	Destitution	9
2.3.2	The elite economy	10
2.3.3	Economic destruction and recovery.....	10
2.3.4	International trade and vulnerability	14
2.3.5	Prices and exchange rates	14
2.4	CIVIL SOCIETY AND GOVERNANCE.....	16
2.4.1	Analysis of public expenditure priorities	16
2.4.2	Public finance process	17
2.4.3	Public sector employment	18
2.4.4	Crime	19
2.4.5	Censorship and access to information.....	21
2.4.6	Freedom of association	22
2.5	COVERAGE OF AND DEPENDENCE ON HUMANITARIAN ACTION	23
2.5.1	Levels of assistance.....	23
2.5.2	Ability of humanitarian agencies to deliver services.....	25
3	Direct effects of sanctions under Security Council Resolution 1267	28
3.1	Ariana Afghan Airlines and international travel.....	28
3.2	Case study of Indira Gandhi Paediatric Hospital, Kabul	29
3.3	Imports and exports	31
3.4	Aid agency logistics	31
3.5	Postal links	31
3.6	Impact of the restrictions on the banking sector	32
3.7	Further impact on the private sector	32
4	Indirect effects of sanctions under Security Council Resolution 1267	33
4.1	Exchange rates and price level.....	33
4.2	Psychological / Perceived Impact of Sanctions	34
4.3	Operating environment for humanitarian agencies.....	35
4.4	Civil society and its reaction to sanctions.....	35
5	Conclusion.....	36
5.1	Assessment of vulnerability	36
5.2	Direct and indirect effects of sanctions so far	36
6	Appendices.....	38
6.1	Text of the Security Council sanctions resolution	38
6.2	Ariana Afghan Airlines – a case study of sanctions implications	42
6.3	Study terms of reference	45
6.4	Additional details on methodology.....	48
6.5	Summary of field consultations undertaken	49
6.6	Key documents consulted	49
6.7	Questionnaires	50

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1 : Health indicators.....	7
Table 3 : Economic indicators - poverty and destitution	10
Table 4 : Economic indicators - destruction and rehabilitation, by sector	12
Table 5 : Economic indicators - production of basic goods.....	13
Table 6 : Economic indicators - food production and trade	13
Table 7 : Economic indicators - trade volumes, 1421 (2000) first quarter	14
Table 8 : Prices and exchange rate indicators.....	14
Table 9 : Price indices, post-sanctions	15
Table 10 : Civil society and governance indicators - public finance.....	16
Table 11 : civil society and governance indicators - public finance process	18
Table 12 : Civil society and governance indicators : public sector employment	19
Table 13 : Civil society and governance indicators - crime	20
Table 14 : Civil society and governance indicators - access to information	21
Table 15 : Civil society and governance indicators - freedom of association	23
Table 16 : Humanitarian assistance indicators - key “safety net” projects.....	24
Table 17 Humanitarian action - operating environment	27

1 Introduction

1.1 *Background to the study*

The current study was prepared in the context of the imposition by the United Nations Security Council of Resolution 1267 in October 1999 that imposed sanctions on the Taliban movement in Afghanistan. By September 2000, the Taliban controlled 90% of Afghanistan. The Security Council imposed sanctions in the wake of repeated complaints that the Taliban were allowing Afghan territory to be used in the preparation of acts of international terrorism and in support of demands that the Taliban hand over indicted Saudi, Usama bin Laden. In November 1999, sanctions came into effect.

The Security Council sanctions include two basic measures, financial and aviation-related. The financial measure requires UN Member States to freeze overseas assets belonging to the Taliban, including those of the Afghan public sector banks, and more generally bans transactions favouring the Taliban. The aviation measure requires all Member States to ban planes owned, leased or operated by the Taliban from taking off or landing outside Afghanistan. Primarily the aviation sanctions have thus targeted the national carrier, Ariana Afghan Airlines.

The primary focus of the Security Council resolution is “the Afghan faction known as the Taliban”. However, the measures are specified against aircraft (paragraph 4a.) and financial resources (paragraph 4b) “owned or controlled, directly or indirectly” by the Taliban. Since 1996, all central government apparatus, including all ministries, state and semi-state bodies, has been de facto controlled by the Taliban, the whole of the Afghan public sector is thus affected by the sanctions.

A Sanctions Committee has been established by the Security Council to oversee sanctions on Afghanistan. In the first year after the original imposition of sanctions, the Taliban have failed to comply with the demands of the Security Council and there have been no apparent moves towards resolution of the dispute between the Taliban and the Security Council. Widespread publicity has been given in Afghanistan to the likelihood of additional sanctions, which the Security Council may choose to impose at a later date.

1.2 *Rationale and Scope of the Study:*

The current study was prompted by OCHA’s standing responsibility outlined by the members of the UN General Assembly, the Secretary General and the Inter-Agency Standing Committee to examine the impact of sanctions on the humanitarian situation.

The key study objectives were :

- (1) to develop an overall analysis of the present situation with emphasis on the nature and scope of vulnerability and factors which affect it; including an assessment of the direct and indirect implications of economic sanctions including for example on food security, health/nutrition status, displacement/migration/repatriation, social cohesion and coping mechanisms, poverty and employment opportunities, crime and the criminalized economy,

- psychological effects and its implications for the peace process, and the role and work of assistance actors; and
- (2) to determine whether there are any discernible direct or indirect effects which can be attributed to the existing sanctions regime particularly in relation to vulnerable groups.

Study terms of reference are presented in the appendix.

1.3 The Context of the Sanctions Regime

The study of sanctions in Afghanistan has been conducted at a time when there is a growing awareness of the debate on the effectiveness of United Nations imposed sanctions. The adverse humanitarian impact of political and economic coercive measures has always been a concern and the United Nations has adopted several different approaches to trying to alleviate these. There have been calls for a rethinking of the nature of sanctions measures, so as to focus on “smart sanctions”, measures that target only the party whose behaviour the United Nations seeks to change, and not the civilian population directly. In order to do this, a methodology has been developed that provides for the analysis of the humanitarian impact of sanctions.² (See section 1.5)

Studies show that the humanitarian implications of sanctions are most likely when the measures are economic in nature (because economic measures may impact on people’s ability to sustain a decent standard of living), **and when the population is already poor.** Although the current or future Afghanistan sanctions directly target the Taliban, a non-state actor, the humanitarian implications may directly or indirectly affect the population as a whole. This is especially true in Afghanistan, which has a large proportion of its population living in an extremely vulnerable situation

1.4 Afghanistan’s experience of sanctions

United Nations Security Council measures were preceded by unilateral measures imposed by the United States, which imposed an investment ban on areas in Afghanistan controlled by the Taliban.

However, in addition to the Security Council sanctions, Afghans have much experience of internal measures similar to sanctions regimes, imposed by the warring parties at various stages during the protracted conflict. Any humanitarian consequences of Security Council sanctions should be seen in the context of the continuing conflict and the numerous factors, which impose suffering on the civilian population. The war has seen several internal sanctions regimes. During sieges of the capital, Kabul, in the period 1992-96, Hizb Islami restricted food movements into the city. The blockade of Hazarajat by the Taliban during 1996 – 1998 caused severe food shortages and hardship in that area. An internal sanctions regime was again in place at the time of the study; imposed by the Taliban on areas controlled by the opposition (i.e. forces loyal to the Islamic State of Afghanistan, ISA). In contrast to Security Council measures, internal sanctions regimes in Afghanistan have typically specifically targeted food and medical supplies and have immediate and direct

² E.g. OCHA/Claude Bruderlein, 1998; Paul 1998; Minear 1998.

humanitarian consequences for civilians living in the sanctioned areas. But it is of note that elaborate evasion mechanisms have emerged in response to each case of internal sanctions. Implementation has generally been patchy, there has been collusion between smugglers and those forces charged with implementing blockades, and both parties have enriched themselves at the expense of civilians living in the blockaded areas. **Internal sanctions regimes, imposed by warring factions, have clearly aggravated the suffering of the civilian population in Afghanistan, but also show how sanctions regimes can be exploited or evaded by the wealthy or powerful elite.**

1.5 Study methodology

The study uses a methodology which has been developed for the UN Department of Humanitarian Affairs (now OCHA) for preassessing and monitoring the humanitarian impacts of current (and future) sanctions.³ We have tried to ensure that the assessment of humanitarian implications of sanctions on Afghanistan is informed by latest international experience in managing and assessing sanctions, from a humanitarian perspective.

There are two main elements in the methodology :

- (1) Review of the current state of vulnerability of the Afghan population *and*
- (2) Assessment of direct and indirect effects attributable to the sanctions measures already in place; (*sanctions monitoring*)

An interim summary report was prepared and circulated in August 2000. This report was also made available on the World Wide Web (on the United Nations Afghanistan assistance site). A draft of the complete report was circulated in September 2000. This report is compiled after taking into consideration comments and feedback on the draft.

Further details of the methodology are given in the appendices.

2 Vulnerability in Afghanistan – the sanctions baseline

2.1 HEALTH AND SOCIAL INDICATORS

The health situation in Afghanistan is amongst the worst in the world as a result of underlying poverty, the economic and institutional disruption associated with the protracted war and the near total collapse of the public sector. Some limited progress has been made in recent years in extending health service provision. But it is almost totally dependent on the foreign assistance programme.

The best available health statistics with a national coverage are from a UNICEF 1997 sample survey. The survey gives conservative estimates of the severity of the health crisis in Afghanistan.

- Children born in Afghanistan are twice as likely to die before their first birthday as children born in neighbouring South Asian countries.

³ Minnear (1998)

- Afghanistan's infant mortality rates are comparable with the poorest countries in the world.
- According to WHO the maternal mortality rate is 1,700 per 100,000 live births, or the second highest rate in the world.
- Malnutrition among children in Afghanistan is one third higher than in the poorest countries and one and a half times the average in South Asian countries.
- Most children in Afghanistan are still not vaccinated against major diseases
- Only around 5% of the Afghan population have access to safe drinking water.
- Underlying the social collapse is persistent illiteracy: barely 15% of the adult population can read.

Table 1 : Health indicators⁴

INDICATOR	UNIT	AFGHAN- ISTAN	LDC S ⁵	SOUTH ASIA	NOTE
Infant mortality rate	Per thousand infants	140	147	72	
Maternal mortality rate	Per hundred thousand	373	632	362	SA and LDC figs are simple averages of all countries reporting
Child malnutrition	per cent	64%	39%	49%	Under-5 child malnutrition : sum of wt/ht and ht/ag, 2SD below median
Child vaccination/ measles	per cent	34%	49%	66%	Calculated of children 12-23 mths vaccinated
Access to safe water	per cent	5%	61%	82%	AGN calc assuming 15% urban, 85% rural
Adult literacy	per cent	15%	49%	54%	

2.2 POPULATION AND DISPLACEMENT

Afghanistan has one of the highest numbers of people with refugee or displaced status in the world (see Table 2). Iran and Pakistan host, respectively, 1.4 and 1.2 million Afghan refugees. Both of these host nations promote repatriation and neither is enthused about the prospect of receiving new flows of refugees.⁶ On 9 November 2000, Pakistan officially closed its border with Afghanistan to new refugees.⁷ Although UNHCR has a repatriation plan for refugees in Iran and Pakistan, Afghans do not voluntarily return in large numbers given the continuing military conflict, the difficult economic situation, the on-going drought, limited social services, the human rights situation, and the policies and practices of the authorities.

⁴ All Afghanistan figures in table above are national estimates, drawn from the UNICEF 1997 Multiple Indicator Baseline. All other country comparisons are drawn from the Human Development Report 2000, using latest year data, which is generally 1998.

⁵ Least Developed Countries

⁶ A letter signed by 154 of 290 Iranian parliamentarians on 13 August 2000, stated that the presence of Afghan refugees "created problems for Iranians" and called on President Khatami to start preparing for their return home.

⁷ At the time of report release, the border has been at least partially re-opened.

Repatriation clearly affects levels of vulnerability in that re-absorption of returnees in war-affected areas imposes a significant burden on the returnees themselves, home communities and the assistance agencies. A 1999 UNHCR survey of 3,270 returnee household heads found that 27% of returnees did not hold regular jobs, 21% found their houses “completely destroyed,” 14% faced problems with land mines or unexploded ordnance, as many as 46% did not have access to any kind of health

Table 2 : Population and displacement - qualitative indicators

2.1.1 Concentrations of refugees:

- 1.4 million Afghan refugees in Iran (UNHCR 1999)
- 1.2 million Afghan refugees in Pakistan (1999)
- Recent months have seen a three to four fold increase of new refugee arrivals in Pakistan.

2.1.2 Repatriation

- A survey of four southern provinces (ADA) indicated that 16% of the population is still in exile
- A survey of Helmand Province (UNDCP) found that 13% of the population is still in exile
- 107,000 refugees assisted by UNHCR to return to Afghanistan, including 93,000 from Pakistan and 14,000 from Iran)
- Repatriation from Iran has been increasing and has reached 100,000 per year in 1999/2000

2.1.3 Internal displacement

- Internal displacement, flows : an estimated 200,000 people were displaced by conflict during 1999, including 100,000 moving to Kabul
- Internal displacement concentrations : 55% of the current population of Kabul has been displaced from its normal place of residence (CSO 2000)

Source : UNHCR 1999, UNDCP 2000, ADA 1999.

services, and 79% of the families with school-age children did not have any children at school. In addition to the external caseload of refugees, the continuing conflict is generating new flows of internally displaced people. In Afghanistan, a significant proportion of the urban population are people who have been displaced by different episodes of fighting. Military offensives in 1999 resulted in the displacement of an estimated 200,000 Afghans and the pattern was repeated in 2000, with the renewal of conflict in north eastern Afghanistan.

2.3 ECONOMIC INDICATORS

Such economic indicators as are available **indicate a severe economic crisis is contributing to widespread vulnerability in Afghanistan.** Production, income, and trade have fallen. Destruction in the war has been widespread and profound and progress towards rehabilitation has been extremely limited. The most significant aspect of the current economic situation is the significant shortfall of food production that has been caused by the severe drought in year 2000. Grain surplus areas such as northern Afghanistan experienced a total failure of the wheat crop. This is giving rise to an **unprecedented food deficit.** Aid agencies are in the process of scaling up assistance activities, particularly through WFP wheat assistance.

2.3.1 Destitution

There is a broad consensus in the assistance community that much of the Afghan population is living in acute poverty, with concentrations in various areas that have suffered particular deprivation (associated with the war), or that have attracted concentrations of poor migrants and internally displaced, or that have suffered longer term (pre-war) deprivation. However, there is a distinct shortage of credible poverty studies.

Latest estimates from vulnerability monitoring by WFP⁸ indicate that around 933,000 are at risk from severe food shortages. (Based on estimates of numbers of people who cannot secure minimum food requirements in 2000, even after liquidating all their assets and exhausting opportunities for wage labour).

Kabul is one of the areas with a concentration of poor people, because of the collapse of the urban economy during the 1992-96 conflict and the large numbers of internally displaced people and migrants in the city. **Three recent studies have found that some 50% to 51% of the Kabul population is “vulnerable”.** The VAM 1998 study uses the notion of vulnerability as a lack of secure access to adequate food, and is based on analysis of income, assets and earning possibilities. The MEDAIR and GAA 1999 studies were based on direct observation of housing conditions and household assets in a large scale survey, jointly covering 19,250 households, across the city. The starkly inadequate living conditions used in the GAA and MEDAIR definition of vulnerability mean that, although this is not formally an income poverty indicator, the people classified as vulnerable in the surveys would with little doubt fall under any reasonably defined income poverty line. Taking the 50% to 51% estimates of the incidence of poverty, **there is significantly more acute poverty in Afghanistan than in the South Asian neighbours. Instead, the country is more on a par with the group of lowest human development countries.**

The coping capacity of the civilian population has been severely weakened as a result of the war and the erosion of many traditional coping mechanisms including in particular the role of extended family networks. According to a survey conducted by ICRC in 1999 a “remarkable 83 percent of Afghan respondents say that the war forced them to leave their homes.” More than half of the respondents (53%) reported that a member of their immediate family was killed during the conflict and 16% reported knowing someone who was raped. The situation of females is such that practically all the households without an able-bodied male are vulnerable; they rely on food aid, children's work, and begging to survive. The cut-back in the limited possibilities that were available for women's employment outside the home will further exacerbate this situation.

The level of vulnerability in rural areas is also of major concern. In some areas, for example in Hazarajat, the combination of war and drought has resulted in a significant increase in morbidity and mortality, particularly during spring measles and whooping cough epidemics.

In terms of food availability, FAO has declared Afghanistan to be among the three hungriest countries in the world.

⁸ WFP “Impending food crisis in Afghanistan”, Country Office Afghanistan, November 7th, 2000

Table 3 : Economic indicators - poverty and destitution⁹

INDICATOR	AFGHAN-ISTAN	LDC'S	SOUTH ASIA	NOTES
3.1.1 GDP per capita	\$350	\$280	\$490	Afg. figure is an estimate for 1996.
3.1.2 Consumption poverty	50% - 51% (Kabul)	49%	36%	Kabul figure based on direct observation of families living in grossly sub-standard accommodation. Comparator figures are for population below national poverty line

2.3.2 The elite economy

Despite the widespread poverty and destruction, an elite economy persists in niches. Urban property prices provide one proxy indicator to monitor the fate of this part of the economy over time. A house in a “good” part of Kabul costs 85 times the estimated per capita GDP. Purchase prices of upmarket residential property in the capital remain relatively buoyant. This reflects the enhanced security and is an indicator of the persistence of some parts of the economy with high incomes and asset holdings. With the well established opium and heroin economy, high level of activity in smuggling to Pakistan, lack of representative or accountable government and ruling authorities with a very limited political or social base, high levels of income or wealth inequality should be unsurprising. While the majority is vulnerable, the Afghanistan war economy offers opportunities for some to prosper. The limited evidence from experience of internal sanctions regimes, which have given rise to smuggling and profiteering of the goods in question, already suggests that **internal** blockades may exacerbate this process of increasing income equality. Typical Kabul residential properties exchange hands for up to \$45,000,¹⁰ at a time when half of the population of the city lives in grossly inadequate accommodation.

2.3.3 Economic destruction and recovery

There is a clear pattern of massive destruction of the economic infrastructure throughout the country. This happened through both direct destruction as a result of fighting and widespread looting of assets during the 1992-1996 civil war period. Functional machines were looted from factories and sold for scrap. In addition to actual destruction, there has been a hiatus in investment, as most serious investors have been deterred by the war. Electricity consumption per head is one thirtieth of the figure for neighbouring South Asia. The transport fleet is down to at least half that of the pre-civil war level. Most of the coal mines are now inoperative and production is

⁹ CSO 1374 and CSO 2000, for GDP estimate. UNCHS 2000 for poverty. Comparators HDR 2000.

Note : the Afghanistan GDP per capita estimate can at best be considered a rough estimate of the order of magnitude, rather than a precise statistic. It is based on reported 1374 (1995) GDP of Afs.71,600,000,000 at 1357 (1978) prices. The LDC and South Asia figures are GNP (i.e. not GDP) per capita, 1998 figures, in current USD, no PPP adjustment.

¹⁰ Data from Kabul property dealers July 00

down to one thirtieth of pre-war levels. Cement production fell by 90% during the 1992-1996 civil war period.

Some rehabilitation of the infrastructure and investment is visible in the more stable parts of the country, since 1996, but there are signs that this development in itself has been an adjustment to or extension of the war economy. Recent investment trends provide some evidence of a reorientation towards exploitation (and export) of non-renewable natural resources. This would bring the Afghan economy more in line with other protracted-war economies.¹¹ Raw timber has become a major export, with the exploitation of the south east Afghanistan forests (328,000 cubic feet in a quarter). Raw marble has also become a major export. Reportedly over 300 MT are exported daily from Helmand to Baluchistan, generating revenue in the order of \$1.2 million annually. Several contracts have been awarded for the extraction of precious metals (for example the Kayan gold mines) and precious stones.

The manufacturing sector remains almost dormant. The basic industries of cement, coal, and textiles are all producing at a fraction of previously installed capacity, with no progress on rehabilitation. Fertilisers provide an interesting exception, where there was no damage to the one existing plant, and as the product is highly marketable, the whole output is auctioned off on contract, to a local business (currently Abdul Bari). Production statistics are no longer available, since the move to contracting the full output. In pharmaceuticals Hoechst has started small scale operations, and is fabricating 14 formulations in Kabul, and employing 60 personnel. There have been some negotiations to rehabilitate the looted textile plants. Finally, deals have been negotiated to rehabilitate an oil refining industry, with approved projects for up to three oil refineries. They involve joint ventures with Global Petroleum Pakistan, Abdul Bari and CCC limited. However, no actual major manufacturing or oil and gas project has got underway. In particular, the major pipeline projects (UNOCAL and Bidas, between Turkmenistan and Pakistan), which had for a while been seen as the major source of investment into the country, have both been suspended. **Businesspersons consulted during the study indicated clearly that the fear of future sanctions and the instability in the foreign relations of the Taliban constitute major deterrents to investment. Major investors are likely to hold back from actually committing themselves until there is a change in the investment climate, which of course is not limited to factors linked to sanctions.**

¹¹ See Paul Collier-led World Bank war economy research for evidence on the link between primary commodity exports and civil war.

Table 4 : Economic indicators - destruction and rehabilitation, by sector

SECTOR	PRE-WAR	CURRENT STATUS OF SECTOR	PROGRESS OF REHABILITATION
3.3.1 ROADS	21,000 km road network (primary and feeder) reported in 1980	17,000 km of network remained in 1993 (UNORSA study). Most major highways have been severely damaged, imposing high transport costs	6 major road rehab projects underway in public sector, but no overall plan. Projects are Jalalabad – Torkham, Kabul – Jalalabad, Kabul – Logar, Gardez– Khost, Shehr Saffa – Kandahar and Kot e Sangi – Company (plus urban road upgrading project in Kabul)
3.3.2 TRANSPORT FLEET	22,000 trucks and 12,300 buses reported in 1980	5,942 freight vehicles and 5,410 passenger vehicles reported currently	
3.3.3 POSTAL SERVICES		Post Office now operational under Min. of Communications, with deliveries to Agn's major cities and international links via van to Peshawar.	
3.3.4 TELE-COMMUNICATIONS	33,000 lines pre-war, 60% in Kabul	16,531 lines reported functional currently, in Kabul	Projects have been signed to bring no. lines up to 39,800. International phone links have been restored to Kabul & Kandahar. Recent telecommunications investments have included AWCC, with \$25m paid up, HCV (Germany) with \$600k paid up and a \$2.2m contract with ZTE and CEIEC (China) for 17,000 line exchanges, and with SURIA (UAE) for 5,000 mobile phones
3.3.5 POWER		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 521 MW installed capacity, including 383 MW hydro power • main hydro-power stations are Mayper, Naghlu, Kajaki and Otkhel. • Only 250 sub-stations, out of original 714 are still operational • 321 MKW electricity consumption, 1999 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Electrification of Kandahar undertaken, including 180k.m. of new transmission line • No major new production projects – main problems are in transmission • Electricity consumption is equivalent to 15 KWH per head, annual, compared to 96 KWH for LDC's and 479 for South Asia

Source : Ostrom 1997, Kabul ministries 2000

Table 5 : Economic indicators - production of basic goods

BASIC GOODS PRODUCTION			
3.4.1 Coal production	218,000 MT produced in 1979	Coal production now 7,427 MT annually (1999)	
3.4.2 Fertiliser production	123,300MT produced in 1987	25,000 MT produced in 1996	Quasi privatisation of only urea plant, as entire production is sold off at \$5.5 million to private investor, at up to 1000 MT daily
3.4.3 Cement production	104,000 MT 1987	15,000 MT 1996	
3.4.4 Timber production		328,000 cubft 1 st quarter 1421/2000 (exported to Pakistan)	

Source : Ostrom 1997, Kabul ministries 2000

Table 6 : Economic indicators - food production and trade

INDICATOR	AFGHANISTAN 2000	AFGHANISTAN PREVIOUS	COMPARISON – LDC'S	COMPARISON - SOUTH ASIA
3.5.1 Total cereal production	1,763,000 MT	3,236,000 MT (1999)		
3.5.2 Total cereal import requirements	2,104,000 MT	1,100,000 MT (1999)		
3.5.3 Food aid planned (total)	225,000 MT			
3.5.4 Food aid (kgs per capita)	10.5		5.7	1.4
3.5.5 Food production index, base 1989-91 = 100	64		119	121

Source : FAO/WFP Crop assessment 2000, Ostrom 1997,HDR 2000

2.3.4 International trade and vulnerability

The intensification of the drought in 2000 has led to a major shortfall in food production (46% reduction compared to 1999, which was itself a below average year) and increase in import requirements (92% increase relative to 1999).

The drought has already undone the economic gains associated with the de-intensification of the conflict in many areas of the country. Food production has fallen to two thirds of the level that prevailed at the end of the Soviet intervention, a decade ago, while the population in the same period has increased through both natural growth and the return of at least three million refugees. **The planned aid for Afghanistan barely covers 10% of the projected food import requirements.**

Table 7 : Economic indicators - trade volumes, 1421 (2000) first quarter

ITEM	VOLUME	UNIT
Carpets	234,000	cum
Gelims	82,000	cum
Timber	328,000	cuf
Processed sultanias	40,000	MT
Hides	140,000	pcs
Cotton	300	MT

Source: Ministry of Commerce, July 2000

The value of Afghanistan's exports declined by 85% in the decade from 1987 (the latter days of the Soviet intervention) to 1996 (the times of the Taliban arrival in Kabul). The largest single loss occurred from the end of natural gas exports. 1996 exports were a mere \$80 million. The latest export volumes, for traditional exports, are presented as baseline information.

2.3.5 Prices and exchange rates

Table 8 : Prices and exchange rate indicators

INDICATOR	1996	1997	1998	Jan'99- Oct'99 Period before sanctions	Nov 99 -Sep 00 Period after sanctions	NOTE
Wheat price (USD per kg)		0.32	0.22	0.20	0.21	At end of period
Exchange rate (KAF/USD)	2200	2690	4130	47488	61667	At end of period
Exchange rate (NAF/USD)	0	0	0			At end of period
Wheat price spread	3650	5150	8783	89250	121800	At end of period
	0	0	3	26%	54%	At end of period

Commodity wage rate (wheat kg/day)	N/A	N/A	5.8	7.3	5.4	At end of period
Currency depreciation (monthly average)	21.2	1.9	4.5	1.5	2.7	Average in period
Wheat price increase (monthly average)	N/A	12.9	0.2	1.2	3.2	Average in period

Table 9 : Price indices, post-sanctions

<i>INDICATOR</i>	<i>Index Sep 2000 (Oct 1999 = 100)</i>
Wheat price (Kabul)	135
Casual labour rate (Kabul)	100
Exchange rate (Kabul KAF/USD)	130

Food and labour markets in Afghanistan are characterised by :

- **Low real wage rates**
- **Moderate to high level of price instability (increase)**
- **Moderate to high level of exchange rate instability (depreciation)**

A relatively active private sector in parts of the country and minimal government controls have generally kept dollar denominated food prices in the medium term relatively stable. But in 1999 and 2000 there were significant shocks to the market, which gave rapid rises of prices in dollar terms also.

The country is vulnerable to currency and exchange rate instability. There has been a proliferation of currencies, with different versions of the Afghani exchanging at different rates against the dollar. This is one way in which the war economy and lack of governance have directly generated vulnerability for the population. The two main currencies are the NAF - Northern Afghani - (currently circulating in areas controlled by the ISA and some areas formerly controlled by General Dostum) and the KAF - Kabul Afghani - (circulating in Kabul and all southern areas controlled by the Taliban). The Taliban have not themselves printed currency and continue to use the series printed by the Rabbani government. However, they have the discretion to declare which series of the currencies they recognise as legal tender. There is thus a constant risk of speculation against the currencies and ultimately demonetisation. The most extreme case came in central Afghanistan, where the "Dal Ya" series of Afghanis circulated for two years, with wildly shifting exchange rates, before being abandoned.

Commodity wage rates offer the single most important index of vulnerability. The reduction in the amount of food purchasable from one days work since the imposition of sanctions is equivalent to the cost of 400g of wheat. This in effect puts the calorie intake of the average Afghan family under serious pressure. A labour market survey in all regional centres was conducted by WFP in November 2000. This concluded that the drought has severely affected labour markets around the country. The effects noted in the survey were :

- Reduction in real (wheat equivalent) wage rates
- Reduction in average numbers of days worked by casual workers (not enough work)

- Increase in the number of new entrants to the labour market (as migrants from drought affected areas move to urban areas in search of employment)

Worst affected was Mazar e Sherif, where the daily wage has fallen by almost half, from 6.4 k.g. wheat equivalent to 3.7 k.g.

2.4 CIVIL SOCIETY AND GOVERNANCE

There is ample evidence that Afghanistan lacks the institutions and mechanisms to protect and promote its people's rights. In particular there is a lack of democratic accountability at all levels. There are few mechanisms whereby the citizenry can make their views known, or where they can hold state or political functionaries to account. Many of those institutions that have survived the two decades of turmoil and the transition to rule by the Taliban are at risk of total collapse. Although Afghanistan is well known for the strength of its informal social organisations, including local elders councils (jirgas or shuras), there is evidence that these too are unable to directly challenge the policies of current authorities on national issues of governance. **There is no channel through which the population could pressure for compliance with sanctions.**

The almost total absence of any official or non-official apparatus for the monitoring and protection of human rights means that there is a chronic lack of systematic information on civil and political rights. (It should be noted that the IEA Foreign Minister did in 2000 commit the IEA to the establishment of its own Human Rights Commission). Therefore, where quantitative indicators are not available or not appropriate, the study tabulates key observations on civil society and governance. However, it is clear that if there is to be any serious attempt to monitor changes in the economic, humanitarian and political situation in Afghanistan, under a sanctions regime, then much more systematic information in the area of rights will be required.

2.4.1 Analysis of public expenditure priorities

One of Afghanistan's successes has been the preservation of the rubric of its public finance system. Modeled on the French public accounting system, the process of budget preparation and management of the central government expenditure continues as before the war. However there has been a collapse in the revenues available to the centrally organised public sector. The annual budget, at \$70.9 million, is equivalent to approximately 0.9% of GDP. This means that **Afghanistan allocates a smaller percentage of its national income to central government expenditure than any other country reporting in the UNDP Human Development Report.** The resources available to the public sector are woefully inadequate to enable it to make a meaningful contribution to the provision of public goods that other countries use to provide a social 'safety-net'.

Table 10 : Civil society and governance indicators - public finance

Indicator	Source	Afghanistan	LDC's	South Asia	Note
Central govt. expenditure, as % of GDP	HDR 2000 & IEA Budget 1421	0.95%	23.0%	17.8%	Afg figs for Y2k, others for 1997/8
Tax revenue, as % GDP	HDR 2000 & IEA Budget 1421	0.45%	10.9%	10.0%	Afg figs for Y2k, others for 1997/8
Budget deficit, as % GDP	HDR 2000 &	-0.50%	-3.0%	-5.4%	Afg figs for

	IEA Budget 1421				Y2k, others for 1997/8
Public expenditure on education, as % GDP	HDR 2000 & IEA Budget 1421	0.12%	2.5%	3.2%	Afg figs for Y2k, others for 1997/8
Public expenditure on education, as % govt. expenditure	HDR 2000 & IEA Budget 1421	13.05%	10.9%	18.0%	Afg figs for Y2k, others for 1997/8
Public expenditure on health, as % GDP	HDR 2000 & IEA Budget 1421	0.03%	1.3%	0.9%	Afg figs for Y2k, others for 1997/8
Public expenditure on health, as % govt expenditure	HDR 2000 & IEA Budget 1421	3.09%	5.7%	5.1%	Afg figs for Y2k, others for 1997/8

Source: IEA budget 1421 (1999-2000)

The government is simply unable to provide the two key public goods (education and health) upon which human development rests; thus prolonging dependence on (also under-resourced) foreign assistance and non-formal community based funding. In other country contexts, assistance agencies have increasingly developed their role as one complementary to indigenous efforts, placing an emphasis on the national public sector to secure rights or provide services. Repeatedly in Afghanistan, agencies hopeful of pursuing such an approach have found the authorities lacking the resources to respond themselves or provide any kind of social safety net. The explanation may be traced back to the institutional atrophy and chronic resource shortage. The experience of the 2000 drought has shown clearly that under-resourced authorities can make no meaningful contribution to reducing the population's vulnerability.

2.4.2 Public finance process

Although the rubric of the budgeting and public finance system is indeed still intact, the absence of any form of democratic control or role for civil society is striking. This is of course part of a broader problem of Afghanistan's war-torn political system, and not something peculiar to the budget process.

Table 11 : civil society and governance indicators - public finance process

Qualitative Indicators
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 4.2.1 Democratic accountability – there are no representative or popular institutions that could play a role in preparation, approval or supervision of the budget • 4.2.2 Institutional accountability – the Council of Ministers fulfils the basic budget oversight function, and has authority to review and approve the budget submitted by the budget committee, chaired by Ministry of Finance. All ministries make submissions to the budget committee. • 4.2.3 Involvement of civil society – there is no public debate or any form of civil society activity, concerning the budget. Limited civil society actions are issue specific, such as the summer 2000 Kabul protests and representations concerning electricity tariff rises • 4.2.4 Documentation – the budget is well documented, in a well presented, accessible and non-confidential summary • 4.2.5 Budget framework – French public accounting system has been retained • 4.2.6 Realism – high aspirations and low revenues available to the public sector make for an unrealistic budget • 4.2.7 Extra-budgetary processes – many resources that should be available to the public sector are excluded from the specific revenue and expenditure provisions in the central government budget. Issues of concern are (1) high provision for contingency, on code 9000, (2) separate financing of the “Tehreek e Taliban” and the Islamic Emirate and (3) non-reporting of locally and provincially generated resources

Source: interviews Kabul 2000

2.4.3 Public sector employment

Patterns of public sector employment in Afghanistan are clearly related to vulnerability. On the one hand, public sector employment was used by regimes up to 1992 as redistribution or social safety net mechanism and decline in the real value of public sector pay and of numbers employed, indicates a shrinking of the coverage of this safety net. On the other hand, the systematic use of political and gender-related criteria in selecting people to be retrenched further demonstrates the linkages between discrimination and vulnerability.

Approximately 131,235 people are now employed in the Afghan civil service. This is after a major exercise in “down-sizing” prior to the this year’s planning and budgeting round. 40% of state employees were shed in this exercise, with cuts imposed in all ministries, including Defence. The authorities have attributed the exercise to a resource shortage and previous bad management and over-staffing. (interview with Planning Minister). They have tried as far as possible to minimise the impact on any services provided by the public service, by sacking first those “employees” who are on the payroll but have not been attending for duty. However, many within this category are the female employees of the ministries (other than health), who had been ordered to stay at home since the Taliban takeover.

Table 12 : Civil society and governance indicators : public sector employment

INDICATOR	YEAR 2000 LEVEL
Number of public sector employees (2000 = 1421)	131,235
Number of public sector employees (1999 = 1420)	221,068
Absolute and percentage reduction between 1999 and 2000	89,833 (40%)
Number of public sector employees per thousand households	37

Source : Ministries, Kabul 2000

Note 4.3.4 assumes 6 person hhold

The 40% reduction in employment is a clear signal from the IEA authorities that they are not prepared to finance this form of social safety net. Overall, 37 public sector employees per 1000 households is relatively low (less than 1% of likely employment levels). However, public employment was largely concentrated in Kabul, where, correspondingly, the effect of the downsizing has been felt most. The key issue of concern is the lack of an adequate safety net, or any measures to help with the transition.

Although the spring down-sizing did happen within the six -months after imposition of Security Council sanctions, officials did not try to attribute it to the economic effects of the sanctions regime. The reduction of employment is part of the IEA approach to management of the public sector and was accompanied by a review of civil service pay. Salary scales for remaining public sector employees were enhanced. Although the IEA was unable to restore the previous “coupon” (food rations for civil servants), it did announce a semi-indexed daily food allowance, worth approximately \$0.3. Although civil services pay levels remain unrealistically low, the indexing may protect them from further purchasing power erosion.

2.4.4 Crime

Official statistics and claims by the Taliban indicate that serious crime is not a problem in Taliban controlled areas. Rapid assessment shows that at least in pockets, there is still a serious problem of personal insecurity, amounting to a violation of rights, that may be associated with ethnic discrimination. Sanctions assessments are meant to monitor crime levels as a possible indicator of social break down, that is thought likely in a country experiencing protracted economic crisis (associated with a severe, or long-term, sanctions regime). Crime statistics are presented here only as a baseline, as there are no indications that any of the effects of sanctions so far have been profound enough to translate into changes in criminality.

The prevalence (or absence) of serious crime in IEA controlled parts of Afghanistan is a matter of controversy, as a high level of crime and personal insecurity, especially in Kabul, had prevailed prior to the Taliban takeover and they promised to end this. Two contrasting pictures of personal security in today’s Kabul emerge. Serious crimes

reported to the security posts (police) in the city's 16 districts indicate that the Afghan capital is considerably more secure or crime free than comparable South Asia or LDC contexts. Only 584 serious crimes were reported in the city in 1999/2000. However, crime figures anywhere are only as good as the reporting system (and confidence of the crime victims in the local police). In particular, the crime figures do not include crimes committed by the authorities themselves, or where the victims suspect some such involvement and are reluctant to report an incident. For an alternative perspective, personal interviews were conducted in a small locality of West Kabul, which revealed a much higher (unreported) crime rate – 27 incidents of robbery with violence and 2 murders, over a three year period. This has been recalculated into equivalents per one hundred thousand residents, to provide a comparison with the official city-wide statistics and other countries. The figures are illustrative rather than descriptive in the sense that it is not known whether the high level of crime we encountered in West Kabul is localised, indicative of a problem in that part of the city (and the official low crime rate is accurate), or whether there is generally a high incidence of unreported crime (and the official crime rate understates the problem).

Table 13 : Civil society and governance indicators - crime¹²

INDICATOR	All Kabul 1999-2000	West Kabul locality 1997-2000	LDC's	South Asia (India)
4.4.1 Serious crimes per 100000 pop.	33	469	895	600
4.4.2 Homicides per 100000 pop in city	--	35	6.6	7.9

Source : calculated from Min of Interior Crime Dept, CSO Kabul 2000, personal interviews 2000, HDR 2000

In terms of vulnerability and the context of sanctions, any further economic deterioration and weakening of the security apparatus would risk the re-criminalisation of Afghanistan. The strong deterrents currently in force in IEA areas have undoubtedly reduced crime and enhanced personal security. But some of the problem has been driven underground in the form of the sort of unreported crime picked up in this study. And there is a risk that further weakening of institutions, persistence of the political crisis and deepening of the economic crisis could lead an increase in criminality.

¹² LDC figures are simple average of the three lowest human development countries, that reported crime figures. South Asia figures are for India only. Both figures are average national crime rates (i.e. not just big city rates). The Kabul figure is for serious crime, as reported to the district hauzas (police stations). It does not include state crimes such as arbitrary arrests. The West Kabul locality figures are drawn from personal interviews in a locality of 500 households, as a comparison to the police reporting statistics.

2.4.5 Censorship and access to information

Afghanistan is perhaps the most acute example of the growing “information gap”. While other countries have pushed ahead with gaining access to modern communications and information technology, Afghanistan has been falling behind even in access to conventional technologies. The information management regime is strikingly reminiscent of Soviet era media management. Within Afghanistan, there is a total absence of freedom of speech and no access to domestic non-state controlled media. In this context of lack of freedom of expression, disinformation and deliberate manipulation of facts in the state controlled media are rife.

Access to information is relevant for monitoring and assessment of sanctions (i) because it is one factor which indicates the strength of civil society and likelihood of domestic pressure for resolution of sanctions related issues, and (ii) because prolonged economic and political crisis associated with economic sanctions may also lead to a deterioration in this domain also.

Table 14 : Civil society and governance indicators - access to information

INDICATOR	AFGHANISTAN	KABUL	LDC'S	SOUTH ASIA
4.5.1 Number of banned books	165 (as of Jul 2000)	*	*	*
4.5.2 Number of telephones per 1000 pop (functional)	0.8	9.3	36	22
4.5.3 Number of telephones per 1000 pop (planned)	1.9	19.5	*	*

Source : Ministry of Communications, HDR 2000

The I.T. sector has been the subject of some proposals for investment. But the plans are limited in scale and scope, inadequate to close the overall gap and reflecting primarily the requirements of a small political and commercial elite. It seems clear that the demand for access to international telephones and even Internet services comes foremost from the military-political leadership and some international traders. The disincentives for further expansion in this sector, while sanctions persist, include the lack of access to banks for financial transactions, the risk of penalties in case of transactions being judged to favour the Taliban and the general uncertainty over possible future measures.

Access to information through other media is just as limited, with less sign of progress. In terms of print media, the three national language daily newspapers printed in the capital have had to shift to a biweekly basis i.e. they share access to one printing press and each appear for two days only. Furthermore, they are directly controlled by the Ministry of Culture and their print run has been reduced to 1% of what it was in the 1980's. The Ministry of Culture is actively involved in censorship of the print media and has produced a list of 165 banned books. It has demanded that

all locally published periodicals be submitted for censorship by the ministry (although in reality, the easy accessibility of printing presses in neighbouring Pakistan means that the Ministry cannot fully control access to the print media). All radio within the country is controlled by the Taliban and used by them to promote official accounts of current affairs. Only the foreign radio stations offer some access to non-official perspectives. The local language foreign radio broadcasts do represent a view point that is clearly noted by the authorities.

There is a single resident foreign journalist in the country. New regulations introduced during the period of the study severely restrict the mobility and freedom of operation of both resident and visiting journalists. Restrictions include use of official translator, prior clearance for travel outside capital, prior permissions for photography, including filming and visits to homes, and compulsory use of official cars and hotels. The formal restrictions are supplemented with official guidance on what to report. Television in Afghanistan is banned.

There have been attempts to rehabilitate the telephone network, with the signing of several investment deals. However, to reach to the levels of the lowest human developments countries (LDCs), Afghanistan would require three quarters of a million phones country-wide and 64,000 in Kabul alone. The current investment plans only aim for half of what would be required in Kabul and a twentieth of what would be required in the country as a whole. The traders and rulers have been given access to a few international lines and even mobile phones, but the overwhelming majority of the population has no access to telephones.

2.4.6 Freedom of association

Freedom of association is one factor determining the dynamic of sanctions - whether the populace is able to apply pressure for policy change. However, in IEA controlled areas, it is clear that there is no freedom of association. All overtly political activities are banned. Limited forms of association are tolerated, connected with commercial activity and welfare, including the local community organisations promoted in many assistance programmes. However interviews made it clear that participants in these activities fear that the authorities, assisted by their intelligence network, will suppress any form of political activity or dissent. Therefore, participants and organisers involved in welfare and community organisation scrupulously avoid activities and issues that could be construed as political, or beyond their welfare and service oriented brief.

A comprehensive study of freedom of association and dynamics of sanctions would also have to address the issue of traditional and non-formal forms of organisation, the extent to which they are free to associate and the extent to which they are able to access authorities with regard to issues such as response to sanctions. In terms of the baseline, the limitation on freedom of association is already so extensive that there is little scope to register any future deterioration. However, in terms of the dynamics of sanctions, **the lack of freedom of association should make it clear that there are no avenues for advancing any popular demands regarding the implications of sanctions or regarding policy in dealing with the international community on sanctions.**

Table 15 : Civil society and governance indicators - freedom of association

INDICATOR	FIGURE OR OBSERVATION FOR AFGHANISTAN
Number of registered NGOs (national)	259
Number of registered NGOs (international)	67
Status of trade associations	Most trade associations inactive since arrival of Taliban. Only the Transporters Association operates (because of strong commercial interest)
Status of professional associations	The key pre-1992 associations have now been suppressed or gone largely dormant, including associations of Writers, Poets, Journalists, Lawyers, Linguists and Artists
Freedom of political association	Political association is not tolerated. No political party, including the previous jihadi parties, can operate in IEA areas

Source : Ministry of Planning, interviews Kabul 2000

2.5 COVERAGE OF AND DEPENDENCE ON HUMANITARIAN ACTION

2.5.1 Levels of assistance

At the levels of assistance prevailing in 2000, some 1,490,537 Afghans are directly receiving or due to receive emergency food assistance. The greatest concentration of recipients of this emergency assistance is in Kabul (e.g. 47% of the total WFP assistance is delivered through the Kabul office, mainly through the bakeries project). Generally agencies are constrained by the availability of resources, rather than by the numbers of vulnerable people i.e. there are many more people who require assistance than are actually included in the programmes. A direct indicator of this was provided by ICRC, that conducted an experiment in direct bread sales, in cooperation with the Kabul Silo, in autumn 1999. Daily bread sales reached 7,000. Recipients (who had to turn up individually, daily, to purchase the bread) surveyed were predominantly poorer than those benefiting from ongoing commodity distributions or subsidised bread sales.

The implication of this experiment is that notwithstanding current levels of assistance in Kabul, there is extensive deprivation not being addressed by humanitarian agencies.

Table 16 : Humanitarian assistance indicators - key “safety net” projects

AGENCY/PROJECT	NUMBERS ASSISTED		TYPE OF ASSISTANCE	PERIOD
	Families	Individuals		
WFP – bakeries project	83,200	499,201	Subsidized bread sales	1 st 4 mths 2000
WFP – other emergency projects	111,167	667,000	Wheat distribution and emergency food for work	2000, 12 mths, planned
ICRC – Kabul distributions	21,699	130,194	Half rations, for widows and disabled	First quarter 2000
ICRC – IDP distributions	1,657	9,942	Half rations (other than in Kabul)	First quarter 2000
Afghan Red Crescent Society	24,000	144,000	Ration distribution	12 months 1420 (1999)
Ministry of Martyrs and Refugees – once off	6,500	39,000	commodity distribution (part ration)	6 months 1420
Ministry of Martyrs and Refugees – regular distribution	200	1,200	Full ration, monthly	6 months 1420
	248,423	1,490,537		

Source : WFP, ICRC, Ministries in Kabul 2000

In terms of total volume of commodity assistance, WFP projected a figure of 225,000 MT wheat assistance for the year 2000/2001 (Crop Assessment). However there is uncertainty regarding both the volume of assistance and the period over which it will be available. Thus this figure should be taken as a minimal estimate of requirements.

It is also clear that here is no meaningful social safety net offered by the public sector in Afghanistan. Assistance from the Ministry of Martyrs and Refugees is negligible. In principle the Islamic Welfare Tax, zakat, is available for assistance of the destitute. In reality, coverage is limited and there is no mechanism for transfer between localities (i.e. the population of the richer parts of the country cannot help the poorer parts of the country).

The overall scale of the international assistance effort is one proxy indicator of vulnerability and minimum needs. The aid agency programmes are generally based on assessments, and numerous reports indicate outstanding needs in excess of those met by the assistance programmes actually delivered. The level of vulnerability is compounded by the lack of alternatives to the international assistance programme. In simple resource terms, the value of the public sector budget was equivalent to little more than a quarter of the value of the international community's year 2000 appeal for Afghanistan. The scale of public sector resources or activities relevant to welfare or social safety nets was negligible. **The figures show that there is a relatively high**

dependence on internationally financed safety nets, there are many deserving people left outside the assistance schemes and there is no national alternative to international assistance.

The most striking feature of the scale and nature of assistance activities in Afghanistan in 2000 is perhaps the dominance of the drought. A programme that was already emergency-oriented has had to scale up to face a major new disaster. Most of the country is in the grip of a severe drought, considered to be the worst in 30 years. Assessments suggest that by June 2001 at least half of the populations of Afghanistan may be affected by drought including three to four million severely and another eight to twelve million moderately. So far the hardest hit has been the Kuchi nomads; some eighty per cent of their livestock is reportedly dead. The drought has also caused the loss of 90 per cent of the crops in the majority of rain-fed areas while the rest of the crop quality is exceptionally poor this year.¹³ There have been reports of famine-related deaths in Hazarajat; given the difficulty of gaining access to the population in this area, there is growing concern about potential significant displacement from there and other drought-affected areas. Aid agencies have begun to report population movements to urban areas including in particular to Herat. Recent refugee flows can also be attributed in part to the drought. In addition to the regular consolidated Appeal for Afghanistan, assistance agencies estimated requirements to address the drought, over a twelve-month period, at \$70.3 million i.e. the equivalent of the total public sector budget. The drought was a recurrent theme raised in interviews conducted with Afghans during the study. Afghan interlocutors considered it self-evident that at a time when the country is facing its most widespread drought ever, and when the humanitarian agencies were gearing up to respond to the acute need, the country would not be in a position to absorb any additional economic shocks.

2.5.2 Ability of humanitarian agencies to deliver services

Aid agencies can only respond to the massive need in Afghanistan as long as the operating environment allows them to do so. The study showed that in summer 2000, the operating environment was relatively favourable and agencies were confident of their ability to deliver services effectively. The first round of sanctions had not posed insurmountable obstacles in terms of continued humanitarian action, but in the course of the study there were indications of a deterioration, that augured badly, including for the security of humanitarian personnel for future rounds of sanctions.

One of the most notable results of the discussions on operating environment in July/August 2000 was that humanitarian agencies generally consider that their relations with the authorities are tolerably good and that they are indeed able to work effectively. Neither UN nor NGOs have faced any sustained problems or hostility arising from the sanctions imposition. The Planning Minister clearly made the point that the IEA understands and respects the distinction between the humanitarian and

¹³ Cereal output for 2000 is estimated by WFP at 1.82 million tons, which will be 44% lower than the drought-affected 1999 output. Afghanistan has a minimum requirement of more than 4 millions tons of cereals per year, which raises the need for imported cereal to a record level of 2.3 million tons in 2000.

political wings of the United Nations i.e. humanitarian agencies operating in the country would not be held responsible for the actions of the Security Council. However, there was a different message from Kandahar, in that the main Taliban spokesman clearly stated that he expected there would be a much more widespread and sustained response to any extension/intensification of sanctions. He said that he believes that there is an underlying popular resentment at the Security Council action so far, that could extend to spontaneous protests against humanitarian agencies in particular UN Agencies in the event of tougher measures being imposed.

A marked deterioration in the relationship between the humanitarian agencies and the authorities occurred in the second half of the study. Some of these were linked to the edict banning the employment of Afghan Aid Agency female staff outside the health section. In particular there were several examples of renewed official restrictions on the freedom of operation of the aid agencies and direct harassment of aid agency staff.

However, there is widespread concern within the assistance community that any tightening of sanctions against one party to the conflict is likely to have negative implications for the operating environment and by extension on the capacity of humanitarian agencies to provide support that is critical for the survival of many.

Table 17 Humanitarian action - operating environment

- **5.2.1 Over-all impressions** : in July/August 2000, there seemed to be a general consensus among aid agencies operating in IEA areas that operating conditions and relations with the authorities are relatively good, that they are definitely better than during the peak of the civil war (1992-96) and that they have not noticeably deteriorated since imposition of sanctions.
- **5.2.2 Personal security** : staff feel relatively secure, more so than in many other war contexts
- **5.2.3 Agency logistics** : agencies are able, without difficulty or risk, to transport their commodities within the country, at least where no crossing of front lines is involved
- **5.2.4 International staff and visas** : in general the visa regime is relatively liberal and staff can generally expect to obtain visas within a reasonable period (normally maximum 2 weeks). Some agencies (NGOs) complained of a period in spring 2000 in which the IEA authorities restricted visas for UK and US nationals, ostensibly due to sanctions. And similarly new restrictions were imposed on international personnel travelling domestically by ICRC. They were informed that the IEA would only authorise such personnel to travel on Ariana, in response to sanctions.
- **5.2.5 National staff** : NGO's are generally able to hire and retain national male staff at will, with no official interference. It remains extremely difficult to employ national female staff. The UN has committed itself to prior security screening of proposed staff members by the authorities. This emerged as a major issue during the study period, as the authorities complained that the UN had breached this procedure (ostensibly the IEA was responding to this by banning all agency employment of women).
- **5.2.6 Humanitarian access** : NGO access is relatively unrestricted. The UN has faced intermittent restrictions on access to parts of the country which are not priorities for, or not controlled by the IEA. Most notably, the UN was unable to proceed with planned distributions of assistance in Shomali and Pansheer, as throughout 2000 the IEA has blocked it from renewing cross-line operations from Kabul
- **5.2.7 The immediate aftermath of sanctions imposition** : there was a violent, but short-lived reaction to sanctions. Crowds attacked UN offices in Mazar, Kabul, Kandahar and Farah and there were hostile demonstrations in many places and aid personnel were forced to stay away from work. However, the IEA authorities moved rapidly to control the situation within two days. Aid agencies consulted were not aware of any residual hostility.
- **5.2.8 Volatility of the situation** : although the general impression of agency representatives was that the operating environment is benign, all would recognise that it is volatile. The most obvious example of this is the issue of the Taliban edict on female employment. During the study period, Mullah Omar issued a decree banning Afghan women from working with aid agencies, except in the health sector. Because of the importance of women being able to access aid agencies, this move has jeopardised aid programmes in Afghanistan and could cancel out all the other favourable aspects in the operating environment.

Source: interviews

3 Direct effects of sanctions under Security Council Resolution 1267

3.1 Ariana Afghan Airlines and international travel

The most direct effect of sanctions has been on Ariana Afghan Airlines. A detailed case study is presented in the appendices. Ariana is a state-owned company and is therefore presumed “directly or indirectly controlled by the Taliban”. Its aeroplanes are prohibited from taking off or landing outside Afghanistan, without the prior permission of the Sanctions Committee. In practice this has meant a suspension of Ariana’s international flights, while domestic flights have continued to operate fully. In the first year of sanctions two humanitarian flights of war-affected children to Germany has been permitted, and latterly one maintenance flight of a Boeing 727, to Jordan. Flights of 8,000 pilgrims to Mecca were permitted in 2000.

For most people in Afghanistan, there is no direct alternative to Ariana. Ariana was the main provider of passenger and cargo services, directly between Afghanistan and India, Dubai and Sharjah, and thence to international networks. No other airlines operate to Afghanistan. Latterly, a small private operator (Dolphin Air) has started a weekly flight between Kandahar and Sharjah. There are still no links to India.

The most severe effects are felt within Ariana Airlines itself. On one level, the airline has coped well with sanctions, and is defiant in the way it has continued to serve all regional destinations in Afghanistan, with a more extensive network than at any time since the early 1980’s. But defiance has been achieved at a cost. Loss of access to its international routes has caused a sharp fall in revenues and wiped out the company’s operating surplus. The company survives by minimising expenditure; it continues as a low cost airline. Bonuses have been cut, salaries kept down, minimal provision is made for maintenance and payments to the Islamic Emirate for fuel supplied to the company are deferred. The company employed 1,300 people at the time of sanctions imposition. 260 of these were made redundant in September 2000. Earnings for those remaining in Ariana have been cut because of the loss of flight bonuses, lack of any year-end bonus and reduced overtime. The Boeing fleet was previously maintained abroad. A reduction in flying hours of the Boeings has enabled a deferral of overhauls and latterly the Sanctions Committee has authorised a resumption of overhauls in Jordan. However, the fleet of five Antonovs used for domestic flights are now exclusively maintained within Afghanistan, with no insurance or supervision, and with this maintenance dependent on the company’s ability to cannibalise or locate and finance purchase of spare parts abroad. From inside and outside the company, extreme concerns have been raised about the safety standards on the fleet of planes which now carry all domestic passengers.

Sanctions have contributed to the long term decline in the airline’s capacity. Most directly, sanctions led to the reversal of a contract to upgrade the fleet with the induction of a Boeing 747. During the survey, it was reported that Ariana has suffered a major loss of assets. In the first place a fine of some three million dollars was imposed for cancellation of the purchase contract.

Other aspects of the long-term decline of the airline include demoralisation and difficulty in retaining key staff. No provision is now made for technical training

abroad of personnel and there is continued under-funding of, and decline in, the standards of the aviation training institutes in Kabul. Sanctions did not initiate the process of decline in standards and capacity in civil aviation in Afghanistan, but they now constitute a strong contributory factor.

Assistance personnel continue to have access to aid agency-operated flights, as the United Nations, I.C.R.C. and Pactec all fly to Kabul and regional centres in Afghanistan. Most agencies had already, prior to sanctions, prohibited staff from flying Ariana. However, the Taliban have sought to pass on some of the effects to aid agencies. They have restricted authorisation for non governmental agency personnel to use I.C.R.C. flights domestically, insisting that instead they should fly Ariana, and thus contribute to its revenue (and expose personnel to the same risks faced by other Ariana passengers).

The International Air Travel Association has also raised concerns over the maintenance standards in the air traffic system in Afghanistan. The Civil Aviation authority in Afghanistan is subject to the same financial sanctions that apply to all state bodies. However, a humanitarian exemption is provided in the sanctions resolution, to provide access to finance for the air traffic control system. Despite the war, Afghanistan has remained an important transit route for air traffic between Europe and South Asia or the Far East. Revenue from the transit traffic is, under the sanctions regime, held in an ESCROW account. This account has now been successfully accessed, with IATA supervision, for upgrading air traffic communications facilities. International air safety depends on the authority's ability to continue upgrading infrastructure, to retain key staff and to arrange staff development

The case of Ariana Airlines illustrates the problems of defining boundaries to “humanitarian” issues.

- **The decline in safety standards and increased risk of crashes clearly is an issue of humanitarian concern**
- **Reduced earning opportunities for 1,200 employees, against a backdrop of economic crisis and lack of alternative sources of income**
- **Loss of cargo and passenger services has humanitarian implications dealt with in other sections of this report**

3.2 Case study of Indira Gandhi Paediatric Hospital, Kabul

During the survey it was pointed out that, within the health sector, the impact of sanctions have been felt most directly by Indira Gandhi Paediatric Hospital. The hospital is a major national institution and key provider of health care to children in Afghanistan. The suspension of Ariana Airlines international flights cut the main supply link between the hospital and the outside world for the provision of essential drugs. Sanctions have contributed to a deterioration of the standard of care provided in the hospital. The loss of the airlink seems to have constrained the hospital from restocking with essential drugs from its previous main supplier. Children's families are being asked to purchase medicines themselves at a time of economic crisis, when the majority of the Kabul population barely has the means to obtain food, let alone medicine.

However, any link to sanctions has to be seen in the context of a broader set of problems and obstacles in provision of health care, and the acquisition of resources. Reduced assistance from India to the Indira Gandhi Paediatric Hospital is also a function of deteriorating relations between India and Afghanistan, and Afghanistan's international isolation. If there was a will to fly in medicines from India, an exemption might have been obtainable under the sanctions regime, or an alternative route found.

Sanctions at Indira Gandhi Paediatric Hospital, Kabul

Profile of the hospital

- Built and equipped 32 years ago by the Indian Government
- Includes departments of paediatric internal medicine, surgery, ENT and stomatology
- Acts as the paediatric referral hospital for all Afghanistan
- 300 bed capacity, plus out patient facilities
- Approximately 200 children treated per day
- 400 staff, including 80 doctors

Support to the hospital from India via Ariana

- The Indian Government provided medicines and medical equipment until 1999
- Hospital received 10 MT of drugs and medical supplies from India 1992-95
- Hospital received 10 MT of drugs and medical supplies from India 1996-99
- Supply was sporadic (via charter flights) and stockpiled in the hospital
- The ICRC assessment of Kabul hospitals in October 1999 noted that the donations flown in from India provided medicines for out-patients and in-patients in departments other than those supported by the aid agencies
- The senior surgeon reports that donations from India were an important source of anti-biotics, orthopaedic drugs, anti-acids and pain killers.

Access to other assistance

- ACF supports malnutrition ward
- Hammer Forum supports the orthopaedic department
- Dawat ul Ismia (Kuwait) supports the Ear, Nose and Throat department
- Additional/occasional support from Save the Children (US) and ICRC
- Before sanctions, because of shortage of supply in the hospital, patients had themselves to buy anaesthetic drugs and sutures from the bazaar

Situation after sanctions

- The hospital continues to operate at full capacity, with all beds occupied
- The hospital's stocks of medicines have been exhausted
- Free medicines are only available in wards supported by international NGOs
- Outside the NGO-supported wards, children's families now have to buy all medicines from the bazaar
- The senior surgeon estimates that before sanctions, 10% of medicines used in the hospital were bought by patients from the bazaar. Now 50% of the medicines used in the hospital are bought from the bazaar (and the rest are from the aid agency donations)

Other problems in the hospital

- The senior surgeon reports malfunctions/maintenance problems in key items of equipment, including ultrasound, operating lights, operating tables and the laboratory
- Salaries are low and paid intermittently

3.3 Imports and exports

In 1999, Ariana operated cargo flights, serving Dubai and Amritsar, with a capacity of approximately 400 MT, each way, per month. The Dubai service was suspended due to the sanctions, but the Amritsar service was suspended by India some months before the sanctions were implemented. Also, a Boeing 747 purchased by Ariana would have significantly expanded international passenger and freight capacity, but was re-sold to the supplier following the imposition of sanctions.

This has impacted on Afghanistan's foreign trade, although the scale is relatively small relative to the country's total overseas trade (see tables for export volumes). Surface freight is of course significantly cheaper than the Ariana service and where possible traders have always used this in preference to air. In general, importers and exporters have sought to reroute their trade, using surface routes, but in some cases this is not possible. Specifically, fresh fruit exports to Dubai had commenced in the year before sanctions. Traders reported that they had started exports of fresh apricots and grapes, and that melons and strawberries were planned. The loss of the air route has meant that sales are restricted to the low-price domestic market. This has resulted in a loss of income and employment, in harvesting, packing and distribution and has thus helped to undermine livelihoods for some of the vulnerable in market gardening areas. On the import side, the loss of international air links has been linked to a reduction in imports of medicine, as Ariana was used for medicine and medical supplies and equipment imports. It should be noted, however, that the reduced availability of medical supplies is also a result of the isolation of the Taliban and Afghanistan in general.

Finally, the lack of international air services deprives the country of a reliable and rapid means of communication with the outside world. Considerable income is lost from the loss of international passengers, and the inability to travel easily to Afghanistan reduces investment and business activity. Also, it can be argued that the lack of international links is a contributing factor in reducing confidence in Afghanistan as a place to do business.

3.4 Aid agency logistics

The lack of direct international air links to Afghanistan have reduced the options for aid agencies in supplying their operations in Afghanistan. Most directly affected has been the health sector. International agencies have in the past relied on air freight services to bring in humanitarian supplies, but since the imposition of sanctions, air freight must be contracted independently.

3.5 Postal links

The ban on Ariana has also disrupted the activities of the Afghan Postal Services, which had been gradually restored and extended over the past three years. Mail has now been diverted via Peshawar by road, instead of using Kabul as the node. People have complained at increased delivery times. The disruption of postal services has contributed to the sense of isolation that Afghans feel. There was a panic reaction to the fear that sanctions would more severely disrupt the mail. In the week before the sanctions, postal officials report, they took in 10,000 letters a day from Afghans desperate to send letters to their relatives abroad.

3.6 Impact of the restrictions on the banking sector

The direct humanitarian implications of the freezing of Taliban related bank accounts have been minimal. Confidence in the public sector banks was lost long before the imposition of Security Council sanctions. Both the Afghan private sector and humanitarian agencies were already using informal sector alternatives before the sanctions. Afghan business men complained that the lack of access to letters of credit restricts their ability to conduct foreign trade and the Planning Minister cited the inability of Da Afghanistan Bank to issue an LoC as a factor delaying the import of essential spares for the Maiper Hydro-electric Plant from Germany. However, in reality Afghan banks have been issuing virtually no LoCs over the past ten years anyway. Da Afghanistan Bank had started an innovative remittance delivery scheme in the summer of 1999, to try to capture some of the business of money transfers from abroad to Afghan residents, and this scheme has been suspended. However, the informal money dealers (hawala) and transfers via Pakistan already accounted for the bulk of transfers from abroad. Aid agencies have typically not been using the Afghan banks since before the arrival of the Taliban Movement.

The Afghan authorities have had to resort to unorthodox practices in response to the sanctions measures. For example, one of the largest liabilities to be settled during the sanctions period, was when the Ministry for Communications had to transfer three quarters of a million dollars in part payment of a contract with Chinese companies for installation of digital phone lines. Reportedly the transfer was made in cash, to the hawala dealers of the Kabul money market, who then transferred the funds abroad through private accounts.

The banking system in Afghanistan was only barely functional immediately prior to sanctions and even then it only channelled a fraction of Afghanistan's foreign exchange dealings. **Sanctions cannot reasonably be blamed for the paralysis of the banks. However, the sanctions do represent a significant impediment in the rehabilitation of the banking system. The freezing of their assets and their inability to conduct foreign transactions means that there is no prospect of the public sector banks renewing their services and starting to bring Afghanistan's foreign exchanges into the formal sector.**

This has indirect humanitarian implications. Most directly, it can increase the costs and risks faced by humanitarian agencies working in the country. Although the alternative, informal sector ("hawala" system of money transfer) is highly flexible, it charges a higher commission on transfers than that quoted by the formal sector banks (2% to 10% in the hawala, compared to 1% in Da Afghanistan Bank) . Even a 1% saving on average transfer costs faced by the assistance community bringing money into Afghanistan would be equivalent to a saving of \$900,000 annually, or enough to feed 46,000 people for a year.

3.7 Further impact on the private sector

The Security Council measures have been specifically imposed on the Taliban Movement and any financial transaction benefiting the Taliban or the Islamic Emirate of Afghanistan is now an infringement of sanctions. However, this raises a classic state-party or state-movement dilemma. The "Tehreek e Taliban" is the political

movement. But, since capturing power, in their lexicon, they have renamed the state of Afghanistan the “Islamic Emirate of Afghanistan” (IEA). Sanctions apply to all entities directly or indirectly controlled by the Taliban. This definition applies to the whole of the Afghan public sector. Therefore, the whole Afghan public sector has in effect been sanctioned and **any financial transaction benefiting any of the thirty-four ministries is in effect an infringement. This acts as a deterrent to potential international investment.** Although the Afghan public sector is relatively small in terms of total revenues, it does have a long tradition of controlling direct foreign investment, often through joint ventures. At least some level of interaction with the public sector is likely in virtually all commercial activity in Afghanistan.

There have been some private sector attempts to replace the public sector activities. Initial attempts by a group of Afghan businessmen to establish a private sector air line (Afghan Air) were blocked. However, in October 2000, a private company trading under the name of Dolphin, established a weekly flight between Kandahar and Sharjah, Saudi Arabia. Because the company is formally not owned by the Taliban, it does not come under the purview of the sanctions order. In the banking sector, Mumtaz Bank has been granted legal status and plans to offer basic international services.

4 Indirect effects of sanctions under Security Council Resolution 1267

4.1 Exchange rates and price level

Most Afghans interviewed in the course of the study blamed Security Council sanctions for an increase in food prices and collapse in the value of the Afghani against the US dollar. That they reached this conclusion is hardly surprising, given that the imposition of sanctions was accompanied by a period of extreme economic instability, bordering on panic, (the Kabul wheat price jumped 55% between October and November 1999 and a further 10% in the following month). **A detailed analysis of what happened after sanctions shows that other factors contributed to the increase in food prices and in the deteriorating exchange rates, and that the markets ultimately managed to absorb the shock.**

Price rises and exchange rate depreciation in the post-sanctions period have been higher than in the previous year, but within the range of what has been experienced in Afghanistan in the post 1996 period.

- Depreciation of the Afghani in the first eleven months post sanctions was equivalent to 2.7% per month (compared to only 1.5% per month in the previous 10 months)
- Increases in the price of wheat in the first eleven months post sanctions were equivalent to 3.2% per month (compared to only 1.2% per month in the previous 10 months)

After the sharp wheat price increases in November and December 1999, prices moderated. In local price terms, wheat prices fell for the first three months of 2000. The Afghani continued to depreciate, but initially lagged behind the wheat price i.e.

there was initially a 50% price increase in the dollar wheat price, taking it to levels higher than they had been for two years.

In the medium term, the net result of the wheat price increases ahead of depreciation was that the wheat price in dollar terms increased by some 5% in dollar terms in the first eleven months after sanctions. However, in dollar terms, wheat prices are still lower than prices prevailing in 1997 and 1998.

Whereas food markets have generally worked well in moderating the initial sharp price increases, the labour market has been more sluggish. Local price wage rates were static in the period after sanctions, which implies a decrease in real wages. In Kabul, approaching the end of the first year after sanctions, the daily wage was equivalent to 5.4 k.g. of wheat, lower than the previous two years. (A similar pattern is repeated in all regional centres in Afghanistan, where commodity wage rates have declined over the past three years). Afghans' economic predicaments lie not in price rises and exchange depreciation, which they are used to, but in the lack of purchasing power (static wages).

Neither of the measures included in the Security Council sanctions regime should have directly affected food markets. Public sector food procurement had collapsed before the coming of the Taliban and so the finance of food imports is through the private sector, and not dependent on the Afghan. The only possible direct link between sanctions and the food markets is the possibility of hoarding, if traders misread the sanctions, expected price increases, and held back food stocks from the market. The speculation may even have worked the other way, as there were some claims that some opium farmers increased their cultivation of wheat (sanctions occurred at autumn planting time) in anticipation of food shortages. However, undoubtedly **the principal factor pushing up food prices was the decision of Pakistan to suspend the export of wheat to Afghanistan, and to enforce its existing border controls, after the Pervez Musharraf government came to power, in October 1999. Afghanistan faced a cut off of wheat from its main source of supply. The moderation of prices followed moves by the Taliban to diversify Afghanistan's sources of supply.** (Mullah Omar gave an instruction that dependence on any single supplier for a strategic commodity was bad). The IEA signed a deal for import of wheat from Kazakhstan. Although the initial contract was supposed to be for public sector procurement, in its wake Afghan private importers also started to source their wheat in Central Asia. Torgundi, near Herat, rapidly became the main entry point into Afghanistan for food, from Central Asia, via Turkmenistan. Next, the Taliban and Iran moved to improve commercial relations. The Iranian consulate was reopened in Herat and there was an expansion of import from Iran via Islamqila, also near Herat. Although the move to diversify suppliers and routes was directly a response to the Pakistan border controls, it also encapsulates the IEA's strategy for coping with any trade restrictions – take advantage of the long land border and five immediate neighbours.

4.2 Psychological / Perceived Impact of Sanctions

A significant impact of sanctions is the extent to which they have aggravated ordinary Afghans' sense of being isolated and victimized. From interviews, it was clear that there is a widespread perception that the United Nations has set out to harm rather than help Afghans. There is a strong sense of bitterness and

bewilderment in that Security Council action is perceived as targeting an innocent population and not the authorities with which it has a quarrel. Discussions with Afghans in both IEA and ISA areas indicated a relatively low level of awareness of the nature and scope of the Security Council sanctions. They are known by the Farsi term “Tahreemat” or the Pashto term “Bandeenza” and are commonly thought to be broad economic restrictions, rather than the specific measures that are in place. **Most people take it as self-evident that SC sanctions have disrupted trade, pushed up prices and caused suffering; this is due in part to statements by the authorities blaming sanctions for a wide range of ills including price hikes and the limited availability of social services.** Even if this perception by the population is incorrect, the fact that it is assumed to be true can lead to the feeling of victimisation and isolation.

4.3 Operating environment for humanitarian agencies

The imposition of Security Council sanctions resulted in an immediate, if short-lived, deterioration in the operating environment faced by the aid agencies operating in Taliban controlled areas. Crowds attacked and damaged United Nations offices in several locations of the country, including Kabul, Mazar, Jalalabad, Kandahar and Farah. Movements of staff and agency activities were restricted in the following week, until security reassurances were received from the Taliban authorities. The authorities moved rapidly to control the situation.

But overwhelmingly, agencies working in IEA areas considered up to summer 2000, that operating conditions were relatively good, particularly with regard to security and relief logistics and specifically that there had been no deterioration of these relations in the wake of sanctions. In reality the operating environment is turbulent, with the women’s edict (Mullah Omar’s presidential decree number eight, announced in July, that bans aid agencies employing Afghan women outside the health sector), being a prime example of how executive decisions, with no consultation, can create obstacles to the work of humanitarian agencies.

The issue of safe humanitarian access is important for the effectiveness of the assistance operation and specifically for the ability of assistance agencies to work with vulnerable communities. Any security threat to humanitarian staff, no matter how unjustified, has immediate consequences for humanitarian programming.

4.4 Civil society and its reaction to sanctions.

The nature of the regime and the lack of civil and political rights, as documented in the vulnerability baseline, suggest that the population cannot bring significant pressure to bear on the authorities. Interviewees argued that the Taliban had not changed any aspect of their behaviour or policy in response to sanctions. Many of the respondents argued that support from a neighbouring country meant that the Taliban were effectively insulated from any domestic pressure to accede to demands. **The weakness of civil society, the lack of freedom of expression and minimal respect for political rights mean that there is no channel whereby popular dissatisfaction over sanctions could be directed into pressure on the regime to change its policies.**

5 Conclusion

This study shows that the direct impact of sanctions on the humanitarian situation are limited, but the indirect impacts are potentially more serious. The highly vulnerable nature of Afghan society, combined with the unique nature of Taliban rule, suggest that the loss of confidence and the sense of isolation resulting from the sanctions are contributing factors (out of many) to worsening poverty and vulnerability amongst the general population. Additionally, while the direct impacts are limited in their scope, even a small scale loss of jobs and income opportunities in a poor country like Afghanistan are very serious, given that ten or fifteen people are sometimes supported by one salary.

5.1 *Assessment of vulnerability*

- The population of Afghanistan is already highly vulnerable. It has a limited ability to continue to withstand the accumulated and current pressure of warfare, the drought, and a political and economic system that disallows the right of a significant proportion of the population to make a living, become literate, or be treated for disease. Afghans have little capacity to cope with further economic shocks. Any increase in prices of basic staples and medicine or any reduction in income and employment possibilities will have a significant impact on a population that is already operating on the margins of survival.
- The indicators of governance and civil society show a high level of repression, lack of representative institutions and paralysis of civil society. There are no mechanisms through which international coercion might be translated into public debate and domestic pressure for policy change. The Emirate authorities tend to be hardened to conventional political pressure and are unlikely to change course in the event of increased suffering and deprivation.

5.2 *Direct and indirect effects of sanctions so far*

- Humanitarian agencies operating in Afghanistan have so far been largely insulated from the authorities or people's frustration at sanctions. However, humanitarian agencies would most probably face more serious fallout, amounting to security threats, in the case of further economic measures or measures which the authorities could portray as contributing to the war. The negative reaction to further measures would inhibit humanitarian agencies' ability to operate in Taliban held parts of the country.
- The current UN sanctions have had a limited but tangible negative effect on the Afghan economy (employment and incomes effects related to the air blockade). The economic impact of this has been focused on the interruption of imports and exports that previously went by air freight, although these were relatively small-scale. However, a national airline is an important requirement of a functioning country. Interruption of this service has limited cargo, but also the inability to travel restricts business. The loss of the Ariana services has also slightly constrained the ability of aid agencies to import necessary supplies, although other (less ideal) mechanisms have been developed. The restrictions on the financial sector forces humanitarian agencies and individuals to use the informal financial sector. The restrictions also prevent the rehabilitation of the banking sector, which is a necessary precursor to reconstruction and development.
- The indirect impact of the sanctions focus on the increased sense of isolation and loss of confidence linked to the sanctions. While this can be difficult to measure,

the best example of this was the short term depreciation of the Afghani following the introduction of sanctions. But in more intangible terms, a lack of confidence and a sense of isolation can limit future development, prevent normalisation of everyday life, and further limit economic activity and investment.

- However, the scale of the effects from the current measures is less significant than the other shocks which have been imposed on the Afghan economy or the kind of hindrances which assistance agencies have to face within the current turbulent Afghan context.

6 Appendices

6.1 *Text of the Security Council sanctions resolution*

Resolution 1267 (1999)

Adopted by the Security Council at its 4051st meeting on 15 October 1999

The Security Council

Reaffirming its previous resolutions, in particular resolutions 1189 (1998) of 13 August 1998, 1193 (1998) of 28 August 1998 and 1214 (1998) of 8 December 1998, and the statements of its President on the situation in Afghanistan,

Reaffirming its strong commitment to the sovereignty, independence, territorial integrity and national unity of Afghanistan, and its respect for Afghanistan's cultural and historical heritage,

Reiterating its deep concern over continuing violations of international humanitarian law and of human rights, particularly discrimination against women and girls, and over the significant rise in the illicit production of opium, and stressing that the capture by the Taliban of the Consulate-general of the Islamic republic of Iran and the murder of Iranian diplomats and a journalist in Mazar e Sherif constituted flagrant violations of established international law,

Recalling the relevant international counter-terrorism conventions and in particular the obligation of parties to these conventions to extradite or prosecute terrorists,

Strongly condemning the continuing use of Afghan territory, especially areas controlled by the Taliban, for the sheltering and training of terrorists and planning of terrorist acts, and reaffirming its conviction that the suppression of international terrorism is essential for the maintenance of international peace and security,

Deploring the fact that the Taliban continues to provide safe haven to Usama bin Laden and to allow him and others associated with him to operate a network of terrorist training camps from Taliban-controlled territory and to use Afghanistan as a base from which to sponsor international terrorist operations,

Noting the indictment of Usama bin Laden and his associates by the United States of America for, inter alia, the 7 August 1998 bombings of the United States embassies in Nairobi, Kenya and Dar es Salaam, Tanzania and for conspiring to kill American national outside the United States, and noting also the request of the United States of America to the Taliban to surrender them for trial (S/1999/1021),

Determining that the failure of the Taliban authorities to respond to the demands in paragraph 13 of resolution 1214 (1998) constitutes a threat to international peace and security,

Stressing its determination to ensure respect for its resolutions,

Acting under Chapter VII of the Charter of the United Nations,

1. Insists that the Afghan faction known as the Taliban, which also calls itself the Islamic Emirate of Afghanistan, comply promptly with its previous resolutions and in particular cease the provision of sanctuary and training for international terrorists and their organizations, take appropriate effective measures to ensure that the territory under its control is not used for terrorist installations and camps, or for the preparation or organization of terrorist acts against other states or their citizens, and cooperate with efforts to bring indicted terrorists to justice;
2. demands that the Taliban turn over Usama bin Laden without further delay to appropriate authorities in a country where he has been indicted, or to appropriate authorities in a country where he will be arrested and effectively brought to justice;
3. decides that on 14 November 1999 all states shall impose the measures set out in paragraph 4 below, unless the Council has previously decided on the basis of a report of the Secretary-General, that the Taliban has fully complied with the obligation set out in paragraph 2 above;
4. Decides further that in order to enforce paragraph 2 above, all states shall :
 - (a) deny permission for any aircraft to take off from or land in their territory if it is owned, leased or operated by or on behalf of the Taliban as designated by the Committee established by paragraph 6 below, unless the particular flight has been approved in advance by the committee on the grounds of humanitarian need, including religious obligation such as the performance of the Haj;
 - (b) Freeze funds and other financial resources, including funds derived or generated from property owned or controlled directly or indirectly by the Taliban, or by any undertaking owned or controlled by the Taliban, as designated by the committee established by paragraph 6 below, and ensure that neither they nor any other funds or financial resources so designated , are made available by their nationals or by any persons within their territory, to or for the benefit of the Taliban or any undertaking owned or controlled, directly or indirectly by the Taliban, except as may be authorized by the committee on a case-by-case basis on the grounds of humanitarian need;
5. Urges all States to cooperate with efforts to fulfil the demand in paragraph 2 above, and to consider further measures against Usama bin Laden and his associates;
6. Decides to establish, in accordance with rule 28 of its provisional rules of procedure, a Committee of the Security Council consisting of all the members of the Council to undertake the following tasks and to report on its work to the Council with its observations and recommendations :

- (a) To seek from all states further information regarding the action taken by them with a view to effectively implementing the measures imposed by paragraph 4 above;
 - (b) To consider information brought to its attention by states concerning violations of the measures imposed by paragraph 4 above and to recommend appropriate measures in response thereto;
 - (c) To make periodic reports to the Council on the impact, including the humanitarian implications, of the measures imposed by paragraph 4 above;
 - (d) To make periodic reports to the Council on information submitted to it regarding alleged violations of the measures imposed by paragraph 4 above, identifying where possible persons or entities reported to be engaged in such violations;
 - (e) To designate the aircraft and funds or other financial resources referred to in paragraph 4 above in order to facilitate the implementation of the measures imposed by that paragraph;
 - (f) To consider requests for exemptions from the measures imposed by paragraph 4 above as provided in that paragraph, and to decide on the granting of an exemption to these measures in respect of the payment by the International Air Transport Association (IATA) to the aeronautical authority of Afghanistan on behalf of international airlines for air traffic control services;
 - (g) To examine the reports submitted pursuant to paragraph 9 below;
7. Calls upon all states to act strictly in accordance with the provisions of this resolution notwithstanding the existence of any rights or obligations conferred or imposed by any international agreement or any contract entered into or any licence or permit granted prior to the date of coming into force of the measures imposed by paragraph 4 above;
 8. Calls upon states to bring proceedings against persons and entities within their jurisdiction that violate the measures imposed by paragraph 4 above and to impose appropriate penalties;
 9. Calls upon all states to cooperate fully with the Committee established by paragraph 6 above in the fulfillment of its task, including supplying such information as may be required by the Committee in pursuance of this resolution;
 10. Requests all States to report to the Committee established by paragraph 6 above within 30 days of the coming into force of the measures imposed by paragraph 4 above on the steps they have taken with a view to effectively implementing paragraph 4 above;
 11. Requests the Secretary-General to provide all necessary assistance to the Committee established by paragraph 6 above and to make the necessary arrangements in the Secretariat for this purpose;
 12. Requests the Committee established by paragraph 6 above to determine the appropriate arrangements, on the basis of recommendations by the Secretariat, with competent international organizations, neighbouring and other states, and parties concerned with a view to improving the monitoring of the implementation of the measures imposed by paragraph 4 above;

13. Requests the Secretariat to submit for consideration by the Committee established by paragraph 6 above information received from governments and public sources on possible violations of the measures imposed by paragraph 4 above;
14. Decides to terminate the measures imposed by paragraph 4 above once the Secretary-General reports to the Security Council that the Taliban has fulfilled the obligation set out in paragraph 2 above;
15. Expresses its readiness to consider the imposition of further measures, in accordance with its responsibility under the charter of the United Nations, with the aim of achieving the full implementation of the resolution;
16. Decides to remain actively seized of the matter.

6.2 Ariana Afghan Airlines – a case study of sanctions implications

Status of the organisation

- State-owned company (shirkat)
- Director and senior managers are political appointees (Taliban). All other staff are technical and long term company employees
- Policy and supervision is by the Board of Directors (Ministers of Finance, Commerce, Planning and Civil Aviation).
- Direct management is by the Executive Board (Director Ariana, plus three deputies)
- Board of Directors approves commercial plan and allocates operating surplus to aircraft purchase, other investment and employee bonuses
- Surplus and assets cannot legally be transferred out of the company i.e. to I.E.A.

Fleet 1996-2000

Boeing airliners (4 aircraft)

- 1 Boeing 747 sold 1999 (resold to supplier, before delivery)
- CURRENTLY 2 Boeing 727-100's and 1 Boeing 727-200 in working order
- Previously Boeing fleet was insured and used for international flights

Antonov 32 airliners (6 aircraft)

- 1 aircraft crashed between Kandahar and Quetta in 1998, due to gross negligence of Kandahar airport staff/air traffic control
- CURRENTLY 5 Antonovs operational
- Antonovs are uninsured and are used domestically only

Tupolev 154 airliners (3 aircraft)

- 1 hit by rocket while flying Pres. Mujadedi from Pakistan. Written off and collected \$4 million insurance
- 1 captured by Taliban, when they were in opposition. Written off and collected \$4 million insurance
- 1 "disappeared" in Uzbekistan, was kept there for VIP use. Unaccounted for in the Taliban period.
- CURRENTLY 0 Tupolev's operational

Assets

- Aeroplanes, plus :
- City Bank, New York : estimated \$3 - \$4 million. Frozen under sanctions regime
- National Westminster Bank, London : up to 1998 there was estimated \$23 million, currently \$5 million, after abortive Boeing 747 purchase deal
- Foreign assets are operated/accessed by the Ariana Airlines Executive Board

Routes

- Kabul – Tashkent and Kabul – Prague : suspended in 1992
- Kabul – Delhi : suspended in 1998
- Kabul – Amritsar : suspended in August 1999

- Kandahar – Dubai/Sharjah : suspended in November 1999
- Kabul – Frankfurt and London : under discussion since 1990, never started
- Kabul – Kandahar – Herat – Mazar – Kunduz – Jalalabad : domestic sectors all operational

Haj flights

- In 1999, before sanctions, Ariana carried 6,500 pilgrims on Haj flights
- In 2000, under sanctions regime, Ariana carried 8,000 pilgrims on Haj flights
- Estimated revenues from Haj flights 1999 = \$6,400,000. Direct costs = approx \$4,000,000
- Haj was single largest source of revenue and surplus for Ariana under sanctions

Employment

- 1300 staff employed, up to September 2000
- 300 technical staff, including 200 who are involved in Boeing operation
- 260 staff made redundant in September 2000

Pilots

- 12 licenced Boeing pilots at the time of sanctions
- Boeing pilots receive retainer of \$300 per month as incentive to stay
- 2 pilots have left/emigrated in 2000
- Licences are kept valid (6 monthly renewal) by basic minimum flight hours on domestic routes

Upgrading of fleet

- Major fleet upgrade planned in 1998/99, with induction of a Boeing 747
- Bulk of Ariana reserves (circa \$16 million) were allocated to the Jumbo purchase
- 83 personnel were sent to Jordan in 1999 for technical training, as part of the Jumbo purchase deal.
- Purchase was cancelled in 1999, after sanctions imposed
- Seller imposed fine of \$3.2 million for cancellation of order
- Money returned by aircraft supplier has not re-entered Ariana reserves

Maintenance arrangements

- Boeing fleet previously maintained in Holland and France, under contract
- Boeing maintenance contract signed with Jordan in 1998
- All checks and basic maintenance are now carried out in Kabul. Overhaul due after 1,200 flying hours.
- Clearance requested from Sanctions Committee for first Boeing overhaul in Jordan, autumn 2000
- The Antonovs are scheduled to be overhauled after 1,800 flying hours
- Pre-1992, AN32s were maintained in USSR/Uzbekistan
- None of them has been overhauled in the mujahideen/Taliban period
- The Antonovs are kept flying by improvisation, cannibalising and purchase of parts in Dubai, via Pakistan

Summary of effects of sanctions on performance of Ariana

DIRECT EFFECTS

- ⇒ International flights No more scheduled international flights since November 1999

- ⇒ Domestic flights Ariana has continued with domestic flights to all regional airports in Afghanistan
- ⇒ Revenue and profitability Ariana has lost main source of revenue and surplus (international flights)

IMMEDIATE IMPLICATIONS

- ⇒ Service – suspension of international service to passengers and cargo. For most people there is no equivalent alternative
- ⇒ Fleet – modernisation plans reversed. Forced to rely on aging 727 and Antonov fleet
- ⇒ Maintenance and safety standards – reduced revenue and cut in international links have prompted improvisation and “coping” in maintenance, and further delay of over-haul of Antonov fleet
- ⇒ Transfers to Taliban – has not prevented cash transfers to Taliban; these are anyway not legally permissible; the single largest asset transfer to the Taliban occurred after sanctions imposed
- ⇒ Employment and earnings 1,300 employees have been affected by loss of bonuses and reduced overtime

LONG TERM CONSEQUENCES

- ⇒ Increased risk of crashes - there are serious worries that poorly maintained Antonovs on domestic routes will eventually crash
- ⇒ Brain drain – highly qualified and experienced, but now under-utilised and under-paid personnel are being lost
- ⇒ Skill development – lack of revenue and international links mean no opportunities for sending staff abroad for training. Continued under-funding, demoralisation and decline in standards at aviation school and technical college
- ⇒ Assets – loss of key financial asset will make future re-equipment of the company difficult
- ⇒ Institution – decline in technical standards, loss of physical and financial assets, arrested process of skill development and reduced competence and morale of the workforce, have accelerated the long term decay of a national institution

6.3 Study terms of reference

Background:

In 1996, the ruling government of Afghanistan was displaced from Kabul by the Taliban movement, an Islamic group, which controls some 90 percent of the country. Only 3 countries recognize the Taliban; the Islamic State of Afghanistan (Northern Alliance) is the recognized government of Afghanistan at the United Nations.

The United Nations Security Council is demanding that Osama bin Laden, who is in Afghanistan, be handed over to the United States, or a third country, to stand trial on charges that he masterminded double bombings of U.S. embassies in East Africa in 1998. The Taliban says that it has no extradition treaty with the United States and that Islamic tradition forbids it from handing over bin Laden. The UN Security Council adopted a resolution in Oct 99 with a 30-day deadline for compliance on the bin Laden issue. In Nov 99, sanctions came into effect as the Taliban refused to hand over bin Laden.

The UN sanctions require all Member States to freeze the Taliban's overseas assets and ban planes owned, leased or operated by the Taliban from taking off or landing outside Afghanistan.

Rationale and Scope of the Study:

It is widely understood that the present sanctions regime has had little impact on the Taliban's policies and activities. For the most part, the Taliban appear to be able to live with the sanctions. Indeed, there is mounting evidence from different sanction experiences around the world that sanctions of an economic nature tend to have minimal effectiveness in terms of meeting their stated objectives. However, the imposition of such sanctions are known to result in significant harm to civilians in the sanctions-affected country.

The situation in Afghanistan is such that it does not allow for easy comparison with other sanctions-affected countries. Afghanistan is extremely poor, is land-locked, and is suffering from the on-going and accumulated effects of two decades of warfare and missed development opportunities. Basic indicators for health, nutrition, education and life expectancy are among the most alarming in the world. A number of aid agencies, international and local, are involved in a wide range of assistance activities including the alleviation of human suffering, the repatriation and reintegration of refugees, the provision of basic social services, the development of sustainable livelihoods, as well as activities geared to addressing human rights and gender concerns. It is feared that any additional sanctions of an economic nature will exacerbate an already difficult situation and impact negatively on UN and other activities in the country.

The rationale for conducting an assessment of the current situation is to generate a baseline or overview of the existing state of vulnerability and factors which affect this so that the humanitarian community is in a position to address these and plan for the future as appropriate.

Study Objectives:

- (1) to develop an overall analysis of the present situation with emphasis on the nature and scope of vulnerability and factors which affect it; this will include an assessment of the direct and indirect implications of economic sanctions including for example on food security, health/nutritional status, displacement/migration repatriation, social cohesion and coping mechanisms, poverty and employment opportunities, crime and the criminalized economy, psychological effects and its implications for peace, and the role and work of assistance actors; and
- (2) to determine whether there are any discernible direct or indirect effects which can be attributed to the existing sanctions regime particularly in relation to vulnerable groups such as children, single-parent households, women, youths and the elderly.

Methodology:

The analytical framework used to assess the humanitarian impact of sanctions follows that adopted by L. Minear et al' in their report to DHA, reviewing sanctions regimes. This report has proposed a broad standard methodology for pre-assessment of sanctions regimes.

Five broad sets of indicators are used to assess sanctions impact:

1. Public health indicators
2. Economic indicators
3. Population indicators
4. Governance and civil society indicators
5. Indicators of coverage and dependence on humanitarian activities

(Minear et al propose standard indicators under each of these headings, but actual indicators used should be context specific, depending on data availability and the nature of the problem).

In terms of the dynamic framework of assessment and monitoring, Minear proposes the following framework:

T 1: preassessment of the socio-economic context of the country to be sanctioned firstly establishes baseline levels for key indicators, against which subsequent performance or deterioration may be measured. Secondly it notes specific vulnerabilities i.e. sections of the population and life-sustaining activities most likely to be hit by unintended effects of future sanctions, so that the sanctions regime may be designed to mitigate adverse impact. T: sanctions are imposed

T. + 1: the socio-economic situation and position of the most vulnerable is assessed after imposition of sanctions and with reference to any baseline indicators. This may identify need for further mitigation measures to protect the vulnerable

T + n: the situation is periodically reviewed, in particular to check the effectiveness of mitigation methods

The current study takes the form of a T+1 analysis for the current limited sanctions. It seeks to trace the range of specific impacts of sanctions so far. These impacts will be described (narrative) and where possible related to the standard indicators.

The study also takes the form of a T-1 analysis for the possible broader sanctions regime. In keeping with the DHA methodology, it will establish the baseline indicators against which any future increase in deprivation may be checked. It will also identify significant data gaps, where strategically important indicators cannot be used because the information is not yet available. And it will identify specific vulnerabilities; categories of vulnerable people and life sustaining activities that may

need to be protected by mitigation measures within any sanctions regime.

The analysis draws on existing data, information, literature and consultation with aid workers, government officials and private sector figures and others in Afghanistan.

Key Issues/Sectors to be assessed:

- Food security including factors (including the drought) which impact on agricultural production, trade and purchasing power - Health and nutritional status - Education - Population movements including repatriation and loss of skilled Afghans/brain drain - Coping mechanisms and social cohesion - Poverty including availability of income possibilities - Nature and scope of vulnerability - Crime and the criminalized economy including poppy production/opium trade, and smuggling - Transfer of remittances from abroad Transport and telecommunications means including with expatriate Afghans Impact on Ariana and its role in internal trade/transportation/communication Implications for humanitarian activities.

i L Minear et al Toward more humane and effective sanctions management: enhancing the capacity of the United Nations System, 1998.

6.4 *Additional details on methodology*

Drawing on Minear, five broad sets of indicators are used to establish the baseline, against which vulnerability in Afghanistan and the dynamic impact of sanctions may be assessed :

1. Public health indicators
2. Economic indicators
3. Population and displacement indicators
4. Governance and civil society indicators
5. Indicators of coverage and dependence on humanitarian activities.

Minear provides example indicators under each of these headings, on the understanding that they will be specified according to the context. For the Afghanistan study, expanding on Minear, five main factors have been considered in specifying indicators :

- Data availability i.e. reliable data should be available from existing sources, with a minimum of primary data collection
- Replicability i.e. there should be a good chance of obtaining updated data in future, for dynamic review of the sanctions context, and comparison with the baseline
- Clear relevance to vulnerability i.e. indicators should illuminate the vulnerability of the population in Afghanistan
- Effects of sanctions i.e. indicators should as far as possible cover the range of socio-economic variables that may be affected by sanctions, and that determine how the burden of sanctions will be shared.
- Quantifiability i.e. as far as possible, quantitative variables are used, to facilitate comparison across countries and over time. Qualitative variables are also used, to capture those factors which cannot reliably be quantified.
- Cross-country comparability i.e. as far as possible indicators are used which facilitate a comparison of levels of vulnerability in Afghanistan with other countries.

The following data sources were drawn on to construct the indicators and establish the effects of the 1999 measures :

- Semi-structured interviews and focus group discussions, conducted in IEA and ISA controlled parts of Afghanistan with humanitarian workers, political figures, business men and ordinary people;
- Literature review
- Humanitarian agency publications and statistics;
- Official reports and statistics in Afghanistan.

Cross-country comparisons were undertaken using data (and indicator definitions) from the Human Development Report 2000 (HDR). The war has affected the reliability and coverage of national statistics in Afghanistan and so such comparisons are approximate and illustrative, based on the indicator which comes closest in definition and data coverage to the internationally used one. Depending on data availability in the HDR, the comparison is made with the averages for the group of countries with lowest human development attainment (labelled in the tables LDC's) and with South Asia. Afghanistan is thus compared with the other poorest countries, to illustrate the extent to which it has lagged behind even them.

In addition to the field based consultations, an Internet web-site was used as an integral part of the study. Study terms of reference, preliminary findings, links to other sanctions sites and reference materials were all displayed on the site and made available to anyone interested. The summary report was circulated to all recipients of the main Afghanistan internet mailing list. Through this sharing of information and ideas, the study team tried to ensure transparency and invite comment from all those interested in the issue of sanctions in Afghanistan.

i L Minear et al Toward more humane and effective sanctions management: enhancing the capacity of the United Nations System, 1998

6.5 Summary of field consultations undertaken

Locations visited for field consultation :

Kabul, Kandahar, Takhar, Badakhshan, Bamyan (plus Islamabad and Peshawar)

Semi-structured interviews and focus group discussions undertaken :

- Officials and representatives of the Islamic Emirate of Afghanistan (Taliban), in Kabul and Kandahar
- Officials and representatives of the Islamic State of Afghanistan (Northern Alliance), in Takhar and Badakhshan
- Aid agency officials in all locations visited
- Traders, intellectuals, ordinary people, in all locations visited

6.6 Key documents consulted

Delegation in Afghanistan of the International Committee of the Red Cross, Kabul Public Health Survey, Kabul, 1999

L. Minear, D. Cortright, J Wagler, G Lopez and T Weiss, Toward more humane and effective sanctions management : enhancing the capacity of the United Nations System, T Watson Institute for International studies, Occasional Paper 31, Providence, 1998

CIET International, UNICEF 1997 Multiple indicator baseline, Islamabad, 1999

K Ostrom, Understanding the economy of Afghanistan, Asia Department, 1997

FAO and WFP, Crop and food supply assessment mission to Afghanistan, Islamabad, June 2000

Office of the UN Coordinator for Afghanistan, Strategy of the Assistance Community in response to the drought in Afghanistan, Islamabad, 2000

Office of the UN Coordinator for Afghanistan, Consolidated appeal for Afghanistan 2000, Islamabad, 1999

UNHCR, Monitoring of the situation of returnees in Afghanistan summary of findings Jan-Jul 2000, Islamabad, 2000

UNCHS, Evaluation of the Kabul vulnerables programme, Islamabad, 2000

UNDCP, Socio-economic baseline survey of Helmand province, Islamabad 2000

Afghan Development Association (ADA), Baseline survey of four Afghan provinces, Peshawar, 2000

6.7 Questionnaires

Interviews were held in a semi-structured format, with a questionnaire used to guide discussions and supplementary and additional questions asked according to initial responses and context. Two main versions of the questionnaire were used, one adapted for representatives of Afghan authorities and the private sector and another adapted for assistance agencies. Additional discussion questions were identified for members of the public.

Questionnaire one - Sanctions issues for discussion with the Afghan Authorities and private sector figures

Impact to date of United Nations sanctions

Have the current U.N. sanctions had any adverse impact on the civilian population?

Specifically, what effect has the ban on international flights had on the civilian population

- In terms of availability of important commodities
- In terms of difficulty in foreign travel
- In terms of ability of aid agencies to operate
- In terms of employment and investment

Specifically, what effect has the ban on IEA bank accounts and foreign transactions had on the civilian population

- In terms of receipt of remittances
- In terms of ability of government departments to render services to the population
- In terms of ability to finance foreign trade

Have there been any other indirect effects of sanctions e.g. on investor confidence and the economic situation?

Humanitarian space

Has the imposition of UN sanctions affected the ability of humanitarian agencies to operate in Afghanistan and render assistance?

Has the imposition of UN sanctions created any hostility towards the UN or other international humanitarian agencies that might make it more difficult for them to work effectively?

Vulnerability of the civilian population

Any surveys or information that might be useful to the humanitarian side of the UN in assessing the vulnerability of the civilian population to direct or indirect effects of possible future sanctions

(Specific questions related to the competence of the respondent).

Sanctions responses

What measures have been taken by the public or private sector to mitigate the effects of current sanctions, or to shift the burden elsewhere?

What measures can we anticipate will be taken by the public or private sector to mitigate the effects of possible future sanctions, or to shift the burden elsewhere?

Other

Any other comments with regard to the humanitarian implications of sanctions

Questionnaire two - sanctions issues for discussion with aid agency representatives

Impact to date of United Nations sanctions

Have the current U.N. sanctions had any adverse impact on the civilian population?

Specifically, what effect has the ban on international flights had on the civilian population

- In terms of availability of important commodities relative to the sector in which you work
- In terms of difficulty in foreign travel
- In terms of the ability of your aid agency or counterpart agencies to transport important goods
- In terms of the ability of staff of your agency or counterpart agencies to travel

With reference to sectors and ministries that your agency deals with, what effect has the ban on IEA bank accounts and foreign transactions had on the civilian population

- In terms of receipt of remittances
- In terms of ability of government departments to render services to the population
- In terms of ability to finance foreign trade

Have there been any other indirect effects of sanctions e.g. on investor confidence and the economic situation?

Humanitarian space

Has the imposition of UN sanctions affected the ability of humanitarian agencies to operate in Afghanistan and render assistance?

Has the imposition of UN sanctions created any hostility towards the UN or other international humanitarian agencies that might make it more difficult for them to work effectively?

How do you rate the current operating environment in Afghanistan, as it affects your agency :

1. Security for staff, premises and assets
2. Travel authorisations and ability to travel freely
3. Ability to obtain staff visas
4. Logistics : ability to procure and deliver aid materials
5. Ability to hire and retain good national personnel

Vulnerability of the civilian population

Any surveys or information that might be useful to the humanitarian side of the UN in assessing the vulnerability of the civilian population to direct or indirect effects of possible future sanctions

(Specific questions related to the competence of the respondent).

Sanctions responses

What measures have been taken by the public or private sector to mitigate the effects of current sanctions, or to shift the burden elsewhere?

What measures can we anticipate will be taken by the public or private sector to mitigate the effects of possible future sanctions, or to shift the burden elsewhere?

Other

Any other comments with regard to the humanitarian implications of sanctions

Questionnaire three : Ordinary people, private sector, other key informants

Questions based on the authorities questionnaire, plus :

Additional questions :

- knowledge of sanctions
- indicators of the current economic situation and any deterioration
- ideas on effectiveness of current safety nets and how we might measure destitution
- opinions on what UN should do
- focus on how sanctions have been circumvented, or mitigated so far
- ideas on how future tougher sanctions will be responded to
- practical example of any spread of hatred against UN and NGOs